Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu

The Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee

14/12/2016

Agenda'r Cyfarfod
Meeting Agenda

Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor
Committee Transcripts

Cynnwys
Contents

4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

5 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 6 Inquiry into the Welsh Government’s Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 6

45 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 7 Inquiry into the Welsh Government’s Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 7

62 Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod Adroddiad Blynyddol 2014-15 a’r Adroddiad Pum Mlynedd Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report 2014-15 and Five-year Report

79 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 8 Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 8

100 Papurau i’w Nodi
Papers to Note

101 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o’r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o’r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i’w tystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn	Llafur
Bywgraffiad|Biography	Labour
Dawn Bowden	Llafur
Bywgraffiad|Biography	Labour
Neil Hamilton	UKIP Cymru
Bywgraffiad|Biography	UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor)
Bywgraffiad|Biography	The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd	Plaid Cymru
Bywgraffiad|Biography	The Party of Wales
Jeremy Miles	Llafur
Bywgraffiad|Biography	Labour
Lee Waters	Llafur
Bywgraffiad|Biography	Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Huw Gapper	Uwch Swyddog Polisi ac Ymchwil Senior Officer, Policy and Research
Emyr George	Cyfarwyddwr Cyswllt, Cymwysterau Cymru Associate Director, Qualifications Wales
Gemma Halliday	Rheolwr Datblygu'r Gweithlu, Cyngor Gofal Cymru Workforce Development Manager, Care Council for Wales
Meri Huws	Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Welsh Language Commissioner
Sarah McCarty	Cyfarwyddwr Dysgu a Datblygu'r Gweithlu, Cyngor Gofal Cymru Director of Workforce Learning and Development, Care Council for Wales
Gareth Pierce	Prif Weithredwr, CBAC Chief Executive, WJEC
Meilyr Rowlands	Prif Arolygydd, Estyn Chief Inspector, Estyn
Dyfan Sion	Cyfarwyddwr Polisi ac Ymchwil Director of Policy and Research

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Glerg Deputy Clerk
Osian Bowyer	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:02.
The meeting began at 09:02.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn. Croeso i aelodau'r pwyllgor a hefyd i'r tystion yma heddiw. Os bydd larwm tân, dylai pawb adael yr ystafell drwy'r allanfeydd tân penodol a dilyn cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r staff. Ni ddisgwylir prawf heddiw. Dylai pawb droi eu ffonau symudol i fod yn dawel.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We'd like to welcome Assembly Members and our witnesses this morning. If you do hear a fire alarm, then please leave the room via the designated fire exits and follow instructions from the ushers and staff. We're not expecting a fire drill today. Everyone should switch off their mobile phones or turn them to 'silent'.

[2] Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog ac mae clustffonau ar gael i glywed y cyfieithiad ar y pryd ac i addasu'r sain ar gyfer pobl sy'n drwm eu clyw. Mae'r cyfieithu ar y pryd ar gael ar sianel 1 a gellir chwyddo'r sain ar sianel 0. Peidiwch â chyffwrdd y botymau ar y meicroffonau, gan y gall hynny amharu ar y system. Gofalwch fod y golau coch ymlaen

The National Assembly operates bilingually and headsets are available for interpretation or for amplification. The interpretation is available on channel 1 and you can amplify proceedings on channel 0. Please don't touch any of the buttons on the microphones, as this can interrupt the system. Please ensure that the red light is on before you speak. Does anyone have any declarations of

cyn dechrau siarad. A oes angen datgan buddiannau gan unrhyw Aelod? Na. Grêt, diolch yn fawr iawn.

interest? No. Excellent, thank you very much.

[3] Mae ymddiheuriadau gan Suzy Davies sydd ddim yn gallu bod gyda ni yma heddiw.

We've received apologies from Suzy Davies, who's not able to be with us this morning.

Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 6
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 6

[4] **Bethan Jenkins**: Eitem 2 yw ein hymchwiliad i strategaeth Gymraeg ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru a'r tystion yma heddiw yw Meilyr Rowlands, prif arolygydd Estyn, Emyr George, cyfarwyddwr cyswllt Cymwysterau Cymru, a Gareth Pierce, prif weithredwr CBAC. Diolch i chi am ddod yma heddiw. Rydym am fynd yn syth i gwestiynau—rwy'n siŵr eich bod chi wedi hen arfer â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yma nawr.

Bethan Jenkins: Item 2 is our inquiry into the Welsh Government's draft Welsh language strategy. Our witnesses this morning are Meilyr Rowlands, the chief inspector of Estyn, Emyr George, associate director of Qualifications Wales, and Gareth Pierce, chief executive of the WJEC. Thank you very much for joining us this morning. We're going to move immediately to questions—I'm sure you are well used to our proceedings here by now.

[5] Os medrwch chi ymateb yn fras i'r cwestiwn hwn: a ydych yn credu bod amcan y Llywodraeth o greu 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050 yn un realistig a pha fath o newidiadau ymarferol, felly, sydd eu hangen yn y system yma yng Nghymru er mwyn ceisio cyflawni'r nod hynny?

If you could respond briefly to the question as to whether you believe the Government's objectives of creating 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 is realistic and what kind of practical changes, therefore, are required within the system here in Wales in order to achieve that objective?

[6] **Mr Rowlands**: Rwy'n siŵr ei fod yn bosib, ond byddwn i'n dweud bod angen cynllun manwl. Dyna beth

Mr Rowlands: I'm sure that it is possible, but I would say that there is a need for a detailed plan. That's

sydd ddim ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Ar lefel genedlaethol, byddai eisiau targedau clir o'r hyn a fwriedir ei gyflawni rhwng nawr a 2050.

what's not available at the moment. On a national level, there would need to be clear targets on what's intended to be achieved between now and 2050.

[7] Rwy'n credu mai un o'r pethau a ddaeth mas o'n hadroddiad diweddar ni ar gynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg awdurdodau lleol oedd bod y cynlluniau lleol ddim wedi 'align-io' gyda'r un cenedlaethol. Felly, yn sicr, mae eisiau gwell cyfateb rhwng beth sy'n digwydd o ran y cynllun—beth bynnag fydd e—yn genedlaethol a beth sy'n digwydd yn lleol, achos ar hyn o bryd, yn y cynllun presennol cenedlaethol, nid yw'r targedau yn cael eu cyrraedd, oherwydd, yn bennaf, nad yw'r cynlluniau lleol yma yn ddigon manwl nac yn ddigon uchelgeisiol ac yn y blaen. Felly, rwy'n credu bod hynny yn bwynt strategol pwysig iawn.

I think that one of the things that came out of our latest report on Welsh in education strategic plans for local authorities was that the local schemes hadn't been aligned with the national ones. So, certainly, there is a need for an improved alignment between what is happening in terms of the scheme—whatever it will be—on a national level and what's happening on a local level, because, at the moment, the targets in the current national plan aren't being reached, mainly because these local plans aren't detailed enough or ambitious enough and so forth. So, I think that that is a very important strategic point.

[8] **Bethan Jenkins**: A ydych chi wedi codi hyn gyda'r Llywodraeth yn flaenorol, am y ffaith nad yw'r cynlluniau yma yn ddigon manwl?

Bethan Jenkins: Did you raise this previously with the Government, in terms of the fact that these plans aren't detailed enough?

[9] **Mr Rowlands**: Ydym. Mae nifer o argymhellion—mae yna naw. Mae yna chwech o argymhellion ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol ac mae yna dri ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru yn yr adroddiad yna. Un ohonyn nhw ydy sicrhau bod y targedau y cytunwyd arnynt yn y CSGAau yn adlewyrchu dyhead y strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg genedlaethol.

Mr Rowlands: Yes. There are a number of recommendations—there are nine recommendations. There are six recommendations for local authorities and there are three for Welsh Government in that report. One of them is to ensure that the targets agreed on in the WESPs reflect the aspiration in the national Welsh-medium education strategy.

[10] Mae ymrwymiad y gwahanol awdurdodau yn amrywiol hefyd. Yn yr enghreifftiau gorau, mae'r cynlluniau strategol lleol yn uchelgeisiol. Mae yna ymrwymiad clir gan swyddogion, uchel-swyddogion, gan aelodau'r cynghorau, ond mewn awdurdodau eraill, nid yw'r ymrwymiad ddim yno. Felly, mae hynny, rwy'n meddwl, yn un pwynt pwysig iawn, os ydy'r targed yma o 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050 yn mynd i gael ei gyrraedd.

The commitment from the various authorities varies as well. In the best examples, the local strategic plans are ambitious. There is a clear commitment from officials, senior officials, and council members, but in other authorities, that commitment isn't there. So, that, I think, is one important point, if this target of 1 million Welsh speakers is to be achieved by 2050.

[11] Ffactor arall, wrth gwrs, yw bod angen buddsoddiad sylweddol iawn mewn hyfforddiant athrawon, hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, a hefyd hyfforddiant mewn swydd athrawon er mwyn cynyddu nifer yr athrawon sydd yn medru defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y dosbarth.

Another factor, of course, is that there is a need for very significant investment in teacher training, initial teacher training, and also in-service teacher training in order to increase the number of teachers who can use the Welsh language in the classroom.

[12] Mae yna gyfle i ehangu nifer yr athrawon sydd yn medru defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y dosbarth, gan fod yna newidiadau mawr yn yr arfaeth ar gyfer hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Felly, ar un wedd, nid yw'n beth da bod y system hyfforddi gychwynnol athrawon wedi cael ei beirniadu yn hallt gennym ni yn Estyn a hefyd gan nifer o adroddiadau eraill—Furlong a Tabberer, er enghraifft—ond mae'r ffaith ei bod yn cael ei chwyldroi ar hyn o bryd yn rhoi cyfle i edrych o'r newydd ar sut y mae hyfforddi athrawon.

There is an opportunity to increase the number of teachers who are able to use the Welsh language in the classroom, as major changes have been proposed for initial teacher training. Therefore, in one regard, it's not such a good thing that the initial teacher training system has been severely criticised by us in Estyn and also by a number of other reports—Furlong and Tabberer, for example—but the fact that it is currently being revolutionised provides an opportunity to look anew at how teacher training is developing.

[13] **Bethan Jenkins**: Ocê. Sori,

Bethan Jenkins: Okay. I'm sorry, we

mae'n rhaid inni symud ymlaen, ac wedyn gallwn ni ofyn mwy o gwestiwn, os yw hynny'n iawn.

do have to move on, and then we can ask further questions, if that's okay.

[14] **Mr Rowlands**: Ocê. Y gwir ydy bod hon yn strategaeth y bydd angen o wahanol elfennau cymhleth arni hi, ac nid wyf ond wedi cyffwrdd â rhai ohonyn nhw.

Mr Rowlands: Okay. The truth is that this is a strategy that will need all sorts of complex elements, and I've only just touched on some of those.

[15] **Bethan Jenkins**: Byddwn ni'n cario ymlaen gyda'r cwestiynau nawr, ond jest yn fras, i gychwyn, os gallech chi ymateb i'r cwestiwn hefyd.

Bethan Jenkins: We will continue with our questions now, but just basically, to start with, if you can respond to the question, too.

[16] **Mr E. George**: Wel, mi fuaswn i'n ategu tipyn o'r hyn y mae Meilyr eisoes wedi ei ddweud, ac mae hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu yn ein hymateb ni i'r ymgynghoriad—bod angen targedau, bod angen eglurder ynglŷn â chyfrifoldebau a chyfraniadau disgwyliedig yr holl wahanol gyrff a mudiadau a fydd angen cyfrannu a gweithio fel partneriaid gyda'i gilydd i symud tuag at y nod yna yn 2050 a chyrraedd cerrig milltir ar hyd y ffordd.

Mr E. George: Well, I would endorse much of what Meilyr has already said, and that's reflected in our response to the consultation—that we need targets, that we need clarity on the responsibilities and the expectations of all the different organisations and bodies that will need to contribute as partners in order to move towards that aim of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 and to reach milestones along the way.

[17] Rydym ni hefyd yn cytuno â'r hyn sydd wedi cael ei ddweud yn yr ymgynghoriad, bod angen ymdrech gyson a grymus i gyfathrebu buddiannau dwyieithrwydd er mwyn sicrhau cefnogaeth ac ewyllys da'r cyhoedd i'r ymdrech ac i'r buddsoddiad y bydd yn ddi-os ei angen hefyd i wireddu'r weledigaeth.

We also agree with what's been said in the consultation, that a consistent and robust effort needs to be made to communicate the benefits of bilingualism in order to engender the goodwill and confidence of the public and the investment that will undoubtedly be required to achieve that vision.

[18] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Gareth.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Gareth.

[19] **Mr Pierce**: Rŷm ni hefyd yn cytuno bod y targed yn un heriol iawn. Er enghraifft, o feddwl mai 5,000 o siaradwyr iaith gyntaf sy'n dod trwy'r gyfundrefn addysg yn flynyddol nawr a bod bron 25,000 sy'n dod trwy'r llwybr ail iaith neu â dim Cymraeg o gwbl, i gyrraedd y targed erbyn 2050, hyd yn oed pe bai 10,000 y flwyddyn yn dod o'r garfan o 25,000 yna yn siaradwyr Cymraeg yn flynyddol, mae hynny'n rhoi 0.25 miliwn o siaradwyr newydd, onid yw e, o'r gyfundrefn addysg? A oes eisiau meddwl bod eisiau bron iawn yr un math o nifer, sef 0.25 miliwn arall, yn dod o blith oedolion, sef, ar y cyfan, pobl sydd mewn gweithleoedd?

Mr Pierce: We also agree that the target is an ambitious one. For example, given that there are 5,000 first-language Welsh speakers going through the education system now and almost 25,000 going through with Welsh as a second language or without Welsh at all, to reach the target by 2050, even if 10,000 a year were to come from that cohort of 25,000 on an annual basis as Welsh speakers, that provides 0.25 million new speakers, doesn't it, from the education system? Is there a need to think that you need almost the same amount, another 0.25 million, coming from amongst the adults, who are, generally, people in workplaces?

[20] Felly, mae'n bwysig, rwy'n credu, edrych ar y maes oedolion a hefyd y maes ysgolion. Ond o ran pethau hanfodol, mae eisiau ewyllys ac ymrwymiad cenedlaethol, mae eisiau rhoi bri ar sgiliau dwyieithog, fel bod yna garfannau helaeth o rieni a phobl ifanc yn cael eu hysbrydoli i ddilyn y llwybr o ddysgu'r Gymraeg. Mae eisiau strategaeth gynhwysol, buddsoddiad sylweddol, gweithlu ymroddedig a chymwys, ond hefyd pobl sy'n mynd i allu cynnal y Gymraeg mewn gweithgareddau allgyrsiol yn y gymuned—chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau. Un o'r gwendidau mawr yw nad yw pobl ifanc, ar ôl gadael y sector addysg, yn cael y cyfle i barhau gyda'r Gymraeg mewn gweithgareddau. Rwy'n siŵr bod nifer

So, I think it's important to look at the field of adult education and schools. I think there is a need for goodwill on a national level, and there is a need to place an emphasis on skills, so that a high proportion of parents and young people are inspired to follow the path of learning Welsh. There needs to be an inclusive strategy, significant investment, and a committed workforce, but also people who are going to be able to maintain the Welsh language in extra-curricular activities in the community—sport and the arts. One of the main big weaknesses is that young people, after leaving the education system, don't have an opportunity to continue with the Welsh language in

o'r pwyllgor, efallai, yn gwybod am gyfrol Huw Thomas, 'Brwydr i Baradwys?' Mae'r gyfrol bwysig hon yn dadansoddi nifer o'r ffactorau sy'n ymwneud ag ailsefydlu iaith, ac mae yna ddyfyniadau pwysig—ni wnaf eu dyfynnu y bore yma, ond mae yn bethau pwysig iawn yn y gyfrol hon sydd yn wersi i'w dysgu, ac maen nhw'n ymwneud â'r hanfodion rydw i newydd eu crybwyll.

activities. I'm sure a number of the committee know about Huw Thomas's book, 'Brwydr i Baradwys?' This assesses a number of the important factors that relate to the re-establishing of a language, and there are important quotations in this book—I won't repeat them this morning, but they are lessons to be learned, and they relate to the essential items that I've mentioned.

[21] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr. Rydym ni'n mynd i symud ymlaen at gadw a recriwtio athrawon, ac mae Dawn Bowden yn mynd i gychwyn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We'll move on to retention and recruitment of teachers, and Dawn Bowden is going to start.

[22] **Dawn Bowden**: Diolch, Bethan. I just wanted to talk a little bit about retention and recruitment of teachers. In several of the stakeholder sessions we've had, we've heard evidence about the difficulties of recruiting teachers. In rural areas, we've heard of difficulties in not just recruiting but retaining teaching staff as well. So, I just wanted to get your view on that in the round, whether you see that as a general problem and what you think we, perhaps, need to be doing to address that. I'm talking specifically about Welsh-medium schools, really.

[23] **Mr Rowlands**: You're right, it is a general problem, it's not just true of Welsh-medium schools, but it's particularly acute in Welsh-medium schools and in certain subject areas. So, science and maths, and those sorts of areas. So, when you're looking for science and maths teachers through the medium of Welsh, then it's even more difficult. But it is a more general problem. I think, as I was saying, initial teacher training does need and is receiving a big shake-up currently, and I think that is an opportunity to look at the issue of preparing people to teach through the medium of Welsh, but also at the whole issue of recruitment. It's not entirely clear to me—and I don't think there has been a consistent policy for recruitment and marketing teaching in Wales. I can't really comment on why that is the case, but it could be because we don't have salaries of teachers as a devolved area. Maybe when that is devolved, if it is devolved, that could be an opportunity to have a big marketing campaign for teaching in parallel with starting a completely new way of preparing teachers. I think the initial teacher training needs to involve

schools in partnership much more strongly, and that, I think, will also help the recruitment.

[24] **Mr E. George**: Rŷm ni'n cytuno bod angen buddsoddi er mwyn ehangu'r garfan o athrawon sy'n medru addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond hefyd sy'n medru arddel y Gymraeg a defnyddio'r Gymraeg o fewn ysgolion, hyd yn oed os nad ydyn nhw'n ddigon hyderus i addysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Ac felly, rydw i'n credu, yn ogystal â hyfforddiant cychwynnol, fod angen rhywbeth ynglŷn ag adeiladu ar lwyddiannau'r cynllun sabothol i roi mwy o hyfforddiant a chymorth i athrawon i'w helpu nhw i ddatblygu eu medrau Cymraeg nhw, ond hefyd ein bod ni'n gosod disgwyliadau eu bod nhw'n cymryd y cyfleoedd sydd yna i ddatblygu eu Cymraeg.

Mr E. George: We would agree that we do need investment in order to enhance the cohort of teachers who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh, but who are also able to use the Welsh language within our schools, even if they are not confident enough to teach through the medium of Welsh. And therefore, in addition to initial teacher training, I think there is an issue here surrounding building on the successes of the sabbatical programme in order to provide more training and support to teachers to assist them in developing their Welsh language skills, but also that we set an expectation that they do take the opportunities available to develop those skills.

[25] Rydw i'n siŵr y byddwn ni'n dod i siarad am y continwwm, felly ni wnaf i fynd i mewn i hynny'n ormodol, ond mae rhywbeth reit rymus am y cysyniad o gontinwwm, nid yn unig o ran sail ar gyfer cymwysterau a dilyniant y disgyblion a'r dysgwyr sydd mewn ysgolion, ond hefyd fel sail ar gyfer gweld ysgolion fel canolfannau lle mae pawb rywle ar hyd y daith tuag at ddatblygu y Gymraeg.

I'm sure we'll come on to talk about the continuum, so I won't go into that in too much detail, but there is something quite powerful about the idea of a continuum, not only in providing a basis for the qualifications of learners within schools, but also as a foundation for seeing schools as centres where everyone is at some point on the journey in developing their Welsh language skills.

09:15

[26] **Bethan Jenkins**: Sorry, Lee wants to come in there.

[27] **Lee Waters**: Can I just jump in? You mentioned there the success of the sabbatical project. We've had mixed evidence on this, and the Education Workforce Council said that there are no data yet to justify the view that it was a success in terms of the number of practitioners having been on the course who then were able to teach through the medium of Welsh. It had no discernible impact that they could yet measure. So, I wonder if you could tell us a little bit more about why you think it's a success, and if there are any other different data that could point to justify that position.

[28] **Mr E. George**: Nid wyf yn honni fy mod yn arbenigwr yn y cwrs. Rydw i wedi darllen bod yna wahanol safbwyntiau ynglŷn â'r llwyddiant, ond fel roeddwn i'n deall y data yna, rywbeth ynglŷn â pha un ai bod modd mesur e, o ran y niferoedd a chanran y gweithlu, oedd y data yna'n sôn amdanyn nhw, a'r llwyddiannau roeddwn i'n sôn amdanyn nhw oedd enghreifftiau o unigolion sydd wedi bod ar y cwrs rydw i'n ymwybodol ohonyn nhw, sydd wedi cael budd mawr o'r cwrs ac wedi ennill hyder drwy'r cyfle a roddwyd iddyn nhw i ddatblygu eu medrau Cymraeg. Felly, nid wyf yn honni fy mod yn gwybod mwy na hynny.

Mr E. George: I don't claim to be an expert in that area. I have read that there are varying views on its success or otherwise, but, as I understood it, those data were on whether it was measureable in terms of the numbers and percentage of the workforce—that's what that was covering—and the successes that I was talking about were examples of individuals that I'm aware of who have undertaken the programme and who have had huge benefit from it and have gained confidence through the opportunity provided to them to develop their Welsh language skills. So, I don't claim to know any more than that.

[29] **Mr Rowlands**: Mae yna adroddiad eithaf manwl wedi cael ei wneud gan Arad ar y gwahanol gyrsiau sabothol, ac maen nhw'n dod i'r casgliad bod yna dystiolaeth bod athrawon yn llawer mwy hyderus yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg ar ôl bod ar y cwrs. Mae yna dystiolaeth eithaf cryf o hynny. Lle nad oes digon o dystiolaeth, oherwydd nid oes yna adroddiad wedi cael ei wneud arno, ydy beth yw effaith hynny ar allu'r

Mr Rowlands: There has been quite a detailed report by Arad on the different sabbatical courses available, and they come to the conclusion that there is evidence that teachers are much more confident in using the Welsh language after being on the course. There is quite strong evidence of that. Where there isn't sufficient evidence, because a report hasn't been done on this, is the impact of that on the children's

plant yn yr ysgolion hynny. Felly, nid oes digon o dystiolaeth o hynny oherwydd nid oes adroddiad hirdymor wedi cael ei wneud ar y gwaith. Y peth arall am y cyrsiau sabothol ydy ychydig iawn ohonyn nhw sydd mewn gwirionedd. Byddai eisiau ehangu'r math yna o ddarpariaeth yn sylweddol iawn, iawn, iawn, os ydych yn bwriadu cael y miliwn yma erbyn 2050.

ability in those schools. So, there's not enough evidence of that because there hasn't been a long-term report written on the work. Another aspect of the sabbatical courses is that there are very few of them in reality. There would be a need to expand that sort of provision quite significantly, if you intend to achieve this million by 2050.

[30] **Lee Waters**: Presumably, you'd want to expand them on the basis of evidence of their efficacy, and it seems to me that that's primarily anecdotal at the minute.

[31] **Mr Rowlands**: Yes, that is true. However, if you have teachers who are much more confident in using the Welsh language in the classes, one would expect that that would have a positive effect on the ability of the children to use Welsh.

[32] **Bethan Jenkins**: Gareth, a oes ymateb gyda chi ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Gareth, do you have any response to that?

[33] **Mr Pierce**: Os gallaf jest sôn am ddau beth bach efallai, ond maen nhw'n bethau pwysig, o ran denu pobl ifanc mewn i fod yn ddysgwyr yr iaith Gymraeg mewn ysgolion a cholegau, mae'r garfan sy'n dilyn lefel-A ail-iaith yn garfan hollbwysig, oherwydd pan fyddech chi'n meddwl am gyn lleied sy'n gwneud lefel-A Cymraeg iaith gyntaf, mae'r garfan ail iaith eisoes yn ffynhonnell bwysig i fynd o lefel-A i wneud gradd yn y Gymraeg, ac wedyn mynd yn athrawon. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig bod yna ddigonedd o ysgolion a cholegau yng Nghymru yn cynnig Cymraeg lefel-A ail iaith. Mae yna

Mr Pierce: Can I just mention two minor issues, but they are important? In terms of attracting young people to being learners of Welsh in colleges and schools, the cohort taking second-language A-level is crucial, because there are so few studying first language A-level Welsh that the second language source is an important one in going from A-level into degree level and becoming teachers. So, it's crucially important that there are enough schools and colleges in Wales offering second-language Welsh at A-level. There is this risk that those opportunities are reducing as reorganisations take

berig bod y cyfleoedd yna'n lleihau wrth i ad-drefnu ddigwydd, a bod pynciau'n cael eu canoli mewn llai o ganolfannau. Mae unrhyw beth sy'n ei gwneud hi'n fwy anodd i bobl ddilyn y Gymraeg reit drwy lefel-A ac ymlaen i radd, yn ffactor bwysig, rwy'n credu, o ran cynnal y boblogaeth o bobl ifanc a allai wedyn cael eu denu i fod yn athrawon yr iaith.

place, and that subjects are centralised in fewer centres. Anything that makes it more difficult for people to study Welsh through A-level and on to degree level, is an important factor in terms of maintaining the cohort of young people who could be teachers of the language.

[34] Rydw i'n credu hefyd bod eisiau ailfeddwl y syniad yma bod angen gradd B TGAU mathemateg i fod yn athro neu athrawes y Gymraeg. Mae eisiau'r pwyslais fod ar sgiliau a brwdfrydedd dysgu iaith. O ran unrhyw gyflogwr sydd eisiau sgiliau ychwanegol, fel rhifedd, yna mae'r cyfrifoldeb i fod ar y cyflogwr i roi'r sgiliau yna, ac nid ar y bobl ifanc i fod wedi cael gradd benodol mewn TGAU mewn unrhyw bwnc arall.

I think we need to rethink this concept that you need a GCSE grade B in maths to be a teacher. I think the emphasis needs to be on the skills and enthusiasm in teaching language. In terms of any employer who wants additional skills, such as numeracy, then the responsibility falls on the employer to provide those skills, not on the young people to have had a particular grade at GCSE level in any other subject.

[35] Rydw i'n credu hefyd bod eisiau sicrhau, o ran cadw pobl yn y gweithlu addysg, bod y cyd-destun dysgu yn un deniadol i'r bobl ifanc ac i'r athrawon. Felly, os ydym yn mynd i fod â chenhadaeth o gael mwy o bobl ifanc yn rhoi mwy o amser i ddysgu'r Gymraeg, yn enwedig yn y sector uwchradd, mae'n bwysig fod yr amodau yn rhai deniadol. Hynny yw, nid ydym eisiau dosbarthiadau mawr, anniddig, yn teimlo bod nhw'n derbyn mwy o Gymraeg dan orfodaeth. Os yw hyn yn mynd i fod yn ddeniadol i'r bobl ifanc, ac i'r gweithlu, mae eisiau creu'r cyd-

In terms of retaining people in the education workforce, then the education context needs to be attractive to young people and teachers. So, if we're going to have a mission of attracting more young people to give more time to learning the Welsh language, particularly in the secondary sector, then it's important that the conditions are attractive. We don't want large, dissatisfied classes, feeling that they are being forced to learn more Welsh. If this is going to be attractive to young people, and the workforce, then we have to create that attractive

destun iawn, rydw i'n credu.

context for them.

[36] **Lee Waters**: Can I just ask a very quick follow-up? Your point about dropping the requirement of a B in maths GCSE—are you recommending that across the piece, or just for Welsh teachers?

[37] **Mr Pierce**: Personally, I would do it across the piece because my view is that it's the employer, eventually, who should make sure that the people coming in to employment have the right skill set. It's not something that should be determined at your GCSE age, I don't think.

[38] **Lee Waters**: Okay.

[39] **Bethan Jenkins**: Roeddem ni'n mynd i ddod yn ôl at y cwrs sabothol yn hwyrach, ond roeddwn i yn yr un seminar â Gareth yr wythnos diwethaf, ac rwy'n credu bod yna wybodaeth sydd, nid yn anghywir, ond yn wahanol, yn mynd o gwmpas am y cwrs sabothol. Yn ôl beth yr oeddwn i'n deall o'r seminar hynny, nid yw'r cymhwyster ar y cyrsiau sabothol hynny yn golygu eich bod chi wedyn yn mynd yn ôl i mewn i'r dosbarth i allu dysgu trwy'r Gymraeg—roedd e jest yn helpu'r athro, ac yn rhoi hyder i'r athro hynny, i allu mynd yn ôl a chael yr hyder yn bersonol i fedru'r Gymraeg. Efallai bod angen inni ysgrifennu at y rheini sy'n cynnal y cyrsiau sabothol i ofyn iddyn nhw beth yw gofynion y cwrs wedi iddyn nhw gyflawni hynny, achos rwy'n credu bod yna bach o gamddealltwriaeth, efallai, yn digwydd oherwydd rydym ni wedi clywed gan ddau dyst gwahanol ei fod yn effeithiol, ond wedyn efallai nad yw'r athrawon hynny'n defnyddio'r Gymraeg mwy pan

Bethan Jenkins: We were going to come back to the sabbatical course later, but I was at the same seminar as Gareth last week, and I think that perhaps there is information, not incorrect information, but different information, going around about the sabbatical course. What I understood from that seminar was that the qualification on those sabbatical courses didn't mean that you then went back to the classroom to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh—it was just help for the teacher to provide that teacher with confidence to go back and have that personal confidence to be able to speak Welsh. Perhaps we need to write to those who run these sabbatical courses to ask them what are the requirements of the course after they've achieved it, because I think there's some sort of misunderstanding, perhaps, because we've heard from two different witnesses saying that it is effective, and then perhaps those teachers aren't using the Welsh language

fyddan nhw'n mynd yn ôl i mewn i'r ysgol. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn eithaf pwysig i ni edrych ar hynny fel pwyllgor, os yw'n bosib.

when they go back to the school. So I think those are important things for us to look at as a committee.

[40] Dawn, a oes mwy o gwestiynau?

Dawn, do you have any more questions?

[41] **Dawn Bowden**: Yes, thank you. Yes, just expanding on the question of the skills gap, really, you were talking about new teachers coming in, how we recruit new teachers and retain them, but, if we can just think a bit at the moment about the teachers that we already have, we've got something in the region of 33 per cent, I believe, of qualified teachers in Wales who identify themselves as Welsh speakers, but only 27 per cent of those say that they would teach through the medium of Welsh. That may be a confidence issue or it may be a skills gap, whatever. So, we have a gap of about 5 per cent that we could look to address pretty quickly, if somebody's already a fluent Welsh speaker, but actually only having 33 per cent of our qualified teachers as Welsh speakers is actually a huge gap in terms of looking at what we need to achieve if we're going to reach the 25,000 that you were talking about, Gareth, each year—I think 10,000 a year is what we're talking about. So, do you have any views on what we could do in the short, medium and long term, really—accepting all the points about the sabbaticals, and what have you—to address that amongst existing Welsh speakers?

[42] **Mr Rowlands**: As I said, in the long term, I think you need a completely different way of looking at initial teacher training to attract more people into initial teacher training. I think you're quite right: there is that gap between those who are confident to use their Welsh and those who are not. The sabbatical course: there are several different types of sabbatical courses, one of which is for fluent Welsh speakers who need that extra bit of confidence. But that's what I was saying—the extent of that has been quite small so far. You'd need to expand it quite significantly to make any impact on that 5 per cent gap that you're talking about. Agreeing with the point that the evidence doesn't exist of long-term impact on standards with that, the general agreement is that, if you have a teacher who is very confident and enthusiastic, it is going to have an effect on standards. One of the findings about the sabbatical was that there wasn't very good all-of-our-life follow-up after the course. So, you have a fairly short course, and then partly, maybe, uncertainty about what should be done afterwards, but a lack of support for those teachers once they go back to their own local area.

[43] **Dawn Bowden**: I just wondered whether Emyr or Gareth wanted to say anything, but, if not, can I just very briefly, then, ask you about your views on the role of teaching assistants and support staff through this process? They seem to be an ever-growing workforce now. I think there are probably as many teaching assistants and support staff as there are qualified teachers now, so what do you see as the role of support staff maybe in reaching the objective?

[44] **Mr Pierce**: I think that's very important, especially perhaps with the younger age groups, because I think, strategically, there's a lot of sense in looking at the younger age groups. That's the place to make the greatest investment in the language skills of teachers and assistants. For example, there is a view that perhaps 70 to 80 per cent of the contact time with all those adults that you mentioned in the foundation phase should be through the medium of Welsh, and that up to 60 per cent should be through the medium of Welsh in key stage 2. Now, the sabbatical type of course may be more suitable for the skills needed at that level anyway, and there's probably more of a need to increase the contact time through the medium of Welsh in those age groups initially. So, I would be inclusive in my view of all the adults who engage with young people during school time, and, outside of school time, as I mentioned in my introductory comments, there should be a significant return possible on growing the skill sets for the workforce that engages with those younger age groups especially.

[45] **Dawn Bowden**: Okay.

[46] **Mr E. George**: Yn gyflym, i ategu hynny, roeddwn i'n mynd i ddweud bod yna rôl bwysig i ofalwyr plant is lawr yn yr ysgol ac yn y feithrinfa, a hefyd i unrhyw weithwyr eraill o'r gwasanaethau gofal y mae'r plant yn dod ar eu traws yn ystod eu gyrfa ysgol nhw—seicolegwyr, ac yn y blaen. Mae eisiau edrych yn fanna hefyd o ran beth yw medrau iaith yr unigolion yna, achos mae'r mewnbwn i gyd yn cyfrannu at brofiadau cadarnhaol o'r iaith ar gyfer ein dysgwyr ni.

Mr E. George: Just briefly, to endorse those points, I did want to say that there's an important role for child minders in the early years and in the nursery, and also any other workers in the care services who children will come across throughout their educational careers—educational psychologists, and so on. We need to look there in terms of what the language skills of those individuals are, because the input all contributes to positive experiences of the language for our learners.

[47] **Mr Rowlands**: I would agree as well that definitely we need to include teacher assistants in the training we're talking about, in particular in the non-maintained sector. There's a lot of evidence that, if you want to learn a language, the sooner and earlier that this is introduced, the better. But, in the non-maintained sector, we've certainly seen, even in our Welsh-medium settings, that the ability of the practitioners isn't good enough—their Welsh isn't good enough to set a good model for the young children. So, there's a big gap there.

[48] **Bethan Jenkins**: Jest yn fras, beth yw eich barn chi ynglŷn â Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru? Maen nhw'n gosod asesiad ar gyfer beth sydd yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer athrawon ar draws y sector, ond ddim yn benodol ar gyfer y Gymraeg. A oes yna farn ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Just briefly, what are your views on the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales? They make an assessment of what's required for teachers across the sector, but not specifically for Welsh. Do you have a view on that?

[49] **Mr Rowlands**: Rydw i'n meddwl bod hynny'n newid ar hyn o bryd, onid ydyw, ac yn symud i Gyngor Gweithlu Cymru. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr at beth oeddech chi'n cyfeirio.

Mr Rowlands: I think that that's currently changing and shifting over to the Education Workforce Council, as I understand it. I'm not entirely sure what you were referring to.

[50] **Bethan Jenkins**: Eu bod nhw'n asesu'r angen am athrawon ar draws y sector cynradd ac uwchradd ac yn rhoi cyfarwyddiad i ddarparwyr y tair canolfan hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon yng Nghymru, ond nid ydyn nhw'n gwneud yr un peth o safbwynt yr angen o ran y Gymraeg.

Bethan Jenkins: That they assess the need for teachers across the primary and secondary sector and provide advice to the three providers of initial teacher training in Wales, but they're not doing the same with regards to the requirement for Welsh.

[51] **Mr Rowlands**: Fy nealltwriaeth i ydy bod y model ystadegol—bod y ffigyrau mor isel, ei fod anodd iawn i wneud hynny. Dyna fy nealltwriaeth i.

Mr Rowlands: My understanding is that the statistical model—that the figures are so low that it's very difficult to do that. That's my understanding.

[52] **Bethan Jenkins**: Dim oherwydd

Bethan Jenkins: It's not that they

nad ydyn nhw eisiau ei wneud e, felly.

don’t want to do it, then.

[53] **Mr Rowlands**: Rwy’n credu, ond nid ydw i’n arbenigwr ar hynny.

Mr Rowlands: I believe that’s the case, but I’m no expert in that area.

[54] **Bethan Jenkins**: Ocê, diolch yn fawr. Rŷm ni’n symud ymlaen at uwchsgilio nawr. Hannah.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, thank you. We’ll move on to upskilling now. Hannah.

[55] **Hannah Blythyn**: Thanks, Chair. Previous witnesses in this inquiry and yourself have alluded to the need for a programme of upskilling to plug that gap of the figures that Dawn’s already alluded to in terms of the percentage of teachers who are able, and confident currently, to teach through the medium of Welsh. So, firstly, what do you think is the capacity there that already exists to upskill? Where are the changes that we need to make to be able to do that?

09:30

[56] **Mr Rowlands continues**: I think we’ve alluded to most of the areas already. I think we need to have more initial teacher training and also more in-service training. In terms of in-service training, something along the lines of a differentiated sabbatical provision would be the obvious solution, because, in order to learn a language, you need to be immersed in it. So, you would need something like a sabbatical-type provision. The same is true of initial teacher training: you need to attract people who already speak Welsh, but you need also a sabbatical-type immersion element to the initial teacher training to help people who don’t speak Welsh, or only speak it to a limited extent, to improve their ability to teach through the medium of Welsh. That kind of sabbatical or immersion period could come either before the initial teacher training course proper starts, or after it, or during it. So, there are different possible models. There is a new approach to Welsh for adults at the moment, so maybe the Welsh for adults centres could contribute to the initial teacher training and also the in-service training. So, there are lots of possibilities, I think.

[57] **Mr E. George**: Rwy’n cytuno efo hynny: dim ond i adio, wrth gaffael iaith a datblygu iaith, mae dwy elfen bwysig iawn, sef

Mr E. George: I agree with that: I’d just add, in acquiring a language and developing a language, there are two very important elements, which are

cymhelliant a hyder. Rwy'n credu, yn ogystal â threfniadau sabothol ac ymdrwythol, bod angen ystyried pa gamau ymarferol fedr cael eu cymryd i gynorthwyo athrawon o ddydd i ddydd, neu yn ystod y tymor, yn ystod y flwyddyn dysgu. Rydw i'n credu bod hwn yn mynd yn ôl at y pwyntiau agoriadol y gwnaethom ni o ran targedau a chyfrifoldebau ar gyfer y gwahanol gyrff, er enghraifft, awdurdodau lleol ac yn y blaen, o ran pa gymorth medran nhw ei gynnig.

encouragement and confidence. I think, as well as sabbatical and immersion arrangements, there is a need to consider what practical steps can be taken to assist teachers on a daily basis, or during the term, during the teaching year. I think that this goes back to the opening comments that we made in terms of the targets and responsibilities of different bodies, for example, local authorities and so on, in terms of what assistance they can offer.

[58] Ond, rydw i'n credu, ar ben hyn oll, un peth y dylem ni gadw mewn golwg yw mai'r adnodd prinnaf oll i unrhyw athro neu ysgol yw amser, a bod hwn yn dod ar ben gofynion eraill arnyn nhw o ran datblygu proffesiynol ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae eisiau edrych, fel yr oedd Gareth yn sôn, o ran amodau dysgu a chadw athrawon yn y proffesiwn—mae eisiau edrych, os ydym yn disgwyl hyn oll oddi wrth ein hathrawon ni, ar sut rŷm ni'n rhoi'r amser iddyn nhw i gyrraedd y disgwyliadau yna.

But, I think, on top of all of this, one thing we should keep in mind is that the scarcest resource of all for teachers is time, and this comes on top of other demands on them in terms of professional development and so on. So, there's a need to look, as Gareth mentioned, in terms of the conditions of teaching and retaining teachers—if we're expecting this from our teachers, we need to look at how we provide them with that time to reach those expectations.

[59] **Mr Pierce**: Rwy'n credu, gan fod y targedau mor heriol, bod eisiau cynllunio gofalus ac rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn bosib blaenoriaethu meysydd, buaswn i'n meddwl. Buaswn i'n dweud bod y maes oedolion yn gyffredinol yn faes sydd angen ei flaenoriaethu, yn enwedig o gofio bod yna dystiolaeth anecdotaidd bod yna golli tiwtoriaid arbenigol wedi digwydd yn ddiweddar yn y cyfnod

Mr Pierce: I think, because the targets are so challenging, we need some careful planning and I think it is possible to prioritise areas. I would say that the area of education for adults is a particular area that needs prioritising, bearing in mind that there is anecdotal evidence that specialist tutors have been lost recently in this period of reforming Welsh for adults. The uncertainty has

yma o aildrefnu Cymraeg i oedolion. Mae ansicrwydd wedi effeithio ar diwtoriaid ac mae yna dystiolaeth anecdotaidd bod yna leihau wedi bod yn ddiweddar iawn.

affected those tutors and there's anecdotal evidence that there's been a reduction recently in the numbers of tutors.

[60] Er ein bod wedi sôn am yr oedran ifanc, rwy'n credu hefyd bod eisiau sôn am yr oedran ôl 16. Mae yna feysydd galwedigaethol yn cael eu diwygio cyn hir o ran cymwysterau. Digwydd bod, yn fy marn i, mae dau o'r tri cyntaf yn rhai lle mae sgiliau cyfrwng Cymraeg yn hanfodol. Iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yw un ohonyn nhw; mae'n amlwg bod eisiau'r sgiliau Cymraeg. Felly, buaswn i'n dweud bod eisiau blaenoriaethu twf yn y gweithlu sy'n gallu hyfforddi drwy'r Gymraeg yn y maes yna. Y llall, buaswn i'n dweud, o'r tri cyntaf, yw technoleg gwybodaeth. Gan fod Cymru'n wlad ddwyieithog ac mae cymaint o waith technoleg gwybodaeth yn ddwyieithog yn ei naws—er enghraifft, mae cymaint o wefannau'r byd yn ddwyieithog, neu'n amlieithog—mae'r ffaith bod Cymru'n gallu cynnig profiad o ddwy iaith i bobl ifanc yn golygu y dylem ni fod ar y blaen o ran arfogi pobl ifanc i weithio yn y byd digidol. Felly, gan fod hwnnw ymhlith y tri maes cyntaf sy'n cael eu diwygio o ran cymwysterau, buaswn i'n dweud bod eisiau blaenoriaethu pobl sy'n gallu addysgu yn y maes technoleg gwybodaeth trwy'r Gymraeg, oherwydd fe ddylai fod yna fanteision mawr i'n pobl ifanc ni o fod â sgiliau

Although we've mentioned the early years, I do think that we need to mention also the post-16 sector. There are vocational areas that are to be reformed before too long in terms of qualifications. As it happens, in my view, two of the first three are ones where Welsh-language skills are crucial. Health and social care is one of them; it's clear that we need Welsh-language skills in that area. So, I would say that we need to prioritise growth in the workforce that can train through the medium of Welsh in that area. The other important area of the first three is IT. Because Wales is a bilingual nation and so much IT work happens bilingually—for example, so many of the world's websites are either bilingual or multilingual—the fact that Wales can give an experience of two languages to young people does mean that we should be in the vanguard in terms of preparing young people to work in the digital world. So, as that is among the first three areas to be reformed in terms of qualifications, I would say that we need to prioritise people who can teach in the area of IT through the medium of Welsh, because there should be huge benefits for our young people in having digital skills as well as Welsh and English skills

digidol a sgiliau Cymraeg a sgiliau Saesneg ochr yn ochr â'i gilydd.

alongside each other.

[61] **Hannah Blythyn**: In terms of the point about the biggest pressure on a teacher is their time and resources—and I think you hit the nail on the head by saying about the importance of encouragement and confidence—do you have a view or thoughts on how, perhaps, teachers could be incentivised to upskill and to want to go and do that, as well?

[62] **Mr Rowlands**: Nid wyf yn siŵr iawn, ond rwy'n credu bod yna deimlad positif o blaid yr iaith ymysg nifer fawr o athrawon, ac nid wyf i'n credu bod yna broblem wedi bod i gael athrawon i fynd ar gyrsiau sabothol, er enghraifft. Mae'n rhywbeth deniadol i gael cyfle i adael y dosbarth am gyfnod, a chael amser i fyfyrio am bethau a dysgu sgiliau newydd. Rwy'n credu petai mwy o gyfleoedd felly ar gael y byddai nifer fawr o athrawon yn cymryd y cynnig.

Mr Rowlands: I'm not very sure, but I think that there is a positive feeling towards the language amongst a large number of teachers, and I don't think there's been a problem getting teachers to go on sabbatical courses, for example. It's something quite attractive to have an opportunity to leave the classroom for a period, and to have time to reflect on things and learn new skills. I think, if there were more such opportunities available, a great number of teachers would take up that opportunity.

[63] **Mr Pierce**: Rydw i'n meddwl mai'r cymhelliant mwyaf i athrawon yw eu bod eisiau gwneud y gorau ar gyfer y bobl ifanc sydd yn eu gofal nhw. Felly, os ydy hwn yn digwydd fel rhan o ewyllys ac ymrwymiad cenedlaethol, fe fydd yr athrawon yn cytuno bod hwn yn rhywbeth pwysig, ac felly mae hynny ei hun yn mynd i'w cymell nhw. Ond mae hefyd angen cofio bod yna bethau eraill yn cymell athrawon, ac efallai, yn fwy byth, yn cymell penaethiaid ysgolion a phenaethiaid colegau, sef mesuriadau perfformiad. Felly, o ran y pethau sy'n cymell, rydw i'n credu bod eisiau ystyriaeth ofalus ar ble

Mr Pierce: I think the main incentive for teachers is that they want to do the best they can for the young people in their care. So, if this happens as part of a national commitment, then the teachers would agree that this is important and that in and of itself is going to be an incentive for them. But we also need to bear in mind that there are other incentives for teachers, and perhaps even more so for heads of colleges and schools, namely performance measurements. So, in terms of incentives, I think we need a careful consideration of where the Welsh language sits in terms of KPIs.

mae'r Gymraeg yn sefyll yn y mesuriadau perfformiad. Ar hyn o bryd, rydw i'n credu bod y Gymraeg mewn sefyllfa wan iawn mewn mesuriadau perfformiad, ac nid yw yn bodoli o gwbl ym magloriaeth Cymru ar ei newydd wedd. Felly mae yna bethau eraill sy'n cymell sydd ar hyn o bryd yn eithaf negyddol, rydw i'n credu, o ran yr hyn y maent yn cyfrannu at y strategaeth hon.

At the moment, the Welsh language is in a very weak place in terms of KPIs, and it doesn't exist at all within the new reformed baccalaureate. So, there are other incentives that currently are quite negative in terms of what they contribute to this strategy.

[64] **Mr Rowlands**: Rydw i'n cytuno â beth mae Gareth yn ei ddweud, ond buaswn i'n ychwanegu hefyd beth ddwedais i reit ar y cychwyn: hynny yw, os oes yna ryw fath o bolisi cenedlaethol cryf ar hyn, mae angen adlewyrchu hynny yn lleol hefyd. Rydw i'n credu ei fod e yn amrywio o awdurdod i awdurdod, o ardal i ardal, ac felly mi fyddai angen yr un math o gefnogaeth yn lleol yn ogystal ag yn genedlaethol i hybu athrawon i gymryd y math yma o gyfleoedd.

Mr Rowlands: I agree with what Gareth has just said, but I would add also what I said at the beginning: namely, if there is a robust national policy on this, there is a need to reflect that on a local level as well. I think it does vary from authority to authority, from area to area, and therefore there would need to be the same kind of support on a local level as well as a national level to encourage teachers to take these opportunities.

[65] **Bethan Jenkins**: A allaf jest ofyn yn fras, fras—? Rŷch chi'n dweud nad yw'r mesuriadau yna o gwbl, neu ddim yn gryf. A allech chi jest roi enghraifft i ni o hynny, er mwyn i ni ddeall sut y gallai fe wella os ydym yn rhoi rhyw fath o argymhelliad i'r Llywodraeth yn hynny o beth?

Bethan Jenkins: Can I just ask, very broadly—? You say that the measurements weren't there at all, or are not robust. Can you give an example of that so that we can understand how it could be improved if we were to provide a recommendation to the Government?

[66] **Mr Pierce**: Un o'r mesuriadau perfformiad ar hyn o bryd—un cymharol newydd—yw'r mesur sydd wedi cael ei sefydlu rownd y fagloriaeth. Nid yw'r fagloriaeth ei

Mr Pierce: One of the performance indicators at the moment that is relatively new is an indicator surrounding the baccalaureate. The baccalaureate itself doesn't require

hun yn galw am unrhyw gyswllt â'r Gymraeg, ac, o ran y pynciau sy'n gallu cyfrannu at y mesuriad perfformiad yna, nid oes lle penodol i'r Gymraeg, hyd y gwelaf fi, o fewn y mesur perfformiad yna o gwbl. Felly, os yw'r strategaeth yma'n bwysig, yna mi ddylai hi efallai fod â thargedau a mesuriadau perfformiad ei hun fel dull arall o gymell.

any link with the Welsh language, and, in terms of the subjects that can contribute to those KPIs, there's no specific place for the Welsh language, as far as I can see, in terms of that performance indicator. So, if this strategy is important, then I do believe that it should have its own performance indicator as another means of incentivising.

[67] **Bethan Jenkins**: Ble arall ydy e'n wan, neu ddim yn bodoli o gwbl?

Bethan Jenkins: Where else is it weak or doesn't exist?

[68] **Mr Pierce**: Hwnnw, efallai, ydy'r prif beth. Hynny yw, mae yna gyflwyno mesur perfformiad newydd wedi digwydd heb unrhyw le i'r Gymraeg ynddo o gwbl. Felly, allaf i ddim weld bod hynny'n helpu'r strategaeth. Os rhywbeth, mae'n mynd i weithio yn erbyn y strategaeth.

Mr Pierce: That's the main issue, I think. That is, there's been the introduction of another performance indicator without any role for the Welsh language. I can't see that assists the strategy in any way. It's going to militate against it, if anything.

[69] **Bethan Jenkins**: Ocê, diolch.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, thank you.

[70] **Mr E. George**: A allaf i ychwanegu yn gyflym at hynny ein bod ni wedi diwygio'r cymhwyster TGAU ail iaith a'i atgyfnerthu fe, ac felly mae'n bosib bod yna gyfle fanna i edrych eto yn y tymor byr ar beth fyddai safle neu gyfraniad canlyniadau yn y pwnc yna tuag at ddangosyddion perfformiad? Mae yna gwestiwn mwy, rydw i'n credu, i gyd fynd â nod y Llywodraeth o symud tuag at addysg Gymraeg yn seiliedig ar un continwwm ieithyddol, a bydd hi'n bwysig iawn deall beth fydd y disgwyliadau o ran goblygiadau

Mr E. George: Could I just add quickly to that that we have reformed the GCSE second language qualification, and we have reinforced it, so there's possibly an opportunity to look again at that in the short term in terms of what would be the contribution of results in that subject towards the performance indicators? There is a bigger question, I think, to go with the Government's aim of moving towards Welsh language education based on one linguistic continuum, and it will be very important to understand what the expectations

atebolrwydd o fewn cyfundrefn mesuriadau perfformiad, neu beth bynnag ddaw i'w ddisodli yn y dyfodol, ar gyfer sut rŷm ni'n mynd ati i gynllunio cwricwlwm a threfniadau asesu i gyd-fynd efo hynny yn y dyfodol.

would be in terms of the implications for accountability within a performance indicator system, or whatever will replace it in future, in terms of how we go about planning a curriculum and assessment arrangements to go along with that in the future.

[71] **Mr Rowlands**: Rydw i'n credu bod y pwynt am y fagloriaeth yn bwynt da iawn, ac mae yna nifer o wendidau yn y fagloriaeth bresennol sydd angen eu diwygio. Un ohonyn nhw ydy diffyg unrhyw beth am yr iaith Gymraeg, ond hefyd mae yna lai ynddo fe am y cwricwlwm Cymreig. 'Cymru, Ewrop a'r Byd' oedd y darn oedd yn arfer bod yn y fagloriaeth, felly mae eisiau gosod dysgu'r Gymraeg yng nghyd-destun Cymreictod yn fwy cyffredinol. Rwy'n credu bod yna gyfle wedi cael ei golli yn y fagloriaeth i ddatblygu'r ymwybyddiaeth yna o ddiwylliant Cymru yn fwy cyffredinol.

Mr Rowlands: I think the point on the baccalaureate is a very good one, and there are a number of weaknesses in the current baccalaureate that need to be reformed. One of them is the lack of anything on the Welsh language, but there is also less in it about the curriculum Cymreig. 'Wales, Europe and the World' used to be in the baccalaureate, so we do need to set the learning of the Welsh language in the context of a broader Welsh identity. I think an opportunity has been lost in the baccalaureate to develop that awareness of Welsh culture more generally.

[72] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn._Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen at y continwwm nawr, ac mae Lee Waters yn mynd i ofyn cwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We're moving on to the continuum now, and Lee Waters is going to ask questions.

[73] **Lee Waters**: I'd like to ask something more broadly about standards, first, before moving on to the continuum, if I may. Just picking up on something Mr Pierce said about the need for communicating the benefits of bilingualism, shall I bring that back to standards, if I may, Mr Rowlands? There's a perception amongst parents that a Welsh-medium education is better than an English-medium education—the schools perform better. Do the data justify that view in terms of the value added?

[74] **Mr Rowlands**: Well, you've asked the question in a good way there,

because there are two ways of looking at standards, really. One is absolutely, and one is in terms of a relative measure. So, Welsh-medium schools tend to do well in an absolute sense, but then you need to take into account the cohort and the nature of the children going into the school. If you take into account deprivation, Welsh-medium schools and English-medium schools do approximately similarly. People will argue about this, and the mathematics and the statistics of it are quite complex, but that is Estyn's view.

[75] **Lee Waters**: In terms of the relative performance of children who go to Welsh-medium schools from English-speaking homes, do they perform as well in Welsh-medium schools as children who come from Welsh-speaking homes do?

[76] **Mr Rowlands**: I think they do. I know that various statistical analyses have been made of this, but none of them are very convincing one way or the other. I would say that, roughly speaking, children from Welsh-medium families and from English-speaking families do equally as well in Welsh-medium education. But this does lead to the whole issue of a continuum. You can't say that a child, anymore—. You know, where are they on that continuum? It's very difficult to say, 'Well, this is a cohort from an English-medium background, and this is a cohort from a Welsh-medium background'. I know lots of parents are interested in that, but it's incredibly difficult to get to the bottom of it because of the continuum nature of Welsh speaking.

[77] **Lee Waters**: The reason I'm probing it is because it's going to be key, isn't it, to bringing people along on the journey of the continuum, having the support of parents—that they feel that their children are going to perform as well in schools that teach through the Welsh medium, when they don't speak Welsh at home. So, I'm just asking you what the data say about that.

[78] **Mr Rowlands**: Yes. I think you need far more detailed analysis of this. It's not very clear, but I still think that the broad picture is still fairly clear: that Welsh-medium schools perform, in an absolute sense, very, very well. So, if you send your child to a Welsh-medium school, the chances are that your child will do very well in an absolute sense, plus they will be able to speak Welsh fluently as well.

[79] **Lee Waters**: In terms of the moving around the continuum, it seems to be relatively easy to move schools that are currently bilingual into Welsh medium. It strikes me that the greater challenge is moving schools that

currently have very low levels of Welsh teaching and staff who have very poor skills, moving them along into bilingual schools. So, what's your view about the practicality of that and how that can be done?

[80] **Mr Rowlands**: Well, as we've said, we would need to have very detailed plans for doing this. I have checked our recent inspection reports, and there are schools that are English-medium that do a very good job in terms of teaching their children to speak Welsh. So, in the last two or three years, I can sort of roll off Treorchy, Pontarddulais, Bryn Elian, John Bright, Coedcae, Corpus Christi, Sir Thomas Picton, St John Baptist in Aberdare, Greenhill in Pembrokeshire, Dyffryn, Caldicot. In all kinds of areas in Wales, these are schools that even now, or two or three years ago, are having the majority of their children doing the full Welsh course. They were preparing their children well in Welsh lessons, but also giving them opportunities to speak Welsh outside of the classroom in extracurricular activities, and so on. So, there are schools that are doing that already.

09:45

[81] **Lee Waters**: That's excellent, but these are outliers, aren't they? There are also schools that are teaching very little Welsh and whose teachers have very little Welsh themselves. It's interesting you mentioned Coedcae as an example there. I was speaking with the headteacher of Coedcae just a few weeks ago, and they're quite concerned about how they're going to be able to move along the continuum, because the direction from the local authority is that they must do this from within their own resources, which are already declining. So, in practical terms, there are examples you can always point to of excellent practice, but in terms of the system as a whole, it's going to require enormous energy and change over a long period, isn't it, to achieve this target.

[82] **Mr Rowlands**: Absolutely. I'm not trying to minimise the extent of the resource that will need to go in. All I was trying to say is that in terms of a continuum, you do have that continuum in terms of the schools. There are schools all along that continuum. So, you know, you're not shifting from no Welsh at all to completely Welsh medium; you're shifting all the system up a little bit. But I agree there would be a huge amount of resources involved, and as we've talked about, the biggest element of that would be in terms of the training of teachers.

[83] **Lee Waters**: And just finally in terms of the resources, because,

obviously, you look at standards across the piece, the amount of resources it's going to require to achieve these system changes is not inconsiderable, and that will obviously have an opportunity cost. In terms of where the priorities should be in terms of the standards challenge we have across all schools, are you confident this is the right place to put the resource to have an impact on the system?

[84] **Mr Rowlands**: That's virtually an impossible task to answer, really. I do feel that if you look—. That is the biggest question you can ask about the education system in Wales, and you're thinking, 'What can be done to improve the education system in Wales?' I do believe that having self-confidence is important for individual children and for the system as a whole. Having self-confidence means that you respect your own traditions and language. So, I think, yes, that investment would have a knock-on effect onto the whole education system as a whole.

[85] **Lee Waters**: But these are value judgments ultimately, aren't they?

[86] **Mr Rowlands**: Absolutely.

[87] **Lee Waters**: In terms of your broader job and in terms of data-driven standards assessment, that statement you just made doesn't quite fit within the rigour that you look within standards generally. That's a leap of faith we're making as a country.

[88] **Mr Rowlands**: Well, you know, all the judgments we make—. You can't analyse everything in terms of data; qualitative and quantitative judgments have to be made in these things. But you're quite right—they are policy judgments that have to be made, ultimately.

[89] **Lee Waters**: Okay, diolch.

[90] **Bethan Jenkins**: Gareth.

[91] **Mr Price**: Rwy'n credu bod modd hefyd ateb y cwestiwn drwy weld buddsoddi yn y Gymraeg fel rhan o'r buddsoddiad mewn llythrennedd—nid dim ond llythrennedd dwyieithog ond llythrennedd triphlyg, sef strategaeth

Mr Price: I believe you can also answer the question by seeing investment in the Welsh language as part of investment in literacy—not only dual literacy but triple literacy, which is a very successful strategy that CILT Cymru promoted, where the

llwyddiannus iawn roedd CILT Cymru yn ei hybu, lle roedd, yn yr ysgol uwchradd, adran y Gymraeg, adran y Saesneg a'r adran Ffrangeg, efallai, yn cydweithio ar agweddau ar llythrennedd. Roedd yna dystiolaeth bendant o'r cynllun peilot hwnnw fod buddsoddi yn y math yna o gydweithio yn llwyddiannus, ac yn gwella llythrennedd yn gyffredinol. Rwy'n credu hefyd fod llawer o dystiolaeth o wledydd fel Canada lle mae llythrennedd dwyieithog yn cael ei gydnabod fel arf cryf o ran llythrennedd yn gyffredinol. O ran y continwwm, rwy'n cytuno gyda Meilyr: mae yna rai ysgolion eisoes yn gallu cael pobl ifanc i gyfnod allweddol 3 ail iaith ac ymlaen i iaith gyntaf cyfnod allweddol 4. Ond rwy'n credu fod rhai o'r ysgolion yna yn manteisio ar y ffaith eu bod nhw â charfan o blant sydd wedi cael addysg gynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rwy'n credu fod rhai o'r ysgolion roedd Meilyr yn eu crybwyll yn y sefyllfa ffodus honno, siŵr o fod. Maen nhw wedi derbyn, i flwyddyn 7, plant sydd wedi cael addysg gynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac felly mae'n ddigon rhesymol iddyn nhw ailennill y Gymraeg erbyn diwedd blwyddyn 11. Ond rwy'n credu, i weithredu'r continwwm, mae'n syniad, o ran strwythur cwricwlwm, sydd ddim yn un anodd i'w ddatblygu. Ond rwy'n credu beth sy'n anodd yw ei weithredu fe mewn amrywiaeth o ysgolion. Ac efallai bod angen targedu rhai ysgolion lle mae'r syniad yma'n mynd i allu cael ei weithredu

Welsh department, the English department and the French department, perhaps, in the secondary school, would collaborate on aspects of literacy. There was some strong evidence from that pilot scheme that investing in that kind of collaboration was could be very successful, and improve literacy more generally. I think there's a great deal of evidence from nations such as Canada where bilingual literacy is recognised as an important tool in terms of literacy more generally. I think in terms of the continuum, I do agree with Meilyr that some schools are already able to get young people to key stage 3 second language and on to first language in key stage 4. But I think some of those schools benefit from the fact that they have a cohort of children who received primary Welsh-medium education. I think some of the schools that Meilyr mentioned are in that fortunate situation. They've taken into year 7 children who have Welsh-medium primary education, therefore it's reasonable for them to actually regain the Welsh language by the end of year 11. But in order for the continuum to work, it's an idea, in terms of the structure of a curriculum, that's not too difficult to develop. What's difficult is to implement it in such a variety of schools. Maybe we need to target some schools where this can be implemented more swiftly. It perhaps means a strong transference from primary to secondary, promoting

yn gynt. Mae'n dibynnu, efallai, ar drosglwyddiad cadarn o'r cynradd i'r uwchradd, ar lefel ail iaith, gallu hybu'r ail iaith drwy cyfnod allweddol 3, ac wedyn rhoi'r cyfle, a'r hawl efallai, i'r bobl ifanc allu mynd ymlaen i iaith gyntaf erbyn blwyddyn 11. Ac nid oes rhaid i ysgol gyfan fod yn gwneud hyn. Cyn belled bod ethos cadarnhaol tuag at y Gymraeg gan arweinyddiaeth yr ysgol, efallai bod yna garfannau o fewn ysgol a allai fanteisio ar y llwybr yna.

second language through key stage 3, and then giving the opportunity, and the right, for young people to move on to first language by year 11 if they choose to do so. And the whole school doesn't have to do this. As long as there is a positive ethos towards the Welsh language from the school leadership, then perhaps there are cohorts within schools that could take advantage of that particular route.

[92] **Bethan Jenkins**: Emyr, oes unrhyw sylwadau pellach gennych chi?

Bethan Jenkins: Emyr, do you have any further comments?

[93] **Mr E. George**: Na.

Mr E. George: No.

[94] **Bethan Jenkins**: Ocê. Diolch. Fe wnawn ni symud at ddilyniant, ac mae gan Neil Hamilton gwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We'll move on to progression, and Neil Hamilton has questions on this area.

[95] **Neil Hamilton**: Mr Pierce referred to this in passing earlier on, but I'd like to get your views on the Government's stated objective to improve the rate of progression between the different phases of education, and then moving on from school into the workplace, and whether you think there are sufficient opportunities for adults to learn the language—that's a separate question.

[96] **Mr Pierce**: I think progression is one of the almost understated themes, in that we look at data to do with achievement at individual stages, but we probably don't spend enough time looking at the longitudinal data, although increasingly it has become possible to do so. Within our organisation, the WJEC, we spend a lot of time, for example, looking at progression from GCSEs to A-levels, and I think we could broaden that, especially with joint working with the regulator we now have in Wales, Qualifications Wales, to look at that more widely, and even to link with Estyn, to see what evidence there is about interventions, which link to best achievement in terms of progression.

[97] I think on your point about Welsh for adults, the WJEC has been very active in promoting Welsh for adults, both in terms of resources for tutors, and also assessments. I think it's at an important stage at the moment, with the new administrative infrastructure that's been set up in Wales, but I think it's almost a case of it needed to come out of a trough. There's almost a short-term trough, I think, in terms of momentum behind Welsh for adults, and we need to come out of that quickly, with a lot of emphasis on the role of employers, I believe, and also on a greater variety of means of learning, including, in particular, online means of learning, and blending that with tutor support, which obviously requires the workforce plan to support that.

[98] I think it's an interesting question around what incentives are there for employers to release staff for intensive periods of learning. We've got experience of doing that in WJEC. One of the issues, of course, when you do that, is how you retain those staff. Having given that intensive opportunity to learn, that becomes a skill that they can take elsewhere, and that's happened in a couple of cases with us. We also have a range of hourly or two-hourly release programmes available for staff, but that comes at a cost to the employer. We're keen to do it, but perhaps there is a question about possible incentives for employers in Wales in general.

[99] **Neil Hamilton**: I suppose where there is a commercial payback—. So, if you've got a lot of potential clients or customers, whatever the nature of your business is, who are fluent Welsh speakers, and you need to be able to communicate with them in their own preferred language, then there's an obvious—. But, for businesses that don't have a great deal of commercial incentive, what can we do there to encourage them to make a small sacrifice for a greater gain?

[100] **Mr Pierce**: Well, from our point of view, the obvious thing for me, in the organisation I work with, is whenever we've got a member of staff working with customers—schools and colleges—in Wales, any individual that can't work bilingually creates an extra cost somewhere else in the organisation, because we end up translating, or having to provide some other human resource to work in that situation. So, it's an obvious one for an organisation working in Wales, I think. The more staff that can work bilingually, it cuts out costs elsewhere in that same organisation.

[101] **Neil Hamilton**: The next question is a related one in terms of progression, in a sense, because we've been looking at the extent of joint

working between the HE and FE sectors and early years and also between statutory education employers in developing the number of Welsh speakers or in improving people's standards. I wonder if you've collectively got a view on that—to what extent we can encourage greater co-operation or to what extent you think it exists or is inadequate at the minute.

[102] **Mr E. George**: I wonder whether this relates perhaps to this idea of moving towards statutory education founded upon a single language continuum—a continuum of progression and language acquisition and proficiency. I think that it's a very powerful concept, because it gets to the heart of this question of progression—of progress and of motivation and ambition to improve. That, I think, can be as narrow and as broad as you like, really. Depending on exactly how it's implemented, you could conceive something that runs all the way from foundation—from cradle to grave, in fact. It would be a great tool in order to support constructive discussions at any point in your journey towards fluency about the level at which you're able to operate in Welsh without it feeling like there's a two-tier system operating or that there are labels being used around being a learner because, in fact, we're all learners at some point in that journey towards proficiency.

[103] I think if we bring it back to the school environment, we need to start somewhere with it. I think this concept has been talked about a lot and what we're particularly keen on at Qualifications Wales now is to unpack that—to make it a bit more tangible and to look at the ways in which it could be articulated and to look at the implications of that for effective assessment arrangements and, indeed, consequences from a qualifications point of view, that would support those aims of continuing development and learning and celebrating successes and progress along that continuum as any learner progresses.

[104] **Neil Hamilton**: So, what steps do you think we need to take to ensure that there's progression through the different stages of education that we're not taking already?

[105] **Mr E. George**: I think at the moment, we know that there is a lack of transparency around progression between key stages, between institutions and when students move between streams, whether it be second language or first language, and you can liken it, if you like, to a difference between GCSE in English in this country and a GCSE in a modern foreign language. Both have a grade scale from A* to G and yet nobody could really tell you with any confidence how an A in French relates to a grade that you might receive in

English. I think where you have Welsh and Welsh second language, it highlights that confusion around the fact that it's one language and yet we have two grade scales and it doesn't support useful dialogue between a learner and an institution—whether that be an employer or an education institution—about where they'd like to go next in terms of their language acquisition and development. So, it is a powerful idea, but it's one that, I think, we need to demystify now and start looking to see what it would look like in reality.

[106] **Bethan Jenkins**: Mae Jeremy jest eisiau dod i mewn yn glou ac wedyn gallwn fynd nôl at Neil.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy just wants to come in quickly and then we can come back to you, Neil.

[107] **Jeremy Miles**: Ar y cwestiwn yma, rŷch chi wedi sôn am y syniad yma nad yw defnyddio label gwahanol yn ddefnyddiol. Er bod diwygio wedi bod i'r cymhwyster ei hun—Cymraeg ail iaith—pam penderfynwyd cadw'r syniad o'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith yn y cymhwyster hwn? Onid yw hwnnw ddim yn help i'r syniad yma o allu symud ar hyd continwwm yn gyffredinol, er bod diwygio wedi digwydd?

Jeremy Miles: On this question, you have mentioned the fact that the idea of using a different label isn't useful. Even though there's been reform to the qualification itself—second-language Welsh—why was it decided to keep the idea of Welsh as a second language in that qualification? Is it not the case that that does not help with moving towards a continuum in general, even though there's been reform?

[108] **Mr E. George**: Gwnaethom ni drafod hwn cryn dipyn wrth inni edrych ar y newidiadau i'r cymhwyster, a'r penderfyniad a ddaethom ni ato yn y pen draw oedd, yn y gyfundrefn bresennol, sy'n seiliedig ar y cwricwlwm presennol—lle mae yna ddwy ffrwd, os hoffech chi, neu ddwy elfen i'r rhaglen o ran Cymraeg a Chymraeg ail iaith—y byddai'n fwy tryloyw, mewn ffordd, i gydnabod mai beth rydym ni wedi'i wneud ar hyn o bryd yw gwneud gwelliannau i'r cymhwyster sydd yna'n barod, a dim wedi llwyr

Mr E. George: We discussed that a great deal as we looked at the changes to the qualification and the decision that we made ultimately was that in the current regime, which is based on the current curriculum—where there are two elements in terms of Welsh and second-language Welsh—it would be more transparent, in a way, to recognise that what we've done at the moment is to make improvements to the qualification that already existed and not totally reformed that qualification. Changes had already been made to the first-

chwyldroi neu ddiwygio'r cymhwyster yna. yna. Mi oedd newidiadau wedi cael eu gwneud eisoes i'r cymhwyster iaith gyntaf ac i'r cymwysterau iaith gyntaf ac ail iaith ar Safon Uwch, pan gawsom ein sefydlu jest dros flwyddyn yn ôl. Y cymhwyster diwethaf i gael sylw oedd TGAU ail iaith, felly, ein syniad ni oedd gwneud rhai newidiadau cyn gynted â phosibl i wella'r elfennau hynny a oedd yn ddiffygiol ac a adroddwyd arnynt yn gynhwysfawr yn adroddiad 'Un iaith i bawb', a'n bod ni'n gwneud gwelliannau o ran dilysrwydd a gwerth y cymhwyster yna ar gyfer y garfan nesaf a fydd yn cymryd y cymhwyster yna. Ond rydym ni hefyd wedi cydnabod mai cam dros dro yw'r gwelliannau hynny wrth inni barhau i weithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru ac eraill tuag at y nod yma o sefydlu cyfundrefn yn seiliedig ar un continwwm.

language qualification and to the first- and second-language qualifications at A-level, when we were established a little over a year ago. The last qualification to be addressed was the second-language GCSE, so, our idea was to make some changes as soon as possible in order to improve those elements that were deficient and had been covered in detail in the 'One language for all' report and that we made changes in terms of the validity and value of that qualification for the next cohort of students to take it. But we've also recognised that these improvements are a pro tem step as we continue to work with the Welsh Government and others towards this aim of establishing a regime based on a single continuum.

10:00

[109] Ond mae'r newid yna'n un mawr, ac nid ydym ni'n credu y byddem ni yn unig, fel corff sy'n gyfrifol am gymwysterau, wedi llwyddo i gyflawni'r trawsnewid yna drwy chwarae gyda'r cymhwyster, heb inni gyd-fynd efo rhaglen ehangach o ddiwygio'r cwricwlwm a'r newidiadau, fel yr oeddem ni'n sôn yn gynt, o ran trefniadau dangosyddion perfformiad i ysgolion ac yn y blaen. Mae yna nifer o ffactorau cymhleth sy'n rhyng-gysylltu yn y maes yma. Petaem ni

But that change is a major change, and we don't believe that we alone, as a body responsible for qualifications, could have succeeded in transforming the situation just by reforming the qualification without it being part of a broader programme of curriculum reform and the changes that I mentioned earlier in terms of performance indicators for schools and so on. There are a number of complex factors that are dovetailed in this area, and if we had just proceeded in doing something

wedi bwrw ati i drio gwneud rhywbeth mwy radical gyda'r cymhwyster ail iaith, rwy'n credu y byddem ni wedi methu, a byddai hynny wedi bod yn wrthgynhyrchiol yn y pen draw.

more radical with the Welsh second-language qualification, I think we would have failed, and that would have been counter-productive, ultimately.

[110] **Jeremy Miles**: Rwy'n gallu gweld y pwynt ehangach. Hynny yw, eich bod chi'n rhan o dirlun lot ehangach, ond byddai newid yr enw hwnnw wedi bod yn arwydd eithaf clir o agwedd newydd tuag at gaffaeliad iaith yn gyffredinol. A ydych chi'n derbyn hynny?

Jeremy Miles: I can see the broader point. That is, that you're part of a much broader landscape, but changing the name would have been quite a clear sign of a new attitude towards language acquisition in general. Would you accept that?

[111] **Mr E. George**: Rwy'n credu y byddai fe wedi gallu bod yn arwydd, ac mi wnaethom ni feddwl yn hir ynglŷn â pha deitlau eraill y medrem ni fod wedi eu defnyddio i geisio signalu'r gwahaniaeth yna. Ond, yn y pen draw, wnaethom ni ddim canfod teitl a oedd yn gwneud y job honno heb ei fod e'n awgrymu rhywbeth yn fwy na'r hyn yr oeddem ni'n ymdrechu i'w gyflawni. Felly, roeddem ni'n meddwl, yn y pen draw, byddai dewis rhyw deitl 'creadigol' efallai ychydig yn gamarweiniol ynglŷn â'r newidiadau reit ymarferol yr ydym ni am eu gwneud i drefniadau asesu'r cymhwyster yna.

Mr E. George: I think it could have been significant, and we did consider what alternative titles we could have used in order to try to convey that difference. But, ultimately, we didn't find a title that actually did that job properly without it suggesting something that was broader than what we were trying to achieve. So, I think, ultimately, choosing a 'creative' title, if you like, would have perhaps been a little misleading in terms of the very practical changes that we wanted to make to assessment arrangements for that qualification.

[112] **Jeremy Miles**: Diolch.

Jeremy Miles: Thank you.

[113] **Bethan Jenkins**: Sorry, Lee's got a question.

[114] **Lee Waters**: Sorry, I just want to probe the thinking of the potential unintended consequences of the change, because a point's been made to me by teachers. A student who would currently go for a second language

qualification and who might achieve a reasonable grade, that same pupil, if they did the new qualification, might achieve a poorer grade. Would that be a disincentive for them taking the course and entering the exam? And it may unwittingly result in fewer students making the progression.

[115] **Mr E. George**: Well, I think there are two ways of looking at, and I think one of the fundamental concerns about the current qualification is that its shortcomings are such that the grade isn't as good an indicator as it might be of an individual's ability in the Welsh language, which does both that individual and the system as a whole a disservice. So, what we've tried to do is to improve the design of the qualification and the assessment so that, in order to achieve that same grade that they might have achieved otherwise, to prepare themselves and to be taught with that grade in mind, they would need to focus more on their day-to-day speaking and listening skills, for example, their practical communication skills. So, it is measuring with a slightly different emphasis, if you like, on the skills that need to be demonstrated to achieve that grade and, in that way, it will be more valid, we hope. And so, when that student—. I don't think it's fair to say that that student is more or less likely to achieve that grade; I think they will need to prepare differently for a different exam and, in that preparation, through the changes we've made, we would hope that that preparation would serve them well beyond the exam in later life.

[116] **Lee Waters**: Well, I think that's optimistic.

[117] **Mr Pierce**: I think maybe another way of looking at this is, I think, keeping the current qualification with this grading system was almost a necessary step in the absence of the opportunity for youngsters to pursue the continuum, because, you know, you will have excellent learners of Welsh as a second language who perhaps haven't had that much contact time with the language until they're maybe well into key stage 3, and then in key stage 4 they have their GCSEs, and they're excellent achievers and they've worked hard and deserve an excellent grade, which might be an A or an A*, and they've not had a chance to pursue the continuum. Therefore, I think keeping the qualifications structure as it is in the short term is probably a necessary step in terms of fairness.

[118] **Lee Waters**: It might be at some point, but there's a danger of putting the cart before the horse at this stage, because that logic relies upon the continuum being there to progress them to the point where they're going to perform no poorer than they would now. In the absence of that continuum

being there—and it's not there—they may well be likely to perform poorer at this stage, so my question stands, which I don't think you've answered: are we likely to see fewer students entering the exam because they'd expect to achieve a poorer grade than they would have done under the second-language qualification?

[119] **Mr E. George**: So, fewer students entering the exam, I guess the question would be: what would they be entering as an alternative? No qualification, I presume, is the suggestion. I think it'll be interesting to see how the entry figures change because, simultaneous to the changes that we've made to the full course, the short course is being withdrawn in line with Welsh Government policy. So, I think, given that change, it probably is likely that the numbers entering the full course will grow compared to the numbers entering the full course currently, but there won't be a short course for others to enter. So, there probably will be an increase in the number of students not entering for any qualification or for a GCSE qualification, at least, in the Welsh language. I think that stands to reason.

[120] **Mr Rowlands**: A gaf i ddweud rhyw ychydig am ddilyniant yn gyffredinol? Rydym yn gwybod bod yna lai a lai o blant yn y system gyfredol yn mynd o un cyfnod allweddol i'r llall. Mae yna fwy yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, wedyn mae llai yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 a llai yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 a llai wedyn yn gwneud cyrsiau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Pam mae hyn yn digwydd? Mae'n gwestiwn cymhleth iawn. Fe allwn ni siarad amdano fe am yn hir. Ond, beth sydd yn sicr ac yn glir iawn ydy bod yr arfer yn wahanol mewn gwahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru.

Mr Rowlands: Just briefly, can I just mention progression more generally? We know that there are fewer children in the current system moving from one key stage to the next. There are more in the early years and then there are fewer in key stage 2 and fewer in key stage 3 and then fewer studying courses through the medium of Welsh. Why is this happening? It's a very complex question. We could discuss it at length. But, what is very clear is that practice is different in different areas of Wales.

[121] Mae yna arfer da mewn rhai ardaloedd ac arfer dim cystal mewn ardaloedd eraill. Felly, os ydych chi'n dysgu o'r arfer da, rydych yn mynd i wella'r dilyniant yma. Yr elfen gliriaf yn yr arfer da ydy arweinyddiaeth

There is good practice in some areas and not so good practice in other areas. Therefore, if you learn from good practice, you will enhance this progression. The clearest element of good practice is strong leadership at

gadarn ar lefel ysgol a lefel leol. Felly, beth bynnag rydym yn sôn amdano yn genedlaethol—rwyf wedi dweud hyn sawl gwaith—mae'n rhaid gwneud yn siŵr bod yr arweinyddiaeth yn lleol yn gryf.

the school level and the local level. So, whatever we might be talking about nationally—and I've said this a number of times—we must ensure that the local leadership is strong.

[122] Felly, pan rydym yn sôn am hyfforddiant, er enghraifft, mae'n bwysig cofio bod angen hyfforddi prif athrawon ac uwch-swyddogion achos mae'r arweiniad maen nhw'n gosod, y cynllunio manwl a'r gosod targedau maen nhw'n eu gwneud, a'r monitro o'r polisïau, mae'r holl bethau yna yn gwneud yn siŵr bod arfer da yn bodoli. Felly, mae yna bethau bach ymarferol y mae angen eu gwneud a fyddai'n gwella'r darlun. Wedyn, rydych yn mynd mewn i gylch positif o bethau yn gwella drwy ddysgu arfer da o'n gilydd.

So, when we talk about training, for example, it's important to bear in mind that we need to train headteachers and senior officials because the guidance that they provide, and the detailed planning and target setting that they undertake, and the monitoring of policies, all of these things do ensure that good practice exists. Therefore, there are small practical things that we need to do that would improve the picture. Then, you get into a virtuous circle of improvement by learning from good practice.

[123] **Bethan Jenkins**: Neil, did you have anything to come back on there?

[124] **Neil Hamilton**: Yes, I just wanted to follow up on the questions from Lee and Jeremy. To what extend do you think that, given the nature of this change in the second-language qualification, you've got the infrastructure and resource necessary to cope with the different method of imparting the language skills that children need to learn?

[125] **Mr E. George**: O'r ymgynghoriad y gwnaethom ni yn gynt eleni, rydym yn gwybod y bydd y newidiadau yma yn heriol i rai ysgolion, yn sicr i'r rheini sy'n dilyn y cwrs byr, yn gyfan gwbl neu'r rhan fwyaf, ar hyn o bryd. Yn ystod y ddeufis diwethaf, yn ogystal ag adolygu'r fanyldeb ddrafft fel rhan o'r broses gymeradwyo, rydym hefyd

Mr E. George: From the consultation that we conducted earlier this year, we know that these changes will be challenging for some schools, certainly those that are following the short course, completely or mainly, at the moment. During the last two months, as well as reviewing the draft specification as part of the approval process, we've also been

wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru ac eraill yn ystyried beth fydd yr anghenion o ran y cymorth y bydd angen ei gynnig i ysgolion i baratoi at y cymhwyster newydd. Fe fyddwn ni'n cyhoeddi, yn y dyddiau nesaf, gwybodaeth ar ein gwefan ni ar gyfer ysgolion i'w helpu nhw i ddeall beth yw'r disgwyliadau ohonyn nhw yng nghyd-destun y newidiadau i'r cymhwyster. Fe fydd honno'n ddogfen y byddwn wedi'i drafftio ar y cyd gyda Llywodraeth Cymru, gydag Estyn, gyda CBAC, fel ein bod ni'n rhoi yr un neges gyson ynglŷn ag yn union beth fydd y newidiadau, a hefyd beth fydd y goblygiadau ar gyfer addysgu ar lawr dosbarth.

working with the Welsh Government and others on considering what assistance will need to be offered to schools to prepare for the new qualification. We will be announcing, in the next few days, information on our website for schools to assist them to understand what the expectations are in terms of the changes to the qualification. That will be a document that we will have drafted jointly with Welsh Government, Estyn and WJEC, so that we give that same consistent message in terms of what exactly the changes will be, and also what the implications will be for teaching in the classroom.

[126] Ym mis Ionawr, fe fyddwn ni, Cymwysterau Cymru, yn cynnal cyfres o gyfarfodydd ar draws y wlad, yn yr hwyrnos, ar gyfer athrawon ac aelodau o dimau arwain ysgolion. Bydd y rheini'n digwydd ym mis Ionawr, ac eto fe fyddwn ni yna yn rhannu llwyfan gyda'n cydweithwyr o CBAC, ac o Lywodraeth Cymru efo'r consortia rhanbarthol, ac fe fyddwn ni yna i drafod gydag ysgolion beth fydd y goblygiadau iddyn nhw ym mis Medi nesaf, ac yn y dyfodol hwy, wrth iddyn nhw gynllunio ac amserlennu ar gyfer newid eu darpariaeth nhw, os ydyn nhw'n mynd i symud tuag at ddarparu'r cwrs llawn, lle gynt roedden nhw'n cynnig y cwrs byr.

In January, Qualifications Wales will be holding a series of meetings across the country, in the evenings, for teachers and for school leadership teams. Those will happen in January, and again we will be sharing a platform with colleagues from the WJEC, the Welsh Government, and the regional consortia, and we will be there to discuss with schools what the implications will be for them next September, and in the future, as they plan and timetable a change in their provision, if they are going to move towards providing the full course, where, previously, they were offering the short course.

[127] Un o'r newidiadau rydym ni

One of the changes that we have

wedi ei wneud—mae'n un manwl, ond yn un pwysig—wrth ddiwygio yw pwysleisio—. Wel, nid yw'n newid, ond mae mwy o bwyslais ar y nifer o oriau o ddysgu dan arweiniad rydym ni'n awgrymu y dylid eu neilltuo ar gyfer paratoi disgyblion ar gyfer y cwrs newydd, sef yr un sy'n gyfwerth ag unrhyw gwrs llawn TGAU arall—120 o oriau dysgu dan arweiniad. Nawr, rydym yn gwybod, drwy'r gweithgaredd ymgynghori rydym wedi ei wneud eisoes, fod yna nifer o ysgolion sydd ddim yn cynnig unrhyw beth tebyg i hynny ar draws y ddwy flynedd. Felly, mae yna newidiadau a fydd angen eu gwneud o fewn ysgolion, os ydyn nhw am roi'r cyfle i'w disgyblion nhw i gael dilyn y cwrs llawn, lle efallai o fewn rhai ysgolion nid oedd yna gyfle o gwbl iddyn nhw i wneud hynny.

introduced—it's a detailed one, but an important one—as we change is emphasising—. Well, it isn't a change, but there is more emphasis on the number of guided learning hours that we suggest should be available for preparing pupils for the new course, namely the one that corresponds to any other full GCSE—120 hours of guided learning. Now, we know, through the consultative activities that we have already done, that a number of schools do not offer anything like that over the two years. So, there are changes that need to be introduced in schools, if they are to offer this opportunity for pupils to follow the full course, where perhaps, in some schools, there wasn't an opportunity at all for them to do that.

[128] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Mae jest gennym ni gwestiwn clou gan Dai Lloyd ynglŷn ag integreiddio. Diolch, Dai.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We just have a brief question from Dai Lloyd on integration. Thank you, Dai.

[129] **Dai Lloyd**: Wel, clou iawn achos, yn sylfaenol, rydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn yma eisoes ynglŷn ag, oes, mae gennym ni weledigaeth cenedlaethol a strategaethau lleol, sy'n amrywio, fel rydych wedi'i ddweud sawl tro, ac rwy'n cytuno â hynny 100 y cant. Rydym yn sôn am her sylweddol yn y fan hyn i gyrraedd 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn hanner ffordd drwy'r ganrif yma. Oes, mae eisiau buddsoddi yn yr is-adeiledd, os gallaf i ddefnyddio'r

Dai Lloyd: Well, very brief, because, fundamentally, you have answered this question already, that, yes, we have a national vision and we have local strategies that vary, as you've mentioned a number of times, and I agree with that 100 per cent. We are talking about a significant challenge here in reaching 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. Yes, we need to invest in the infrastructure, if I could use that phrase. Of course, we also must bear in mind that we need the

ymadrodd yna. Wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid i ni gofio bod angen i'r Llywodraeth, a phawb yn y maes, i fod yn ysbrydoli ein pobl i fynd amdani. Rydym wedi clywed gan dystion eraill taw antur cyffrous dylai hyn fod, nid pryderu beth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd os na, ac ati, a'r math yna o bryderon anffodus weithiau.

Government, and everyone working in this area, to be inspiring people to go for it. We've heard from other witnesses that this should be an exciting adventure and that we shouldn't be constantly worried about what will happen if, and so on, and those kinds of concerns that can be unfortunate sometimes.

[130] A'r cwestiwn felly: mewn cyd-destun agweddau pobl ein gwlad, mae yna nifer fawr sydd ag agweddau positif tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg, yn naturiol. Ac wrth gwrs, o gofio am y targed yma o 1 miliwn o siaradwyr, ychydig dros ganrif yn ôl roedd gennym ni 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg bryd hynny, felly rydym yn sôn am ad-ennill y tir ar yr antur gyffrous yma y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi'i chyhoeddi, ac rydym i gyd yn cefnogi hynny, ond mae angen pobl yn y maes i fod yn ysbrydoli. Ac felly, fel rhywun sydd wedi bod yn ymgyrchu am ragor o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ers dros genhedlaeth rŵan, rwy'n ymwybodol iawn nad oes gan bawb yr un agwedd bositif tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg. Felly, a allwch chi olrhain yn fyr, yn nhermau'r amser, beth y gallwn ni ei wneud i drio newid agweddau rhai pobl, a beth ydych chi'n gweld fel eich rôl chi? Mae yna ragfarnau yn y maes. Mae pobl wastad yn chwilio am ffeithiau, ond nid oes braidd byth digon o ffeithiau i gyfiawnhau dim byd mewn unrhyw faes, nid jest addysg, ond gwyddoniaeth a phob math o bethau. Rydym yn rhedeg y

And the question, therefore: in the context of the attitudes of people in our nation, many have very positive attitudes towards the Welsh language, naturally. And, given this target of 1 million Welsh speakers, a little over a century ago, we had 1 million Welsh speakers, so we are talking about regaining ground here on this exciting journey that the Labour Government has announced, and we all support that, but everyone working in this area needs to be inspired and inspiring. And, so, as someone who's been campaigning for more Welsh-medium schools for over a generation now, I am very aware that not everyone has that same positive attitude towards the Welsh language. So, can you tell us briefly, given the time, what we can do to try and change some people's attitudes, and what you see as your role? There are some prejudices in this area. People are always looking for facts, but there are hardly ever enough facts to justify anything in any area, not just education, but science, and all sorts of things. We're running the world on the basis of various positive or negative

byd ar sail gwahanol ragfarnau positif neu negyddol. Sut ydym yn mynd i fynd i'r afael â hynny, ydych chi'n meddwl, ar y mater yma o fynd ar yr antur gyffrous yma a'r angen i ysbrydoli ein pobl?

prejudices. So, how are we going to deal with that, do you think, and with this issue of going on this exciting journey, and the need to inspire our people?

[131] **Bethan Jenkins**: Mae munud o amser gyda chi. [*Chwerthin*.]

Bethan Jenkins: You have one minute. [*Laughter*.]

[132] Quick fire. [*Laughter*.]

[133] **Mr Rowlands**: O fewn y sector addysg, fel y dywedais i o'r blaen, rwy'n meddwl taw cwestiwn o arweinyddiaeth yw hynny, ac rwy'n credu bod arweinyddiaeth yn hollol ganolog i nifer o bethau rydym yn eu gwneud o fewn addysg. Felly, rwy'n falch iawn o glywed y bwriad i sefydlu academi arweinyddiaeth o fewn y sector addysg, ac rwy'n meddwl bod dealltwriaeth o bwysigrwydd diwylliant, hanes a'r iaith Gymraeg yn mynd i fod yn bart canolog o'r hyfforddiant yna i arweinwyr addysg Cymru.

Mr Rowlands: Within the education sector, as I said previously, I think it's a question of leadership, and I think that leadership is central to a number of things that we're doing within education. Therefore, I'm very pleased to hear of the intention to establish a leadership academy within the education sector, and I think that an understanding of the importance of history, culture and the Welsh language is going to be a central part of that training for education leaders in Wales.

[134] **Mr Pierce**: Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig meddwl am ba sefydliadau sy'n ddylanwadol. Yn y cyfnod pan oedd ysgolion Cymraeg yn ffactor bwysig, roedd Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg, roedd CYDAG ac roedd yna rai awdurdodau lleol. Rydw i'n credu, yn y byd sydd ohoni nawr, mae cynifer o'r ysgolion a'r colegau lle mae'r datblygiad yma'n mynd i fod yn bwysig, yr arweinyddion yw pobl ASCL, cymdeithas y prifathrawon, a ColegauCymru. Rydw

Mr Pierce: I think it's important that we consider what organisations and institutions are influential here. In a period where Welsh-medium schools were an important factor, you had RHaG, CYDAG and you had certain local authorities. I think in the current climate, there are so many schools and colleges where this development is going to be important, the leaders are the Association of School and College Leaders and ColegauCymru. I think

i'n credu bydd dylanwad posibl gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, os yw e'n cael briff nawr ar gyfer y sector addysg bellach. Felly, mae angen pencampwyr ymhlith y cyrff yna sy'n arwain, ac yn sicr o ran CBAC, gan ein bod ni'n gwasanaethu trwy'r cwricwlwm trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r cyfrwng Saesneg, rydym ni'n naturiol yn gweld ein hunain fel partner posibl ar gyfer hybu delwedd y Gymraeg.

there may be possible influence from the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, if it has a brief now for the FE sector. So, we need champions in those organisations who could lead on this, and certainly in terms of the WJEC, as we do serve through the Welsh-medium and English-medium curriculums, we naturally see ourselves as a possible partner for improving the image of the Welsh language.

10:15

[135] **Mr E. George**: Yn gyflym iawn, rwy'n meddwl mai'r peth i gadw golwg arno hefyd yw ein pobl ifanc ni. Pan fuom ni'n gwneud ymarferion ymgynghori ynglŷn â Chymraeg ail iaith yn benodol yn ystod yr haf ac yn gynt, beth glywsom ni dro ar ôl tro oedd bod yna awch a bod yna frwdfrydedd i gaffael ac i ddysgu iaith a beth oedden nhw'n moyn oedd trefniadau a oedd yn golygu y bydden nhw'n medru defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn hyderus yn eu bywyd bob dydd. Roedden nhw'n teimlo efallai nad oedd hynny'n digwydd ar y foment.

Mr E. George: Very quickly, what we need to look at as well is our young people. When we were conducting consultation exercises in terms of Welsh as a second language during the summer and earlier, what we heard time after time was that there was a desire and enthusiasm to acquire the language and to learn the language, and what they wanted were the arrangements that would make it possible for them to use the Welsh language in a confident manner in their everyday life. Perhaps they felt that that wasn't happening at the moment.

[136] **Dai Lloyd**: Diolch yn fawr.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you.

[137] **Bethan Jenkins**: Fe wnaethom ni hefyd ddysgu gan ddisgyblion yr wythnos diwethaf bethau hollol wahanol, a oedd yn dangos eu bod nhw'n frwdfrydig i ddysgu Ffrangeg ac Almaeneg, neu unrhyw iaith arall, heblaw am y Gymraeg, ac roedd

Bethan Jenkins: We also heard from some pupils last week things that were entirely contrary to that, which showed that they were very enthusiastic to learn French, German, or any other language, apart from Welsh, and that was quite sobering to

hynny'n eithaf difrifol i glywed mewn ardal fel Abertawe y mae nifer ohonom ni'n cynrychioli. Felly, mae lot o newid rydym ni angen ei wneud er mwyn ceisio sefydlu'r Gymraeg fel rhywbeth sydd yn cael yr un fath o hygrededd â chyrsiau eraill ar draws y galwedigaethau yma yng Nghymru.

hear in an area such as Swansea, which many of us represent. So, there's a great deal of change that we need if we are to establish the Welsh language as a course that has the same credibility as other qualifications across Wales.

[138] **Mr Pierce**: Cytuno'n llwyr a bod y Gymraeg yn iaith yn y byd digidol. Mae hynny'n un o chwech ffactor sy'n cael eu crybwyll gan Huw Thomas yng ngwaith Crystal—15 mlynedd yn ôl yr ysgrifennodd Crystal am hynny. Mae hynny hyd yn oed yn fwy pwysig nawr. Rwy'n credu bod y Gymraeg fel iaith yn y byd digidol ymhlith un o'r pethau pwysicaf er mwyn cadw diddordeb y bobl ifanc.

Mr Pierce: I entirely agree, and it's a matter of the Welsh language in the digital sector. It's one of the six factors that are mentioned by Huw Thomas's in terms of Crystal's work. He wrote about that 15 years ago, and that's even more important now. I think the Welsh language as a language of digital communication is one of the most important things in terms of retaining the interest of young people.

[139] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi i gyd am ddod heddiw, ac rwy'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n cymryd diddordeb yn yr hyn sydd yn digwydd gyda'r ymchwiliad. Byddwn ni'n gallu anfon yr hyn rydych chi wedi ei ddweud atoch chi i chi weld y trafodaethau. Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich amser heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you all very much for coming this morning. I'm sure you'll be interested in what happens with our inquiry. We will send a transcript of your comments this morning to you. So, thank you for your time this morning.

[140] We'll have a tiny, tiny break then.

Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:17 a 10:22.
The meeting adjourned between 10:17 and 10:22.

Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 7
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 7

[141] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr. Rydym yn symud ymlaen at eitem 3 ar yr agenda, ac mae Sarah McCarty, cyfarwyddwr dysgu a datblygu'r gweithlu, Cyngor Gofal Cymru, yma heddiw, a Gemma Halliday, rheolwr datblygu'r gweithlu, Cyngor Gofal Cymru. Diolch i chi'ch dwy am ddod i mewn heddiw. Rydym ni'n cario ymlaen gyda'r trafodaethau ar strategaeth y Gymraeg y Llywodraeth, a'ch barn gychwynnol chi, yng nghyd-destun—. Ydych chi'n credu bod y targed o 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050 yn realistig a sut fydd angen i chi wneud newidiadau ymarferol i geisio cyrraedd y targed hynny fel sefydliad? Diolch yn fawr iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We move on to item 3 on our agenda, and Sarah McCarty, director of workforce learning and development for the Care Council for Wales is joining us, along with Gemma Halliday, the workforce development manager for the Care Council for Wales. So, thank you both for your attendance this morning. We will continue with our inquiry into the Welsh Government's Welsh language strategy and your initial views, in terms of the context—. Is the target of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 realistic and how will you need to make practical changes in order to try to achieve that target as an institution? Thank you very much.

[142] **Ms McCarty**: I think we'd really welcome the ambition for 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. So, in terms of the overall approach, in terms of both having that challenging target but in terms of thinking of the Welsh language as a natural part of everyday life, which I think is also an important part you wouldn't want to lose—. So, it's not just the target, it's the overall notion of the cultural embedding of that in our day-to-day activity and lives and well-being within Wales.

[143] So, with that sort of context, there are a number of things that we would want, and I think we can do, to try and help support that, recognising that we're not responsible for the teaching and education professionals, whom I know you've been scrutinising already this morning and in previous sessions. So, the work that we've undertaken to try and support the social care sector to think about how they embed day-to-day in their practice support for some of the most vulnerable individuals within our communities,

and how to make active use of the Welsh language and supporting 'Mwy na Geiriau', the Social Services and well-being (Wales) Act 2014 and making that cultural difference, so that when you sign up to be a social care worker, and as part of the code of practice, you make that commitment to be responsive to individuals' Welsh language or any language requirements and needs.

[144] So, by embedding it from the beginning in individuals' careers, our hope would be that you'd get that momentum, then, behind the language. We have undertaken specific initiatives, particularly with social workers, in trying to increase, in terms of the evidence we submitted to you already, to make sure there's dedicated support for social workers to undertake their practice, both through the medium of Welsh and also in relation to awareness raising. So, there are some specific areas that we can take, but, overall, if we can increase the number of individuals who are speaking Welsh in Wales, that should help the social care sector recruit more individuals who are able to speak Welsh and therefore respond more appropriately to individuals within communities who need care and support.

[145] **Bethan Jenkins**: Gemma, do you have anything to add?

[146] **Ms Halliday**: Jest i ychwanegu at beth mae Sarah wedi dweud yn barod, mae o am ddiwylliant yn y maes hwnnw, a jest gwneud yn sicr bod egwyddorion 'Mwy na Geiriau' yn ein hymarfer cyffredinol ni, a bod y sector yma yn hyrwyddo'r iaith hefyd, a phwysigrwydd hynny o fewn y Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Llesiant (Cymru) 2014, a'r ffaith bod hynny yn sbïo ar ofal o amgylch yr unigolyn, a bod y cynnig rhagweithiol yn ymestyn tuag at hynny hefyd, a'n bod ni'n gweithio mewn partneriaeth efo'r sector i ddatblygu hynny. Rydym ni wedi datblygu ambell i adnodd ynglŷn â hynny hefyd i gefnogi'r sector yn y maes hwnnw.

Ms Halliday: Just to add to Sarah's comments, it's about culture in that area and ensuring that the attitudes conveyed in 'Mwy na Geiriau' are actually conveyed in our general activities, and that this sector promotes the language, too, and the importance of that within the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Act 2014, and the fact that it looks at individual-centred care, and that the active offer does extend to that, and that we work in partnership with the sector to develop that. We've developed some resources in order to support the sector in that area also.

[147] **Bethan Jenkins**: Mae gan

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy has some

Jeremy gwestiynau ynglŷn â darpariaeth yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Diolch.

questions on early years provision.

[148] **Jeremy Miles**: O safbwynt y blynyddoedd cynnar yn benodol, beth fuasech chi'n dweud yw'r prif sialensiau a rhwystredigaethau i ymhelaethu'r ddarpariaeth yn gyffredinol drwy'r Gymraeg?

Jeremy Miles: From the point of view of early years specifically, what would you say are the main challenges and barriers in terms of enhancing Welsh-medium provision more generally?

[149] **Ms McCarty**: So, if I take this, generally, in terms of the challenges for early years, at the moment we don't regulate early years professionals and workers. Whereas I could give you a current picture around social workers and some of the individuals we do register, we don't register early years professionals. But we have done quite a lot of work in terms of supporting educational training and development. So, some of the challenges—I think a diverse workforce, because some of the individuals who are coming in to join those settings—. It's not routine. Individuals don't leave school and then come to work in early years settings. They may well be returning or taking this up as a second, or longer-term or different career, having come from different areas.

[150] Some of the barriers in terms of people working part time, so, when we're looking at their educational training and development, how do we make that responsive to individuals' needs, so that they can be training and developing in a way that supports them, and perhaps family and other types of commitment? Then within that, in terms of then training through the medium of Welsh in order to be able to be able to deliver Welsh-medium early years provision, there are some challenges, I think, in relation to the work-based learning groups and the availability of people to learn through the medium of Welsh, through their professional development through childcare learning and development, qualifications, and the recent Qualifications Wales review on health and social care and childcare qualifications indicated some challenges in those areas for individuals as well.

[151] **Ms Halliday**: Os caf i ychwanegu, rydym ni wedi bod yn rhan o'r tîm sydd wedi bod yn sbïo ar y cymwysterau newydd gyda

Ms Halliday: If I could just add that we have been part of the team looking at the new qualifications with Qualifications Wales, so we have been

Qualifications Wales, felly rydym ni wedi bod yn rhan o'r tîm sy'n ailysgrifennu hynny ar y cyd efo'r sector. Mae'r gwaith yna yn mynd allan i ymgynghori yn y flwyddyn newydd, fis Ionawr, felly, i gael agwedd y sector ynglŷn â hynny. O ran egwyddorion yr iaith Gymraeg, mae hynny yna yng nghynnwys craidd y cymwysterau newydd, fel rhywbeth pwysig i'r sector honno wrth symud ymlaen yn y dyfodol.

part of the team redrafting that along with the sector. That work is going out to consultation in the new year, in January, and we want to hear the sector's views on that. In terms of Welsh-language issues, that is included in the core element of the new qualifications, as something that is important in the sector in moving forward to the future.

[152] Rydw i jest yn teimlo hefyd ein bod ni wedi paratoi ambell adnodd i gefnogi'r sector honno. Mae gennym ni'r adnodd datblygu sgiliau Cymraeg yn y gweithlu—adnodd rydym ni wedi ei baratoi ar gyfer sbïo ar beth sydd yna'n barod o ran staff, a sut fedrwch chi ddatblygu'r sgiliau iaith Gymraeg efo'r staff sydd gennych chi yn barod, a'i weld yn fwy fel *asset model* yn hytrach na chael *barriers* tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg—gweld beth sydd gennyt ti'n barod, a sbïo ar hynny fel math o sgil ar gyfer y gweithlu, jest i drio hybu'r iaith o ran hynny, hybu'r iaith efo plant a phobl ifanc.

I also feel that we have prepared some resources to support the sector. We have the Welsh-language skills development in the workforce resource in order to look at what already exists in terms of staff, and how you can develop those Welsh-language skills among the existing workforce, seeing it more as an asset model rather than there being barriers in terms of the Welsh language. We look at what we already have, and then look at that as a useful skill for the workforce, to encourage the use of the Welsh language and encourage the use of the Welsh language with children and young people.

[153] Hefyd, mae gennym raddau yn ymwneud efo'r blynyddoedd cynnar dros Gymru—dau o'r rheini ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu cynnal trwy'r iaith Gymraeg, ond mae'r agweddau i gyd o fewn y graddau hynny, ac mae'r diwylliant yna o ran y graddau yna hefyd. Felly, nid jest y ffaith eich bod yn gallu siarad Cymraeg, ond bod y

We also have degrees related to early years. Two of those are currently held through the medium of Welsh, but there are aspects within all of those programmes that cover the culture, and the culture is in place in terms of those degrees. It's not just the fact that you can speak Welsh, but that the culture and understanding and

diwylliant yna hefyd, a'r ddealltwriaeth o hynny hefyd i'r sector.

awareness is enhanced in the sector.

[154] **Jeremy Miles**: Diolch. Mae pobl eraill yn mynd i ofyn cwestiynau i chi ar y cwestiwn o *upskilling* a chynyddu sgiliau o fewn y gweithlu, ond o ran denu pobl sy'n medru'r Gymraeg i'r sector i weithio, a oes gennych chi syniad ynghylch beth yw'r ffyrdd gorau o allu gwneud y sector yn ddeniadol, i ddenu pobl i mewn iddo fe, yng nghyd-destun y gallu i siarad Cymraeg?

Jeremy Miles: Thank you. Others are going to ask you questions on the issue of upskilling within the workforce, but in terms of attracting Welsh speakers into the sector, do you have ideas as to the best ways of doing that and making the sector an attractive one for Welsh speakers?

10:30

[155] **Ms McCarty**: I think we'd want to make it an attractive sector for everyone, and it follows then, as part of that, obviously, for Welsh speakers, about how to respond to the needs of children and of parents in terms of making choices for supporting their children. We've done a lot of work in the past in terms of trying to attract individuals to consider a career—not just a job—within both early years and the social care settings, recognising that there are some challenges; they're not always the best, well-remunerated positions. A number of individuals may be working unsociable hours in certain settings to respond to the needs of individuals that are using services. In terms of ways we've tried to address that, and where we've had some positive experiences, we've developed and run schemes called Care Ambassadors where you've got individuals who are working within settings—and that would include within Welsh-medium provision—who would then go out to schools, colleges, job centres and other settings and talk about the reality of a job in the sector, what they feel has been really valuable, and how their training and development has been supported. What we've found is that individuals who have that experience and who have worked in the sector are able to give a much more powerful and more compelling reason for individuals to consider a career in the sector than perhaps those of us that aren't currently working in jobs in the sector could. So, that's been quite an important initiative for us, and it will be one that we'll continue to review, progress and develop to think about how we support those ambassadors because, obviously, they're still in active employment.

[156] We've also undertaken work, and we've got another resource, which is called 'A Question of Care', where individuals can undertake a number of different scenarios. It gives you a real and true experience of what work in the sector is really like. Because when we've done previous research, we've found out that sometimes individuals want a role in a sector they don't really understand what it's about. So, perhaps they think that early years is about just playing with children all day long, as opposed to perhaps a more structured approach. Obviously, play is important—I don't want to underestimate that—but it's part of a wider approach to supporting children and young people.

[157] So, by developing scenarios, people can watch videos, and then there's a values-based assessment as to whether they've got the appropriate values to come and work in the sector. By giving people more enhanced information about what it's truly like to have a role in the sector, we can both promote coming into the sector to secure a job and a career, but also we can give them actual understanding. So, therefore, we shouldn't see higher turnover because individuals coming into the sector have a good understanding of what's going to be expected of them.

[158] **Jeremy Miles**: Can I ask you what your feeling is about the role, or the potential impacts, I guess, of the Government's policy on childcare in terms of the 30 hours? What do you feel the potential that has to support the Government's Welsh language strategy?

[159] **Ms McCarty**: Yes. There are some real opportunities, I think, because, actually, if we're moving to having the 30-hours offer, then there's that opportunity for parents to be thinking about what's the best route for them to gain the support they need for their child to enable them to work or other choices they're making. We know, as part of that, we're going to have to be thinking with other partners about what the workforce projections need to look like. So, where are we now? What's the workforce that we've got? We would expect that 30-hours offer to increase the number of both settings and hours that would need to be provided. So, therefore, what's the workforce need that will respond to that at potentially different levels in terms of management and other settings? So, then, as part of the upskilling that will need to happen to deliver the 30-hours offer, we'd see Welsh language as critical and embedded within that, both in terms of the delivery of the settings themselves, but also in terms of what I mentioned earlier—that culture or the value of the awareness in terms of the language.

[160] **Jeremy Miles**: But to ensure that the proportion of practitioners who are employed in the sector in the context of expanded level of provision doesn't fall back from where we are now, the task to recruit (a) more practitioners, and more Welsh language practitioners, within that cohort is quite a substantial task, isn't it?

[161] **Ms McCarty**: It is, yes. I think, potentially—. We don't know the exact figures, but we would expect there to be that increase and, I suspect, at all levels; so, from degree level through to other forms of entry into a career in the sector. So, we need to think quite carefully, and we'd want to work with Welsh Government to think about the 10-year workforce plan and what needs to be within that in order to give the stability and sustainability to settings.

[162] **Jeremy Miles**: Do you feel there's enough focus on the early years generally in the Government strategy for Welsh language?

[163] **Ms McCarty**: The Welsh language? It's clearly there, I think, within the continuum and the importance of starting out in the early years. So, for me, the references there were quite strong, because it gives us that ability to move forward and because that bit—in terms of what I said in terms of opening the culture and embedding it in our day to day life in Wales—I think is important.

[164] **Ms Halliday**: Os medraf i jest ychwanegu at hynny, nid wyf i'n siŵr os ydych chi yn ymwybodol ond mae Cwlwm, sef partneriaeth o bum sefydliad gofal plant yng Nghymru—Mudiad Meithrin, PACEY Cymru, Clybiau Plant Cymru, NDNA a Wales Pre-school Providers Association—wedi dod at ei gilydd fel Cwlwm, ac maen nhw wedi bod wrthi yn gwneud *workforce survey* ar draws Cymru, gan gynnwys faint o siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd gennym ni. Felly, rydym ni'n disgwyl y data yna unrhyw ddiwrnod rŵan. Rydw i'n meddwl y bydd hynny yn rhoi *baseline* da i ni

Ms Halliday: If I could just add to that, I'm not sure whether you're aware that there is Cwlwm, which is a partnership of five childcare organisations in Wales—the Mudiad Meithrin, PACEY Cymru, Kids' Clubs Wales, NDNA and Wales Pre-school Providers Association—which have come together as Cwlwm, and they've been conducting a survey across Wales, including how many Welsh speakers we have. So, we're expecting those data any day now. I think that will provide us with a good baseline for us to see what we've got now, and maybe ways we can support

weld beth sydd gennym ni ar hyn o bryd, ac efallai ffordd y medrwn ni gefnogi ein partneriaid i symud ymlaen efo'r gwaith yna. O fewn y cyngor gofal, mae gennym ni bartneriaeth a rhwydwaith blynyddoedd cynnar, felly rydym ni'n dod at ein gilydd efo'r sefydliadau yna a Llywodraeth Cymru. Rydym ni'n cael trafodaeth ar sut y medrwn ni ymestyn a chefnogi'r sector hwnnw, gan gynnwys y pethau mae Sarah wedi eu trafod yn barod. Felly, mae yna sialensau, yn amlwg, ond rydym ni'n gweithio efo'n gilydd fel partneriaid i helpu hynny. Rydw i'n gwybod bod Mudiad Meithrin yn gefnogol iawn o ran hynny efo'u gwaith Cam wrth Gam. O ran y cymwysterau newydd hefyd, rydym ni'n dechrau sbïo ar weithlu i'r dyfodol sydd efo'r sgiliau yna, a'u bod nhw'n deall pwysigrwydd y diwylliant o ran hynny.

our partners to move forward with that work. Within the care council, we have a partnership and a network for early years, and so we come together with those organisations and Welsh Government. We have discussions on how we can expand and support that sector, including the things that Sarah's discussed already. So, there are challenges, of course, but, in working together as partners, we can assist with that. I know that the Mudiad Meithrin is very supportive in terms of that with their Cam wrth Gam work. In terms of the new qualifications as well, we're starting to look at a workforce for the future that has those skills, and that they understand the importance of the culture in terms of that.

[165] **Jeremy Miles**: Diolch yn fawr.

Jeremy Miles: Thank you.

[166] **Bethan Jenkins**: A oes modd i chi ddanfon canlyniadau'r holiaduron hynny i ni fel pwyllgor?

Bethan Jenkins: Could you send the results of that survey to the committee?

[167] **Ms Halliday**: Mi fedraf.

Ms Halliday: I'll do so, yes.

[168] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr. Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen at uwchsgilio ymarferwyr, a Hannah sydd yn gofyn y cwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We're now moving on to upskilling practitioners, and Hannah's going to lead on this.

[169] **Hannah Blythyn**: Diolch, Chair. We've already spoken about the need to attract people into social care, particularly in early years, in terms of to teach them to be able to practice in the medium of Welsh if we're going to

meet the ambitious aim of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, if we've got to start by looking at how we upskill those currently practising. Can I ask first of all what you would see are the opportunities currently available within the sector, particularly early years, to upskill? And what more needs to be done to actually allow that provision to upskill?

[170] **Ms McCarty**: At the moment, I think there's a variety of elements to think about upskilling. Some of the resources, and Gemma mentioned them earlier, where we've looked at what skills are already within the workplace—. Through some of the work we've done in co-production with the sector, there's been feedback that sometimes individuals do have Welsh language skills, but they don't necessarily have the confidence to use them within the workplace. So, we need to build that confidence in, and, to enable that to happen, there's a responsibility, I think, for employers in terms of setting the culture and environment in which individuals can feel confident in terms of using what Welsh language skills they've already got, as well as then signposting and supporting individuals to build upon their skills.

[171] So, at the moment, we know from the current range of professions that we currently register what number of individuals are fluent, and what number of individuals have some Welsh skills. We don't go further than that. But that does enable us then to think about those that are in the 'some Welsh skills'—are there are abilities to upskill and to grow their language needs further. Because as much as we can—. You've looked quite extensively already at the education system and the importance around work-based learning. Those who can be learning as adults—I think it's also important to continue to build and enhance individual skills, particularly where they might already have them. It's not going to necessarily be, for all, learning from scratch.

[172] I think the other thing you have acknowledged is that, particularly when you're working with vulnerable individuals and families, sometimes a small amount of Welsh can make a huge difference to that individual's well-being. So, we don't want to underestimate that all of us having a small amount of knowledge is also very important. We've found some really innovative practice in parts of our sector, not just in early years, but there are examples of where in residential settings people that are being supported have learned alongside the workforce to help develop and grow their Welsh language skills, or residents have been helping to coach the workforce, which may be just starting with the basics of, 'Hello, how are you, would you like a cup of tea?' and then looking to build those Welsh language skills in quite an

organic way, and in a way that the workforce can feel quite confident with that sort of interaction.

[173] **Ms Halliday**: Os medraf i ymateb yn Gymraeg, os ydy hynny'n iawn efo pawb, jest i ddilyn Sarah a'r pethau a oedd hi'n eu dweud yn gynharach ynglŷn â'r *care ambassadors* sydd gennym ni, rydym ni wedi sbïo ar faint o siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd gennym ni ac rydym ni'n disgwyl eto y wybodaeth yna *any day* rŵan. Ond rydym ni wedi sylweddoli y gallai hynny ein helpu ni o ran hybu'r iaith Gymraeg yn y sector. Mae gennym ni *care ambassadors* sy'n gweithio ym maes blynyddoedd cynnar, felly, i fynd allan a hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg i'r sector law yn llaw efo hyrwyddo'r sector ei hun.

Ms Halliday: If I may respond in Welsh, just to follow up on Sarah's comments and her earlier comments on the care ambassadors that we have, we have looked at the number of Welsh speakers that we have. Again, we're awaiting that information any day now. But we do know that that could assist us in promoting the Welsh language in the sector. We do have care ambassadors who do work in the early years sector, so, to get out there and promote the Welsh language to the sector alongside promoting the sector itself.

[174] Hefyd, mae gennym ni aelod o staff sy'n gweithio ar y cyd efo prifysgolion a cholegau. Felly, maen nhw'n mynd allan i siarad efo myfyrwyr ynglŷn â'r sector ond hefyd am agweddau 'Mwy na geiriau' a'r ffaith bod hynny mor bwysig yn eu hymarfer nhw yn y dyfodol—fel mae Sarah yn ei ddweud, jest tipyn bach, efallai, efo plentyn—jest dweud, 'Bore da, sut wyt ti heddiw?', jest i sicrhau bod y plentyn yna'n gwybod bod ei iaith nhw'n bwysig i'r person yna a bod y diwylliant yn cael ei gynnwys yn y gofal yna.

We also have a member of staff working jointly with universities and colleges. They go out to speak to students about the sector, but also about certain aspects of 'Mwy na geiriau' and how important that is in terms of their future practice—as Sarah has said, a little Welsh language skill with a child, just saying, 'Bore da, how are you today?', just ensuring that that child knows that their language is important to the person dealing with them and that the Welsh culture is included in their care package.

[175] Rydym ni wedi bod wrthi yn gweithio llawer iawn ar waith gyrfa hefyd, ac, fel mae Sarah wedi ei

We have been working on career work, and we have worked jointly with the sector in looking at what we

ddweud yn barod, rydym ni wedi gweithio ar y cyd efo'r sector a sbïo ar beth sydd gennym ni'n barod. Un o'r pethau sydd wedi dod allan ydy hybu'r iaith Gymraeg—bod hynny'n bwysig o ran recriwtio a hefyd ein bod ni'n recriwtio pobl nid jest o ran eu sgiliau cyffredinol nhw, ond symud ymlaen at *values-based recruitment* a phobl sydd efo egwyddorion y sector ac efo egwyddorion a dealltwriaeth o ddiwylliant yr iaith Gymraeg o fewn y sector. Hefyd, o ran y gwaith gyrfa, rydym ni wedi sbïo, fel mae Sarah wedi ei ddweud yn barod, ar *coaching* a *mentoring* a sut medrwn ni helpu staff yn y sector i godi hyder i siarad Cymraeg, a'r ffaith bod hynny wedi dod allan o'r pethau rydym ni wedi cael trafodaeth efo'r sector ynglŷn â nhw—y ffaith nad yw pobl, efallai, yn hyderus jest i ddefnyddio bach o'r iaith efo pobl. Jest mymryn bach o Gymraeg sydd ganddyn nhw, ond, fel mae Sarah wedi ei ddweud yn barod, mae mor bwysig i rai pobl jest eu bod nhw'n deall bod gan y person yna dipyn o Gymraeg ac y medran nhw siarad mymryn bach efo nhw—jest i godi hyder y sector o ran hynny drwy 'coach-o' a phethau fel hynny.

already have in place. One of the things that have emerged is the promotion of the Welsh language, and that's important in terms of recruitment and also that we should recruit people not just in terms of their general skills, but also move towards values-based recruitment and people who have the values of the sector at heart and have an understanding of the culture and of the Welsh language's importance within the sector. Also, in terms of career work, as Sarah has already said, we have looked at coaching and mentoring and how we can assist staff in the sector to enhance their confidence in using the Welsh language, and the fact that that has emerged from the things that we've discussed with the sector itself—that people, perhaps, simply aren't confident in using a little of the language with people, that little Welsh that they have. But it is, as Sarah said, so important to certain individuals that they understand that that person does have a little Welsh and that they can converse with them on a basic level. We just need to enhance the confidence of the sector in that regard through coaching and so on.

[176] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Mae gan Dawn gwestiwn clou, os yw hynny'n iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Dawn has a brief question.

[177] **Dawn Bowden**: Yes, it was just following on from that. You said something earlier, Sarah, about having dedicated support in place for social workers, and that's the registered workforce in the care sector, but there's a

huge unregistered workforce. So, just following up on that, what kind of consideration have you given to the support needed for the unregistered workforce? Do you have any idea, given what you were just saying about the data, not really having all the data—? The data are sketchy on the registered workforce; they are probably non-existent for the non-registered workforce. So, do you have any idea of the scale of the challenge that you might be facing amongst your own workforce?

[178] **Ms McCarty**: We do have some figures. So, certainly, for those on the register, as I mentioned earlier, we know—for different groups who register, there's a different range in terms of fluency in the Welsh language and, for those with some Welsh, there's a different range. So, different areas—social work students are actually the highest, at the moment, in terms of those who are fluent. So, we do have quite good data and we can look at the trend, then, for the registered workforce, year on year. So, we can actually see is that moving in the direction that we'd be expecting it to with the initiatives and work that is being undertaken.

[179] For the unregistered workforce—and this situation will change, because, as Members may be aware, from 2018, we'll be looking to register the domiciliary care workforce, and, from 2020, the care homes workforce. So, the size of the register will increase significantly, as will the amount of workforce data that we can easily have access to and, again, look at for trends year on year.

[180] At the moment, we do commission a survey through the local government data unit, where we look at those services that local authorities are commissioning in terms of social care provision—it doesn't cover early years at the moment. So, there are 1,300 providers that have responded to the survey, about 84 per cent of the commissioned providers. That's quite robust in terms of survey data. From that, we know that 11 per cent can communicate effectively in Welsh. We'll be looking at those as having high-level needs. At the moment we don't go any further than that. So, in terms of then having, 'What if there's some Welsh language?', because that's the element we don't currently collect, we don't know. So, we do have an idea that we can be then looking to be building upon and developing. Obviously, as individuals come onto the register and they sign up to the code of practice, we'll be able to put that area into place.

10:45

[181] The other element that I think is quite important for us to think about is when population needs assessments are going to be undertaken, and looking at what are the community skills profiles needed in each area. So, what's the actual Welsh language demand and need for services in any particular community? So, then, when we're looking at what services are needed, then there can be a response to that. And when we look at the workforce, we'll be able to plan, recognising that needs in different communities of Wales are going to be different. But to make sure that services in future are giving that active offer in relation to the Welsh language is really important.

[182] **Dawn Bowden**: But amongst that particular group, it's quite a big challenge, isn't it, it would seem. So, have you got a plan in place to start to address that?

[183] **Ms McCarty**: I suppose we've covered this in two different ways. One is through some of the specific resources—so, trying to support employers and thinking through what skills have you already got within your workforce that you could be utilising; are people coming forward with the Welsh language skills they might already have; or are, perhaps, people not talking about what Welsh language skills they've got because there's some confidence or concern that their skills aren't good enough? So, there's that element of work where we're doing some direct resources and support for employers in that way, and trying to link them into the other resources that are available nationally, because there is quite a lot of support available.

[184] The other element we're doing is to try and embed the importance of the Welsh language into culture and practice—so, in actually every resource and development we do, from the code of practice, through to induction, to qualifications, and then continuing professional development, will be the importance of the Welsh language and responding to that in our day-to-day work as care and support or early years workers, so that it's embedded in practice and culture and developments. So, we need to do, I think, both that specific in terms of support, but also that cross nature—. So, if I give an example, we've recently had quite a significant programme of work to support the workforce's understanding about the social services and well-being Act. As part of that, we did a whole range of core modules, which were developed nationally and delivered locally in response to need. About 6,000 individuals attended that training. The active offer and the importance of the Welsh language would have been embedded throughout all of them. So, it's this continuum. I suppose some might call that a drip-feed approach: that

people are being exposed to it day to day in their activity as well, then supported by some specific initiatives and activities.

[185] **Dawn Bowden**: Okay. Thank you.

[186] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Rydym yn symud ymlaen at ddilyniant, ac mae gan Neil Hamilton gwestiynau i chi.

Bethan Jenkins: We're moving on now to progression, and Neil Hamilton has questions for you.

[187] **Neil Hamilton**: We know that, as you get older, it becomes more difficult to be immersed in a Welsh-speaking environment, in schools or in the workplace. As children move through different phases of education, the proportion of those using the Welsh language regularly diminishes. I was wondering what you think, as a council, about the Government's stated objective of improving the rate of progression, through the different phases of education in the first place, and then beyond that into the world of work.

[188] **Ms McCarty**: Progression through education probably isn't my area of expertise, but certainly what we would like to see, I think, is when individuals are undertaking training and development through further education and work-based learning, that there is an equal opportunity to undertake that through the medium of Welsh or English. Sometimes there are some barriers for individuals, and I mentioned the Qualifications Wales review earlier, which flags some of those up in terms of some of the challenges for learners that are trying to undertake learning through Welsh, perhaps post their formal education years. There is that importance of us trying to think through, I guess, the whole continuum—that that investment or effort doesn't stop at particular points in people's journeys. But I think, also, for social care and early years settings, it's about the culture of the services that we're providing. If we are there to respond to the needs of individuals and communities, then the Welsh language has to be a core part of that. So, it does need to be in that day-to-day work of the whole of the sector, recognising that not everyone is currently bilingual—and I don't think that would ever be the case—but that those who want to have a service, or need to have a service in Welsh, are able to access that.

[189] **Ms Halliday**: Byddaf yn ymateb yn Gymraeg, os ydy hynny'n ocê. Jest i ddilyn beth mae Sarah wedi sôn amdano yn barod, gyda'r

Ms Halliday: If I may respond in Welsh. Just to follow up on Sarah's comments, with the new qualifications, and with the principles

cymwysterau newydd, yn amlwg, ac efo'r egwyddorion o fewn hynny i'r iaith Gymraeg, rydym yn gobeithio y gwnaiff hynny hybu a rhoi hyder i bobl siarad Cymraeg. Yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, mae gennym ni adnoddau sy'n cefnogi pobl i sbïo ar beth sydd ganddyn nhw yn barod yn y gweithlu a sut i ddatblygu hynny. O fewn yr ymgynghoriad, mae yna bethau yr ydym wedi sôn yn barod amdanynt—rydym ni'n mynd allan i'r sector, i'r colegau, a jest hybu defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg a thrio codi hyder o fewn hynny. Felly, rydym ni'n mynd allan a siarad efo pobl sydd ar fin mynd i goleg neu ar fin mynd i brifysgol, a rhoi pwysigrwydd yr iaith Gymraeg, a siarad am hynny efo nhw, fel eu bod nhw yn ymwybodol fod hyn y sgìl iddyn nhw yn y dyfodol a bod yna ofyn yn y sector am yr iaith Gymraeg.

contained within those on the Welsh language, we hope that that will give people the confidence to use the Welsh language. In the early years, we have resources that encourage people to look at what they already have within the workforce and how that can be developed. There are issues that we've already mentioned in terms of consultation. We go out to the sector and to the colleges and just promote the use of the Welsh language and enhance people's confidence in that regard. So, it's getting out there and speaking to people who are about to enter college or university and just emphasising the importance of the Welsh language and discussing that with them so that they can be aware that this is a skill for them in the future, and that there is demand in the sector for that skill.

[190] **Neil Hamilton**: Of course, a lot of care workers are employed by local authorities or in the health service, as well. The extent to which public bodies work together towards this stated objective, in collaboration with the education system, is very important to the ultimate achievement of the objective of a million Welsh speakers by 2050. From your experience so far, how well do you think these different sectors are working together and complementing one another in the work that they do?

[191] **Ms McCarty**: Clearly, there needs to be a partnership approach—from our perspective, probably through social care, health, housing, education and a whole range of others, really, because we need to be focused on the individuals who need that care and support.

[192] In terms of how we make some of the ambition a reality, that indeed will also need us to be working together in partnership, both to support learning—so, what's worked in different areas, and what we can learn from the responses, and develop some of that—but also to think about how

services could be delivered differently in future.

[193] The social services and well-being Act 2014 I do think gives an opportunity for that, and the regional collaborative boards can now be working together both across health and social care and across the statutory and voluntary sector to really think about what the needs are for the population in that area, and how collectively that response can be rolled out. That should include—and will have to include, through the population needs assessment—the response to the Welsh language.

[194] **Bethan Jenkins**: Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen nawr at integreiddio, ac mae gan Dai Lloyd gwestiwn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We move on to integration, and Dai Lloyd has a question.

[195] **Dai Lloyd**: Diolch, Gadeirydd. Rwy'n credu, yn sylfaenol, bod y cwestiwn yna newydd gael ei ateb, ond fe wna i jest ofyn un pwt bach byr. Fel cyngor gofal, beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i hybu'r sgìl o allu defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle, fel agwedd bositif, fel sgìl yn y gweithle? Hynny yw, nid jest fel rhan o'r broses yma o gynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg fel diwedd yn ei hun, ond y ffaith eich bod chi'n gallu gwella safon y gofal drwy fedru'r iaith Gymraeg, mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd. Rwy'n sôn am ofal henoed, er enghraifft, neu bobl efo dementia. Maen nhw'n colli eu hail iaith yn gyntaf, sydd yn golygu, os byddaf i'n byw yn ddigon hen, y byddaf yn colli fy iaith Saesneg. Ond wrth gwrs, mae'r bobl yna eisiau gofal, ac wedyn mae yna agwedd arall i chi fel sector—nid jest y gallu i siarad Cymraeg, ond y gallu i wella safon y gofal mewn rhai agweddau.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you, Chair. I think the question has just been answered, but I will ask just one brief question. As a care council, what are you doing to promote the skill of using the Welsh language in the workplace as a positive workplace skill? That is, not just part of this process of increasing the number of Welsh speakers as an end in and of itself, but the fact that you can improve the quality of care by providing Welsh language services in certain circumstances. I'm talking about care for older people, for example, or people with dementia. They tend to lose their second language first, which will mean that, if I live long enough, I will lose English. But of course, those people do require care, so there is another aspect of this for you as a sector—not just the ability to speak Welsh, but also the ability to improve care in certain circumstances.

[196] **Ms McCarty**: I think there's an understanding that, for care to be of

good quality, it needs to meet the language needs of that individual. That's a core component of quality care, and that's where the active offer and response needs to be in place for individuals in all communities of Wales. There will be some challenges in some communities, and the workforce planning element and looking at the population needs assessment will be challenging; there's no doubt about that. We can look at it from a national workforce perspective, but we'll need to work with the regional workforce boards to try and work through some of those challenges, and how that can best be supported as we move through.

[197] But some of the examples you quoted—individuals with dementia, or perhaps young children who only know Welsh—there are some key areas where we're very clear that this is a need, not a want. So, it's something that has to be responded to in relation to services that are provided.

[198] **Ms Halliday**: Os medraf ymateb ymhellach, jest hefyd bod yr iaith Gymraeg yn cael yr un pwysigrwydd â'r iaith Saesneg hefyd, a bod hynny jest yn rhan o ymarfer o ddydd i ddydd, ac nid jest yn rhywbeth *tokenistic*—rhywbeth mae rhywun yn meddwl amdano wedyn. Rydym ni wrthi'n hyrwyddo a hybu hynny yn ein sector ni, yn enwedig yn yr enghreifftiau yr ydych chi wedi'u rhoi: ei bod yn bwysig i'r bobl hynny ac, yn enwedig, ein bod ni, fel sector, yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Ms Halliday: If I can just respond further, also, the Welsh language needs to have the same importance as the English language, and that it is just there is terms of day-to-day practice, and not just something that's tokenistic—something that someone's thought about afterwards. We are promoting and encouraging that in our sector, especially in the examples that you've provided: that it's important for those people and that we, as a sector, are aware of that.

[199] **Dai Lloyd**: Diolch yn fawr.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you.

[200] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am roi tystiolaeth i ni heddiw. Mae'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n gallu dilyn yr hyn yr ydym ni'n ei wneud fel ymchwiliad ac fel pwyllgor. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am ddod i mewn heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for your evidence this morning. I'm sure you will follow our inquiry as a committee. Thank you for your attendance this morning.

[201] Rydym yn mynd i gael pum munud o seibiant. Diolch.

We're going to take a five-minute break now.

Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:55 ac 11:01.
The meeting adjourned between 10:55 and 11:01.

Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod Adroddiad Blynyddol 2014-15 a'r Adroddiad Pum Mlynedd
Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report 2014-15 and Five-year Report

[202] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn, ac rydym yn cychwyn eto yn ôl gyda'r pwyllgor ar eitem 4. Rydym yma i drafod adroddiad blynyddol 2014-15 ac adroddiad pum mlynedd Comisiynydd y Gymraeg. Croeso i chi yma heddiw. Y tystion, wrth gwrs, yw Meri Huws, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg, Dyfan Sion, y cyfarwyddwr polisi ac ymchwil, a Huw Gapper, uwch-swyddog polisi ac ymchwil. Croeso i chi yma heddiw. Rwy'n gwybod bod yna sesiwn eithaf hir gyda chi o'ch blaenau ond croeso. Rydym yn mynd i edrych ar yr adroddiad yn gychwynnol ac mae gan Dai Lloyd gwestiynau ynglŷn â safonau, os yw e wedi ffeindio'r dudalen. [*Chwerthin*.]

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much and we resume our meeting of the committee with item 4. We're here to consider the annual report for 2014-15 and the five-year report of the Welsh Language Commissioner. Welcome to you here today. The witnesses, of course, are Meri Huws, the Welsh Language Commissioner, Dyfan Sion, director of policy and research, and Huw Gapper, senior policy and research officer. Welcome to you here today. I know that you have quite a long session in front of you, but welcome. We are going to look at the report initially and Dai Lloyd has questions on standards, if he's found the page. [*Laughter*.]

[203] **Dai Lloyd**: Rwyf wedi darllen yr adroddiad yn drylwyr mewn manylder sawl tro, ond y cwestiwn sy'n dod yw'r her o osod safonau ieithyddol, yn enwedig yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, a'u gwneud nhw yn berthnasol. Nid wyf yn credu bod pawb yn disgwyl i bob un sy'n gweithio i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac sy'n cyd-gyffwrdd efo chleifion fod â Chymraeg sydd o

Dai Lloyd: I've read the report in great detail a number of times, but the question I'd like to pose is the challenge of imposing language standards, particularly in the health service, and how you make them relevant. I don't think that everyone expects everyone who works in the health service and engages with patients to have Welsh to degree

safon gradd yn y Gymraeg. Ond, wrth gwrs, byddwn yn edrych i gael rhyw fath o safon a rhyw fath o barodrwydd i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg pan fo'n berthnasol. Nid wyf yn gwybod os wyt ti eisiau ymhelaethu ar hynny.

level. But, of course, we would be looking to have some sort of standard and a willingness to use the Welsh language when that's relevant. I don't know if you'd like to expand on that.

[204] **Ms Huws**: Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi a diolch am gyfeirio at sector sy'n eithriadol o bwysig. Efallai y byddai'n werth i ni jest atgoffa ein hunain lle rydym arni o ran gosod safonau: erbyn hyn mae yna 26 sefydliad yng Nghymru, sef awdurdodau lleol, Llywodraeth Cymru a'r parciau yn gweithredu o dan y gyfundrefn safonau. Erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf, 2017, mi fydd o gwmpas 80 o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys sefydliadau mawr cenedlaethol Cymru, cyrff megis y cyngor gofal yr ydych newydd fod yn trafod â nhw, yr heddluoedd a'r gwasanaethau tân. Ni fydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gweithredu o dan y safonau erbyn diwedd y cyfnod yna.

Ms Huws: Thank you very much, and thank you for referring to an extremely important sector. Perhaps it would be valuable for us just to remind ourselves of where we are in terms of setting standards: by now 26 organisations in Wales, namely local authorities, Welsh Government and the parks are working under the standards regime. By the end of March next year, 2017, there will be around 80 organisations, including large, national organisations in Wales, bodies such as the care council that you've just been discussing with, the fire service and the police. The health service will not be operating under the standards by the end of that period.

[205] Fel yr ydych yn ymwybodol, mae yna ymgynghoriad wedi bod ar y safonau iechyd. Rydym wedi gwerthfawrogi hynny achos fel yr ydych yn ei ddweud mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod ni'n cael y safonau hynny'n iawn er mwyn cael effaith ar fywydau pobl. Ac, felly, mae'r ymarferiad o edrych ar beth sy'n mynd i weithio yn eithriadol o bwysig. Ond a gaf i ddweud, nid wyf yn credu ein bod ni'n gallu osgoi bod

As you are aware, there has been a consultation on the health standards. We have appreciated that because, as you said, it's important that we have those standards right in order to have an impact on people's lives. And, therefore, the exercise of looking at what is going to work is extremely important. But, if I could say, I don't think we can avoid the fact that there is a need for standards in the health sector. The social care

angen safonau o fewn y maes iechyd? Mae'r maes gofal cymdeithasol yn barod yn gweithio o dan safonau. Mae'r berthynas rhwng iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a thai yn eithriadol o bwysig er mwyn sicrhau gofal perthnasol yn ei gyfanrwydd. Felly, rwy'n credu mai'r her fawr i'r Llywodraeth yn ystod misoedd cyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf fydd sicrhau bod y safonau iechyd yna'n ffit i bwrpas.

sector is already operating under a standards system. The relationship between health, social care and housing is vital in order to ensure that care is relevant as a whole. Therefore, I think that the great challenge for the Government in the early months of next year is to ensure that those health standards are fit for purpose.

[206] I ddod yn ôl at ail elfen eich cwestiwn chi: nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw un yn dychmygu y gallwn ni gael Cymru llwyr ddwyieithog gyda gwasanaeth iechyd llwyr ddwyieithog ymhen pum na 10 mlynedd. Buasai'n dda i feddwl ein bod ni'n gallu rhyw ddiwrnod. Ond yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw gosod y claf neu'r person mewn angen wrth ganol y broses yna a sicrhau bod y person yna yn gallu cyfathrebu yn yr iaith o'u dewis neu o'u hangen. Yr her i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yw cynllunio gwasanaeth lle mae'r claf wrth y canol ac wedyn os oes angen neu awydd i gyfathrebu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, bod hynny'n rhan o'r pecyn gofal. So, mae yna ddau beth: mae'r safonau'n eithriadol o bwysig i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ond rwy'n credu bod cynllunio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol mor bwysig hefyd, gyda'r claf yna wrth y canol, a'r claf yna ag anghenion cyfathrebu ieithyddol.

To come back to the second element of your question: I don't think that anyone imagines that we can have a completely bilingual Wales with a completely bilingual health service within five or 10 years. It would be good to think that we could have that someday. But what's important is placing the patient or the person in need at the heart of that process and ensuring that that person can communicate in their language of choice or language of need. The challenge for the health service is planning a service where the patient is at the centre and then if there is a need or a desire to communicate through the medium of Welsh, that that is part of the care package. So, there are two things: the standards are extremely important to the health service, but I think that planning health and social care is so important as well, with the patient at the heart of it, and that patient having linguistic communication needs.

[207] **Dai Lloyd**: Diolch yn fawr iawn.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you very much.

[208] **Bethan Jenkins**: A allwch chi ymhelaethu ar y safonau yng nghyd-destun nwy a thrydan ac wedyn o ran y sector telathrebu? A oes gennych unrhyw syniad o'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y meysydd hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Could you expand on the standards in the context of electricity and gas and also in terms of the telecommunications sector? Do you have any idea of what's likely to happen in those areas?

[209] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n mynd i ofyn i Dyfan, fel y cyfarwyddwr â chyfrifoldeb am osod safonau.

Ms Huws: I'm going to ask Dyfan, as the director who has responsibility for standards.

[210] **Mr Sion**: Diolch. Efallai jest i roi ychydig o gyd-destun hefyd, rydych yn ymwybodol ein bod ni yn gallu gweithio efo rhai cyrff yn y sector preifat o dan y Mesur, a chyfleustodau yn bennaf ydy'r cyrff hynny. Felly, rydym eisoes wedi gweithio efo cwmnïau dŵr. Mae'r cwmnïau dŵr hynny yn ddarostyngedig i reoliadau safonau erbyn hyn. Mae yna ymgynghoriad gan y Llywodraeth yn digwydd ar y rheoliadau hynny ar hyn o bryd. Felly, nhw oedd y sector cyntaf ymysg y cyfleustodau i fynd trwy'r system. Rydym hefyd, ers hynny, wedi cynnal ymchwiliad safonau, sef y cam cyntaf o fapio efo cwmnïau trên a bysys hefyd. Felly, y sector trafnidiaeth.

Mr Sion: Thank you. Perhaps if I could just give you some context, first of all. You'll be aware that we are able to work with certain private sector organisations under the Measure, and those are the utilities mainly. So, we have worked with the water companies already. Those companies are subject to standards regulations now. There is a Government consultation ongoing on those regulations at the moment. So, they were the first sector in terms of the utilities to go through the system. Also, since then, we've conducted a standards inquiry, which is the first step in mapping this with the train and bus companies. So, that's the transport sector.

[211] Ers hynny, rydym wedi symud ymlaen i'r sector ynni, felly cwmnïau nwy a thrydan. Mae'r ymchwiliad yna wedi dod i ben yn lled ddiweddar, felly rydym yn y broses ar hyn o bryd o ystyried y dystiolaeth rydym wedi'i chael. Y cam nesaf efo hwnnw wedyn fydd llunio a chyflwyno adroddiad i'r Llywodraeth ac wedyn mae o yn eu dwylo nhw o ran llunio rheoliadau.

Since then, we've moved on to the energy sector, so the gas and electricity companies. That inquiry has been concluded relatively recently, so we're currently in the process of considering the evidence gathered. The next stage of that then will be to draw up and present a report to Government and then it's in their hands in terms of drawing up

regulations.

[212] Y sector mawr arall sy'n weddill wedyn ydy telathrebu. Nid ydym wedi dod atyn nhw eto, yn bennaf oherwydd y gwaith yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud efo'r sectorau eraill.

The other major remaining sector is telecommunications. We haven't broached that issue as of yet, mainly because of the work that we've been undertaking with the other sectors.

[213] Un peth arall i'w nodi hefyd, wrth gwrs, ydy ein bod yn cychwyn y camau cychwynnol yna efo'r cyrff cyfleustodau. Fel y dywedodd Meri, yn y cyfamser, rydym wedi bod yn cymryd y camau olaf, os leiciwch chi, o ran gosod y dyletswyddau wedyn efo'r sectorau cyhoeddus—y sectorau yr oedd Meri yn cyfeirio atyn nhw.

One other thing that I should note, of course, is that we are taking those initial steps with the utility companies. As Meri said, in the meantime, we have also been taking the final steps, if you like, in terms of imposing responsibilities on the public sector organisations that Meri referred to.

[214] **Ms Huws**: Efallai ei bod yn werth jest sôn bod y broses ymchwiliad safonau yna yn ddechrau i'r broses. Soniais fod 80 o sefydliadau yn mynd i fod yn gweithredu o dan y safonau erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth. Mae yna ryw 120 o sefydliadau yn y sector cyhoeddus rŷm ni wedi gwneud y gwaith ymchwiliad safonau iddyn nhw, sydd ddim wedi cael eu dwyn o dan reoliadau. Felly, mae yna elfen o, y term Saesneg yw '*logjam*', ar hyn o bryd. Rydym ni'n disgwyl y safonau iechyd ac rydym ni hefyd yn disgwyl y safonau addysg. Mae yna waith wedi cael ei wneud gyda chymdeithasau tai ac, felly, mae yna restr o sectorau sydd angen delio â nhw trwy broses rheoliadau, ac wedyn mae yna, rwy'n credu, 130 o gwmnïau bysys a threnau a 91 o gwmnïau ynni tu ôl i hynny hefyd. Felly, mae yna dipyn o

Ms Huws: Perhaps it's worth mentioning that the process of investigating those standards is the start of the process. I mentioned that there were 80 organisations going to be working under the standards by the end of March. There are about 120 organisations in the public sector that we have done the investigation work on that haven't been brought under the standards. So, there is an element of, the English term is 'logjam', at the moment. We're expecting the health standards and we're also expecting the education standards. Work has been done with housing associations and, therefore, there is a list of sectors that need to be dealt with through the regulatory process, and then, I think, there are 130 bus and train companies and 91 energy companies behind that as well. So,

waith yn nwylo’r Llywodraeth yn awr i symud y rheoliadau a’r safonau ymlaen.

there is quite a lot of work in the Government’s hands now to move the regulations and the standards on.

[215] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Rydym yn symud ymlaen at ymdrin â chwynion ac ymchwiliadau statudol ac mae gan Lee Waters gwestiynau i chi.

Bethan Jenkins: Thanks. We’ll move on to handling complaints and statutory investigations and Lee Waters has some questions for you.

[216] **Lee Waters**: Diolch. I just want to get a sense of some of the common themes and difficulties that you’re coming up against. You’ve dealt with a number of cases—I think there were 250 cases you investigated last year. What are some of the patterns emerging and what are some of the most egregious examples that you’ve had to deal with?

[217] **Ms Huws**: Y patrymau sy’n amlygu eu hunain yn gyntaf, a’r patrymau sy’n amlygu eu hunain yw gohebiaeth, gwefannau a gwasanaethau ffôn—y cyswllt personol hwnnw rhwng unigolyn neu ddefnyddiwr a’r gwasanaethau. Dyna’r rhai sy’n dod trwyddo’n rheolaidd a dyna’r rhai y mae modd eu sortio yn weddol rhwydd—yn rhwydd iawn a dweud y gwir—achos, yn aml iawn, codi ymwybyddiaeth y sefydliad sydd ei eisiau ac iddyn nhw edrych ar y mater, ac y mae modd wedyn dod i ddatrysiad ac mae pawb yn symud ymlaen.

Ms Huws: On the patterns that emerge, the patterns are correspondence, websites and telephones services—that personal link between an individual or service user and the services. Those are the ones that come through regularly and those are the ones that can be sorted relatively easily—quite easily in fact—because, very often, it’s a matter of raising awareness within the organisation and encouraging them to look at the issue, and then we can find a solution and everyone can move on.

[218] Y rhai sy’n peri’r mwyaf o bryder i mi, fel comisiynydd, yw’r rhai sy’n deillio o’r sector iechyd a gofal. Pan rydych yn sôn am bethau sydd yn wirioneddol newid ansawdd bywyd rhywun, dyna’r rhai sydd yn peri pryder.

The ones that cause the greatest concern for me, as commissioner, are those that emerge from the health and care sectors. When you talk about issues that truly have an impact on one’s quality of life, those are the ones that are most concerning.

[219] Os edrychwch chi ar yr adroddiad, er enghraifft, mae yna waith ymchwiliad a wnaethom ni, o dan ddeddfwriaeth 1993, i awdurdod iechyd Betsi Cadwaladr a oedd yn peri poen i fi, oherwydd beth oedd y sefyllfa yna oedd plentyn yn cael cyfres o brofion gwybyddol, a'r plentyn yna yn gofyn, dro ar ôl tro, 'Plîs a gaf i wneud y rhain yn Gymraeg?', a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, Betsi Cadwaladr—ac mi oedd y person a oedd yn cynnal y profion yn siarad Cymraeg—yn dweud, 'Mae'n flin gyda fi, ond dim ond yn Saesneg mae'r profion yma ar gael ac wedi'u safoni.' Rwy'n credu bod y math yna o sefyllfa—. Mi oedd yr awdurdod iechyd a ni yn poeni am y sefyllfa yna. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth rydym wedi cyfeirio at y Gweinidog iechyd. Felly, dyna'r rhai lle mae'n newid ansawdd bywyd.

If you look at the report, for example, there was some inquiry work that we carried out under the 1993 legislation into Betsi Cadwaladr health board that caused me real anguish, because what happened in that situation was that there was a child who was undertaking a series of cognitive assessments and that child, time and again, asked to do those in Welsh. The Betsi Cadwaladr health service—and the individual undertaking those tests was a Welsh speaker—said, 'I'm sorry, these tests are only available and standardised through the medium of English.' I think that kind of situation—. The health board and ourselves were deeply concerned about that situation. It is something that we have referred to the health Minister. So, those are the examples of where it has a detrimental effect on one's quality of life.

[220] Mae cwestiynau wedi cael eu codi ynglŷn ag asesu plant ac asesu pobl ifanc hefyd gydag anghenion iechyd meddwl. Dyna'r math o sefyllfaoedd lle mae'n wirioneddol bwysig i gynnal ymchwiliad o safon er mwyn cael newid systemig oherwydd bod yna broblem systemig.

There have been questions raised on the assessment of children and assessing young people with mental health needs. Those are the kinds of situations where it is vital to hold a quality inquiry in order to provide that systemic change because there is a systemic problem.

[221] **Lee Waters**: Do you differentiate your approach between those you judge to be important to someone's quality of life and those that are primarily concerned with bureaucratic matters?

[222] **Ms Huws**: Os edrychwch chi ar y ddeddfwriaeth rydym yn gweithio oddi tani, rydym yn gweithio o dan

Ms Huws: If you look at the legislation that we work to, we are working under the 1993 legislation

ddeddfwriaeth 1993 a'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd. Nid ydym yn gwahaniaethu achos mae cwyn unrhyw berson yn gŵyn. Felly, nid ydym yn rhoi mwy o statws. Ond, wrth gwrs, fe fyddwn ni yn cymryd camau mwy difrifol ac yn codi'r mater ar lefel uwch wedi ymchwiliad lle mae yna broblemau sylfaenol ynglŷn â gwasanaethau. Felly, mae pob cwyn yn gŵyn dilys. Mae pob unigolyn sydd â chwyn yn unigolyn dilys. Ond, mae cyfres o gamau y gallwn ni eu cymryd, o ddatrysiadau rhwydd i fyny at godi'r mater ac, os oes rhaid, gosod camau gorfodi difrifol ar sefydliad.

and the new legislation. We don't differentiate because any individual's complaint is a complaint. Therefore, we don't give a greater status to any kind of complaint. But, of course, we would take more serious steps and raise issues at a higher level following an inquiry where there are fundamental systematic problems with services. So, every complaint is a valid complaint. Every complainant is valid. But, there are a series of steps that we can take, from finding swift solutions up to raising the issue at very senior levels and, if necessary, taking serious enforcement action against an institution.

[223] **Lee Waters**: How much do you take into account the practical barriers that organisations have to face? For example, I can think of a case of a UK organisation—and it's very difficult for organisations that are part of a UK structure—where they have an intranet system, which is vast, and a request has been made from your office to translate the whole of the UK intranet, and there's been some tension around that. So, how practically minded are you in dealing with these things?

[224] **Ms Huws**: Ni allaf i gyfeirio at yr achos yna yn benodol, achos nid wyf yn sicr beth yw'r achos yna. Ond, ymarferoldeb datrysiad sydd yn bwysig—

Ms Huws: I can't refer to that case specifically, because I'm not sure what you're referring to. But, the practicality of any solution is the most important thing—

[225] **Lee Waters**: I'm referring to your requiring organisations that are part of a UK-wide system, who've got internal systems that are only available in English, to translate the whole of the system.

[226] **Ms Huws**: Fel y dywedais i, mae ymarferoldeb datrysiad yn eithriadol o bwysig. Dyna pam rydym ni'n holi'r sefydliad, rydym yn casglu gwybodaeth gan y sefydliad, ynglŷn â

Ms Huws: As I said, the practicality of any solution is the most important thing. That is why we ask the institution, we gather information from the institution, as to what the

beth yw'r heriau a beth yw'r problemau. Holl bwrpas ymchwilio i gŵyn yw sicrhau datrysiad sydd yn symud y sefyllfa ymlaen i'r achwynydd ac i'r sefydliad hefyd. Mae rhesymoldeb yn eithriadol o bwysig wrth ein bod ni'n arfer ein pwerau.

challenges are and what the problems are. The whole purpose of inquiring into a complaint is to find a solution that moves the situation forward for the complainant and for the institution too. Reasonableness is truly important in the exercising of our powers.

[227] **Lee Waters**: So, you think you are practically minded in the way you approach issues.

[228] **Ms Huws**: Ymarferol, rhesymol a chymesur—gobeithio.

Ms Huws: Practically minded, reasonable and commensurate—yes, I hope so.

[229] **Lee Waters**: Okay, because I've also had some feedback, and I think we touched on this last time, from some local authority senior officers. The quote I had sent to me is that the office sometimes takes

[230] 'a very aggressive stance on the most minor of infringements'.

[231] This concern is held by a number of local authority chief executives. What would you say to that?

[232] **Ms Huws**: Nid wyf i wedi clywed hynny o'r blaen.

Ms Huws: I've not heard that previously.

[233] **Lee Waters**: Okay, well, as you're hearing it now, do you recognise any validity behind that? What do you think is driving that feeling, because it exists?

[234] **Ms Huws**: Wel, fel rwy'n dweud, nid wyf i wedi clywed hynny o'r blaen. Ond, wedi dweud hynny, nid dyna'r ymateb rwy'n cael oddi wrth brif weithredwyr. Mae'r berthynas, rwy'n gobeithio, rhyngof i a phrif weithredwyr yn eithriadol o bositif. Un peth rwyf wedi gweld ers cyflwyno'r gyfundrefn safonau gyda'r

Ms Huws: Well, as I said, I haven't heard that evidence before. But, having said that, that's not the response that I receive from chief executives. The relationship between myself and chief executives is extremely positive, I hope. The one thing I have seen, since introducing the standards regime with the initial

26 sefydliad cyntaf yw lefel o ymwneud ar lefel uchaf sefydliadau nad oedd efallai yn bodoli o dan y gyfundrefn cynlluniau iaith. Mae'r materion yma yn cael eu hystyried ar lefel uchel o fewn y sefydliad, ac rwy'n gwerthfawrogi'r berthynas yna.

26 organisations, is a level of engagement at the very highest level of these organisations that perhaps didn't exist under the language scheme system. These issues are considered at a very high level within these organisations, and I do appreciate that relationship.

11:15

[235] **Lee Waters**: Right, so you're dismissing that feedback because you haven't heard it before.

[236] **Ms Huws**: Na, fel rwy'n dweud, rwy'n cymryd unrhyw sylwadau fel sylwadau pwysig, ond dyna'r tro cyntaf i fi glywed hynny, ac fel rwy'n dweud, nid dyna fy mhrofiad i.

Ms Huws: No, as I say, I take any comments as being important comments, but that's the first time I've heard such remarks, and as I say, that's not my experience of it.

[237] **Bethan Jenkins**: Sori, jest i ddod mewn, jest i ehangu ar y drafodaeth, a ydych chi wedi cael cwynion, felly, o ran y cwestiynau y mae Lee wedi eu gofyn yng nghyd-destun yr *intranet* yn cael ei gyfieithu a phrif weithredwyr yn honni hyn? A oes yna rywbeth wedi dod atoch chi fel cwyn ei fod yn afresymol neu ddim yn ymarferol, felly?

Bethan Jenkins: Sorry, just to come in on that, just to expand the discussion, have you had complaints, therefore, in terms of the questions that Lee has asked in the context of the intranet being translated and chief executives claiming this? Has anything come back to you as a complaint that it's unreasonable or impractical, therefore?

[238] **Ms Huws**: Mae yna gwestiynau ynglŷn â thechnoleg gwybodaeth yn codi yn rheolaidd, a digwydd bod, dyna pam rydym ni wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad a chanllawiau ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth, ac rydym yn gweithio gyda sefydliadau i ddatrys y math yna o broblemau.

Ms Huws: There are questions on information technology that arise regularly, and that's why we have produced this report and guidance on IT, and we do work with organisations to resolve those kinds of problems.

[239] **Lee Waters**: Can I just ask one further follow-up? One of the examples

you quote in your investigations is the senior posts being advertised only in English. Clearly, there's a difficulty in recruiting high-calibre staff across many public services, and the point has been made to me in two cases—in the case of both Conwy council and Carmarthenshire—where both advertised for a director of education. Both stipulated a high level of written Welsh, and both only had one applicant. So, clearly, there's a huge difficulty there attracting the right quality of person. What's your view on situations like that?

[240] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n gweld bod yna gwestiynau, ac rydych chi'n gofyn am yr ymateb rydym yn ei gael oddi wrth gynghorau. Mae'r cwestiwn yma o recriwtio a ffeindio pobl gyda'r lefel briodol o sgiliau ieithyddol yn her i sefydliadau; rwy'n derbyn hynny. Rwy'n credu—ac rydym wedi cael trafodaethau yn y gorffennol—bod addysg yn eithriadol o bwysig fel rhan o'r ateb i'r sefyllfa yma yn y tymor byr a'r tymor hir. Felly, rwy'n credu bod yna gwestiynau sylfaenol i'w gofyn ynglŷn â strwythur y system addysg sydd ddim yn gallu creu pobl o ansawdd i weithredu ar y lefelau uchaf yma.

Ms Huws: I see that there are questions, and you're asking about the response we have from councils. This question of recruiting and finding people with the appropriate level of language skills is a challenge for organisations; I accept that. I think—and we've had discussions in the past—that education is exceptionally important as part of the solution to this situation in the short term and long term. Therefore, I think there are fundamental questions to be asked about the structure of the education system that cannot create people of quality to operate on these highest levels.

[241] **Lee Waters**: But in the meantime we have a situation where local authorities effectively don't have any choice but to appoint somebody who they may not think is the most qualified person for the job. You're content with that.

[242] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n credu beth rydych chi yn cyfeirio ato o ran y cwynion yn fanna yw hysbysebu a dweud mewn hysbyseb bod yna awydd ac angen am sgiliau ieithyddol. Rwy'n credu bod gwneud y datganiad yna yn bwysig er mwyn codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd bod sgiliau ieithyddol yn rhan o becyn

Ms Huws: I think what you're referring to in terms of the complaints there is advertising and saying in an advert that there is a desire and need for language skills. I think that making that statement is important to raise awareness of the public that language skills are part of a package of skills in the workplace.

sgiliau yn y gwaith.

[243] **Lee Waters**: Raising awareness is one thing; having then not a qualified field of candidates to choose from is a practical consequence of that, and my question to you is: is that a price worth paying?

[244] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n credu mai'r mater godoch chi oedd y gŵyn a ddaeth i mewn i'r sefydliad ynglŷn â hysbysebu, ac rwy'n credu bod hysbysebu yn gosod allan—

Ms Huws: I think the issue that you raised was the complaint that came to the organisation regarding advertising, and I think advertising sets out—

[245] **Lee Waters**: That was my first point; I've moved on since then.

[246] **Ms Huws**: Mae gosod allan gofynion ieithyddol yn bwysig.

Ms Huws: Setting out language requirements is important.

[247] **Lee Waters**: I don't think you're engaging with my point, to be fair. I appreciate that sending the signal is important and having people who are fluent in both languages is highly desirable, but in the case where two local authorities have tried their level best to do that and resulted in one person applying for the job, are we content with that situation? Is that a price worth paying?

[248] **Ms Huws**: Na, nid yw hynny yn dderbyniol.

Ms Huws: No, that's not acceptable.

[249] **Lee Waters**: So, back to my question about the pragmatic approach—faced with that, do you then relax your requirements?

[250] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n credu wedyn ei bod i fyny i'r awdurdod yna, ac nid wyf yn credu ein bod ni wedi camu i mewn. Beth rydym yn wneud yw gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau yna wedyn i edrych ar beth yw'r anghenion. Rwy'n credu bod yna amryw o sefyllfaoedd lle mae wedi bod yn amhosibl i recriwtio.

Ms Huws: I think then it's up to that authority, and I don't think that we've stepped in. What we do is work with those authorities then to look at what are the requirements. I think there have been a number of situations where it's been impossible to recruit.

[251] **Lee Waters**: Okay. Diolch.

[252] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn am hynny. Rydym yn symud ymlaen at gyllid, ac mae Neil Hamilton yn mynd i ofyn cwestiwn ar hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for that. We'll now move on to funding, and Neil Hamilton has some questions.

[253] **Neil Hamilton**: You've suffered a very significant reduction in your funding in recent years—25 per cent in cash terms, 32 per cent in real terms—and you've said that existing resources are not sufficient to extend the hold of the Welsh language Measure on different sectors in the near future, quite understandably in view of those figures. The Minister, however, seems to be pretty confident that you've got enough money to do the job, and we've had a slight confusion in correspondence between us as to your recent plea for a small addition to your resources of £150,000 over two years. And he says there have been no further bids, therefore you're now fully funded and you can do whatever is necessary to achieve your statutory objectives. Am I putting that in a fair way?

[254] **Ms Huws**: Rydw i'n credu bod y blynyddoedd diwethaf—y tair blynedd lle gawsom ni doriad o 10 y cant bob blwyddyn—wedi bod yn eithriadol, eithriadol o heriol i'r sefydliad ac i'r swyddogion. Fel y gwelwch chi, rydym ni wedi mynd trwy ymarferiad o dorri, o resymoli, o gael gwared ar swyddogion, ystad ac yn y blaen. Rydw i'n falch iawn mai cyllideb fflat sydd gennym ni at eleni. Fe gawsom ni daliad untro ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn gyllidol ddiwethaf o £150,000 er mwyn ein helpu ni gyda sefydlu'r gyfundrefn newydd, ac roeddwn ni'n gwerthfawrogi hynny.

Ms Huws: I believe the past years—those three years where we saw year-on-year cuts of 10 per cent—were exceptionally challenging for us and our officials. As you see, we have gone through an exercise of rationalisation and of seeing staff leave and seeing reductions in our estate and so on. I'm very pleased we have a cash-flat settlement for this year. We were given a one-off payment at the end of the last financial year of £150,000 in order to assist us with establishing the new regime, and we appreciated that.

[255] Beth sy'n fy mhoeni i yw ein bod ni'n gallu gweithredu yn ôl y Mesur, ond mae yna rhai darnau o waith, megis darnau o waith ymchwil

What concerns me is that we can operate according to the Measure, but there are certain pieces of work, such as research and certain work in

a darnau o waith hwyluso a helpu sefydliadau i gydymffurfio â safonau, nad yw'n bosib i ni eu gwneud. Ac rwy'n credu y buasai cyllideb ychwanegol, wrth gwrs, yn caniatáu inni wneud mwy o'r gwaith yna. Ond a gaf i ddweud fy mod i wir yn gwerthfawrogi nad yw'r gyllideb yn cael ei thorri eleni? Mae hynny'n rhoi sicrwydd i ni. Yr un peth buaswn i yn ei ddweud yw y buasai'n braf cael rhywfaint o sicrwydd sydd yn fwy na sicrwydd blwyddyn wrth flwyddyn. Ac mi wnaf i godi'r cwestiwn eto: a ddylai'n cyllideb ni fod yn dod o'r Llywodraeth neu o'r Cynulliad? Ac mae hynny'n wir, efallai, am benodiadau comisiynwyr hefyd. Ai penodiad a chyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad ddylai comisiynwyr Cymru fod?

terms of facilitating and assisting organisations to comply with standards that we can't undertake. And I do think that an enhanced budget would, of course, allow us to do more of that work. But may I say that I do appreciate the fact that the budget isn't being cut this year? That gives us some assurances, although the one thing I would say is that it would be nice to have some sort of assurance that goes beyond year-on-year assurances, and I will raise the question again as to whether our budget should be coming from the Government or from the Assembly itself. And that, perhaps, is true about the appointments of commissioners, too. Should they be the responsibility of the Assembly?

[256] **Neil Hamilton**: But it seems pretty quixotic to me, given the enhanced importance that the Government has given to the promotion of the Welsh language in the last 12 months alone, for your budget to (a) have been cut and (b) now to be flat-lining. So, perhaps you should set out what you would do with certain sums of extra money if they were available, as part of a marketing exercise.

[257] **Ms Huws**: Wel, diolch am y sylwadau yna. Rwy'n teimlo, fel y dywedais i, fod yna waith ychwanegol a fuasai'n hybu ac yn hwyluso'r Gymraeg y buasem ni'n medru ei wneud gyda chyllideb ychwanegol. Ond yr hyn sy'n bwysig i fi yw ein bod ni'n gweithredu o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth, ac rwy'n credu fy mod i'n gallu dweud fel comisiynydd, llaw ar fy nghalon, ein bod ni'n gwneud hynny.

Ms Huws: Well, thank you for those comments. As I said, there is additional work that could promote and facilitate the use of the Welsh language that we could undertake with an enhanced budget. But what's important for me is that we work within the boundaries of the legislation, and I think, as commissioner, I can say, with my hand on my heart, that we are doing that.

[258] **Neil Hamilton**: Very good. So, I wonder, then, if you could perhaps give us a little bit more information about the context in which you made your request for additional funding—what it was that you needed to do with the extra money.

[259] **Ms Huws**: Wel, cyn inni gael yr arian ychwanegol y llynedd, y £150,000, fe wnaethom ni gyfathrebu gyda'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am y Gymraeg ar yr adeg hynny, sef y Prif Weinidog; fe oedd yn gyfrifol ar yr adeg hynny. Gwnaethom ni osod allan cynllun busnes yn dangos, er mwyn gweithredu o fewn y Mesur ac i gynnal y gwaith hwyluso yna o osod safonau, fod angen cyllideb ychwanegol arnom ni. Mae'r ffaith ein bod ni wedi cael cyllideb fflat eleni, er ein bod ni wedi dweud y buasai arian ychwanegol yn cael ei groesawu—. Fe wnaethom ni ddweud mai'r gwaith rwyf i'n poeni amdano sydd wedi cael ei dorri yw'r gwaith ymchwil, sydd mor bwysig, fel y gweloch chi gyda'r adroddiad pum mlynedd—y pwysigrwydd o gael data o'r math yna—ond hefyd y gwaith sy'n anweladwy, efallai, gyda sefydliadau, gyda swyddogion sefydliadau. Rydym ni newydd gynnal pedwar seminar i swyddogion adnoddau dynol sefydliadau ynglŷn â'r broses recriwtio, sut mae rhywun yn mynd trwy'r broses recriwtio yna; mae'r rheini wedi cael eu croesawu. Roedd yna nifer fawr o fynychwyr; mi fuasem ni wedi gallu rhedeg y seminarau yna eilwaith. Ond dyna'r math o waith cynhaliol sydd yn mynd i gael ei dorri.

Ms Huws: Well, before we received the additional funding last year, that £150,000 that I mentioned, we did correspond with the Minister with responsibility for the Welsh language at that time, which was the First Minister, and we did set out a business case demonstrating that, in order to work within the Measure and to maintain that work of imposing standards, we did need an additional budget. The fact that we received a flat settlement this year, despite saying that additional funding would have been welcomed—. We did say that the work that I'm most concerned about, which has been cut, is the research work, which is so vitally important, as you saw with our five-yearly report—the importance of having those kinds of data—but also the work, which is often invisible, with organisations and officials within organisations. We've just held four seminars for human resources officials on the recruitment process, and how one goes through that recruitment process, and those were warmly welcomed. There were a number of attendees, and we could have run those seminars a second time. But that's the kind of support work that will be cut.

[260] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. A allwn ni symud ymlaen at adolygiad o drefniadau etholiadol a'r adroddiad y gwnaethoch chi yn hynny o beth? Mae gan Hannah nifer o gwestiynau ar hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Can we move on to a review of electoral arrangements and the report that you did on that? Hannah has a number of questions on that.

[261] **Hannah Blythyn**: Diolch. Following the 2015 election there were 15 recommendations in terms of electoral arrangements—access to Welsh medium, online tools or forms or the bilingual declaration of results by the returning officer. I was wondering: in your view, did you see an improvement in terms of the arrangements for the 2016 Assembly elections and for the police commissioners' elections?

[262] **Mr Gapper**: Diolch. I gychwyn, mae'n bwysig i ni fod y Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio mewn prosesau democrataidd ac yn cael ei gweld yn cael ei defnyddio hefyd. O ran statws y Gymraeg, mae hynny'n bwysig. Felly, rydym yn adolygu'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn ystod etholiadau. Fel yr ydych yn ei ddweud, yn ystod etholiad cyffredinol 2015, mi wnaethom ni sylwi ar nifer o ddiffygion a diffyg defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Rydych wedi cyfeirio at ddefnydd ar-lein, y diffyg ffurflenni Cymraeg a chanlyniadau yn cael eu cyhoeddi yn Saesneg yn unig mewn rhai mannau. Felly, mi wnaethom ni argymhellion ac rwy'n falch o ddweud bod hynny i weld wedi arwain at welliant o ran etholiadau'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai eleni. Er enghraifft, mi oedd ffurflenni cofrestru ar gyfer pleidleisio ar gael yn Gymraeg ond ddim mor hygyrch ag y gallent fod wedi bod ymhob achos, ond mi roedden nhw ar gael yn Gymraeg bob amser y tro hwn.

Mr Gapper: Thank you. To start with, it's important to us that the Welsh language is used in the democratic process and is seen to be used as well. In terms of the status of the Welsh language, that's important. So, we do review the use of the Welsh language during elections. As you say, during the general election in 2015, we noticed a number of deficiencies and a lack of the use of the Welsh language. You've referred to online use, the use or lack of Welsh forms and results being announced in English only in some areas. So, we made recommendations and I'm pleased to say that seems to have given rise to an improvement in terms of the Assembly elections in May this year. For example, registration forms for voting were available in Welsh but weren't as accessible as they could have been in every case, but they were available in Welsh at all times this time. Another example of an improvement was the announcing the results. The results

Enghraifft arall o welliant oedd cyhoeddi'r canlyniadau. Cyhoeddwyd y canlyniadau'n ddwyieithog ymhob sir. Eto, nid oedd safon y cyhoeddi'n Gymraeg efallai cystal â'r Saesneg ymhob achos ond mi oedd y Gymraeg yna y tro hwn. Felly, yn sicr, mae gwelliannau wedi bod ac mi fyddwn ni'n parhau i adolygu'r etholiadau'r flwyddyn nesaf—llywodraeth leol—ac wedi hynny i sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyrraedd y nod o ddefnydd cyfartal o'r ddwy iaith.

were announced bilingually in every county. Again, the standard of the announcements in Welsh perhaps wasn't as good as the English but the Welsh language was there this time. So, certainly, there have been improvements and we will continue to review the local government elections next year and then ensure that we reach the aim of using both languages on an equal basis.

[263] Mae'n werth nodi, efallai, o ran swyddogion etholiadol, nad oes gennym afael statudol arnynt. Nid ydynt yn dod o dan ddeddfwriaeth iaith. Felly, fedrwn ni ddim gorfodi gwelliant, ond mae'r argymhellion yr ydym wedi eu rhoi i'w gweld yn arwain at welliant.

It's worth noting, perhaps, in terms of returning officers, that we don't have a statutory role. They don't come under the language legislation. So, we can't force an improvement, but the recommendations that we've provided seem to be leading towards an improvement.

[264] **Hannah Blythyn**: Most returning officers are receptive to the recommendations.

[265] **Bethan Jenkins**: Pam nad oes pwerau gennych o ran y swyddogion penodol hynny, gan eu bod nhw'n gweithio i awdurdodau lleol?

Bethan Jenkins: Why don't you have any powers in terms of those specific officers, given that they do work for local authorities?

[266] **Mr Gapper**: Fy nealltwriaeth i yw nad ydynt yn gweithio i awdurdodau lleol yn y cyfnod hwnnw lle maen nhw'n cynnal etholiadau. Maen nhw'n gweithredu'r cyfrifoldebau hynny o dan drefn benodol ac nid ydynt yn weision neu'n weithwyr yr awdurdodau lleol.

Mr Gapper: My understanding is that they don't work for local authorities in that election period. They actually take on those responsibilities under a specific regime and not as officers of local authorities.

[267] **Bethan Jenkins**: A oes

Bethan Jenkins: Are there any further

cwestiynau eraill gan Aelodau? Jeremy.

questions from Members? Jeremy.

[268] **Jeremy Miles**: Roeddech chi'n sôn am safon y datganiad yn y Gymraeg: beth oedd gennych chi mewn golwg—yn nhermau'r datganiad llafar neu waith papur neu beth?

Jeremy Miles: You mentioned the standard of the announcement through the medium of Welsh: what did you have in mind—in terms of the oral statement or paperwork or what?

[269] **Mr Gapper**: Ie, y datganiadau llafar.

Mr Gapper: Yes, the oral statements.

[270] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn. Dyna ddiwedd ar y sesiwn ar yr adroddiad blynyddol.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. That brings that session to an end on the annual report.

11:28

Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 8
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy: Evidence Session 8

[271] **Bethan Jenkins**: Rydym am symud ymlaen at eitem 5, sef yr ymchwiliad i strategaeth Gymraeg ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru, a'r sesiwn gyda chi yng nghyd-destun eich barn chi am y targed o greu 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050. Fel rwyf wedi cychwyn bob sesiwn arall, beth yw eich barn glou chi am yr amcan hwnnw? A ydych yn cytuno ag ef a hefyd pa mor ymarferol yw e, a pha newidiadau fydd angen eu gwneud i strwythurau yn y gweithlu ac ar draws Cymru gyfan er mwyn sicrhau bod y nod hwnnw yn cael ei gyrraedd?

Bethan Jenkins: We will move on now to item 5, which is the inquiry into the Welsh Government's draft Welsh language strategy and this is a session with you in the context of your view of the target of reaching 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. As I have started all other sessions, could I just ask for your general views on that objective? Do you agree with it and also how achievable is it, and what changes will need to be made to structures within the workforce and across the whole of Wales in order to ensure that that objective is achieved?

[272] **Ms Huws**: Diolch yn fawr. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn amlwg y buaswn yn croesawu'r targed. Mae'n uchelgeisiol. Mae e wedi dwyn dychymyg. Mae pobl yn gweld y targed yma o ganol y ganrif gyda miliwn o siaradwyr yn un sy'n apelio. Er mwyn cyrraedd y targed, rwy'n credu bod angen gwneud amryw o bethau, ac rwy'n credu mai'r peth cyntaf sydd angen ei wneud yw gosod cyfres o gerrig milltir o ran mesur cyrraedd y targed yna. Er mwyn gwneud hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd sy'n gwneud synnwyr, mae angen modelu a modelu dwys ar y pwynt yma o ran beth sydd angen gwneud er mwyn cyrraedd hynny ar draws sawl adran waith. Felly, mae'r cerrig milltir a'r modelu yn eithriadol o bwysig, ac rwy'n credu na wnawn ni fyth gyrraedd y targed oni bai bod y gwaith yna'n digwydd.

Ms Huws: Thank you. I think it's clear that I would welcome the target. It's ambitious. It's imaginative. People see this target set for the middle of the century and 1 million speakers as an appealing one. In order to achieve that target, I think there is a need to do a number of things and I think the first thing that needs to be done is to establish a series of milestones in terms of achieving that target. In order to do that in any way that makes sense, there is a need for modelling and intense modelling on this point in terms of what needs to be done to achieve that across a number of sections of work. So, the milestones and the modelling are vitally important, and I don't think we'll achieve that target unless that work is done.

11:30

[273] Tu ôl i hynny wedyn, fe fydd angen cynllun gweithredu. Ond rydw i'n credu un peth y buaswn i'n dweud, gyda chwech o feysydd datblygu yn cael eu gosod allan yn y strategaeth, efallai bod angen tamaid bach yn fwy o waith i egluro pam. Sut mae'r chwe maes yna'n mynd i gyfrannu at y targed? Nawr yw'r amser i wneud y gwaith diffinio yna a'u gosod nhw allan mewn ffordd lawnach, ac rydw i'n siŵr taw dyna a welwn ni yn y flwyddyn newydd. Felly, pam y chwe maes yna a beth mae'r meysydd yna'n eu cynnwys.

Behind that then, there is a need for an action plan. I think one thing I would say is that, with six development areas being set out in the strategy, perhaps there is a need for more work to explain why and how those six areas are going to contribute to the target. Now is the time to do this defining work and to set them out in a fuller way, and I'm sure that that's what we'll see in the new year. So, why those six areas and what do those areas include.

[274] Dau sylw arall ar lefel uchel: mae gan Gymru, fel gwledydd eraill ar draws y byd, batrymau demograffeg arbennig ar hyn o bryd. Mae yna ambell i gwestiwn sydd ddim i'w gweld yn cael eu trafod o fewn y strategaeth. Un yw patrymau mewnfudo ac allfudo. Rydw i'n credu y mae e'n gwestiwn sy'n gallu bod yn un anodd ac mae'n gwestiwn sydd yn gallu bod yn un emosiynol, ond rydw i'n credu bod angen inni edrych ar batrymau mewnfudo ac allfudo. Rydw i'n credu bod angen inni edrych ar sut yr ydym ni'n darparu cymorth i fewnfudwyr i gael eu cymhathu i gymunedau ar draws Cymru. Er mor anodd yw'r maes yna, rydw i'n credu os gwnawn ni osgoi hynny, eto fe fydd yna dwll sylweddol yn y strategaeth. Rydw i wedi sôn o'r blaen am gomisiynwyr iaith eraill yn gweithredu ar draws y byd. Un o'r darnau sylweddol o waith sydd wedi cael eu gwneud yng Nghanada, ar draws Canada, yw gwaith ar adnabod anghenion mewnfudwyr a'u galluogi nhw i gael eu cymhathu i mewn i gymunedau ieithyddol a chymunedau yn fwy cyffredinol. Felly, rydw i'n credu bod hwnnw'n rhywbeth na allwn ni ddim anwybyddu, er mor boenus efallai y bydd e ac er mor sensitif y mae'n gallu bod.

Two further comments on a high level: Wales, like other countries across the world, has specific demographic patterns at the moment. There are a few questions that don't seem to be discussed within the strategy. One is immigration and emigration patterns. I think it's a question that can be a difficult one and it's a question that can be an emotional one, but I do think there is a need for us to look at immigration and emigration patterns. I think there is a need for us to look at how we provide support for immigrants so that they can integrate into communities in Wales. Even though this area is difficult, I think if we avoid that, again there will be a significant gap in the strategy. I've spoken before about other language commissioners operating across the world. One significant piece of work that has been done in Canada, across Canada, is work on recognising the needs of immigrants and enabling their integration into linguistic communities and communities more generally. So, I think that that is something we can't ignore, even though it could be painful and despite how sensitive an issue it can be.

[275] Ond rydw i'n credu, a dyma'r pwynt olaf o'm rhan i ar lefel uchel, os na welwn ni chwyldro ym maes addysg, wnawn ni ddim cyrraedd y targed o 1 miliwn o siaradwyr. Mae'r

But I do think, and this is the last point on a high level, if we don't see a revolution in the education sector, we will not reach the target of 1 million Welsh speakers. The work

gwaith a wnaethom ni fel rhan o'r adroddiad pum mlynedd yn dangos sawl peth. Yn gyntaf, nid oes yna ddim twf wedi bod o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ystod y cyfnod diwethaf. Fwy na hynny, rydw i'n poeni ynglŷn â'r cynlluniau strategol addysg Cymraeg—y WESPs. Nid ydw i'n gweld bod y WESPs yn y tair blynedd cyntaf o gael eu gweithredu wedi arwain at gynnydd o gwbl, ac rydw i'n poeni, wrth fod yr ymarferiad yn digwydd eto nawr, na fydd y cynlluniau yna, a fydd yn gynlluniau tair blynedd, yn newid y sefyllfa o gwbl. Rydw i'n credu—

that we did as part of the five-year report shows many things. First of all, there hasn't been a growth in Welsh-medium education during this last period and, more than that, I am concerned about the Welsh in education strategic plans—the WESPs. I don't see that the WESPs, in the first three years of being in operation have led to an increase at all, and I am concerned, as the exercise is happening again now, that those plans, being three-year plans, aren't going to change the situation at all. I think—

[276] **Bethan Jenkins**: A oes angen newid, felly, beth mae'r WESPs yn gwneud a'r *emphasis* ar y galw yn lleol? A oes angen newid yr *emphasis* a sut maen nhw'n cael eu creu yn y lle cyntaf, felly?

Bethan Jenkins: Do we need to change, therefore, what the WESPs do and the emphasis on local demand? Do we need to change the emphasis and how they're drawn up in the first place?

[277] **Ms Huws**: Oes. Rydw i'n credu bod angen edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth sydd wedi arwain at y WESPs. Rydw i'n credu bod angen i'r ddeddfwriaeth yna fod yn gliriach ynglŷn ag anghenion WESPs, ond a chymryd nad oes modd newid y ddeddfwriaeth rhwng nawr a mis Ebrill, mae angen i'r cynlluniau sydd yn dod i mewn—ac maen nhw'n dod i mewn at ein sefydliad ni. Rydym ni'n ymgynghorai statudol ar y WESPs yna. Rydw i'n poeni ynglŷn ag ansawdd y WESPs. Buaswn i'n dweud bod angen i'r Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidogion roi cyfarwyddyd lot cryfach a thynnach i awdurdodau lleol. Mae angen

Ms Huws: Yes. I do think that we need to look at the legislation that has led to the WESPs. I think that the legislation needs to be clearer on the requirements of WESPs, but, assuming that we won't be able to change that legislation between now and April, the plans that are submitted—and they do come in to us. We are a statutory consultee on those WESPs. I am concerned about the quality of the WESPs. I think the Government and Welsh Ministers need to give far more robust direction to local authorities. We need targets, and targets that will lead to progress rather than

targedau, a thargedau sydd yn mynd i arwain at gynnydd yn hytrach na chynnal yn unig. Felly, mae angen tynhau'r broses ac wedyn mae yna gwestiwn i fi ynglŷn â rôl y Gweinidog yn ymyrryd pan fo methiant neu phan fo yna gynllun gwan o'r cychwyn. So, mae angen gwneud rhywbeth sylweddol ynglŷn â'r gyfundrefn yna, a nawr yw'r adeg i wneud.

maintaining the status quo. Therefore, we need to tighten up the whole process, and then there are questions for me on the role of the Minister in intervening when there is failure or when a weak plan is submitted initially. So, we need to do some significant work on that regime, and now is the time to do that.

[278] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn am y sylwadau cychwynnol hynny. Rŷm ni am ofyn cwestiynau nawr ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth gynnar yn benodol ac wedyn symud ymlaen at themâu eraill. Jeremy.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for those initial comments. We're now going to move on to early years provision specifically and then move on to other things. Jeremy.

[279] **Jeremy Miles**: Diolch. Rydych chi wedi sôn yn eich sylwadau fod sialensiau penodol yn perthyn i'r sector nas cynhelir—y sector blynyddoedd cynnar yn benodol—o safbwynt cadw a chynnal pobl yn y gweithlu sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Beth yw'ch darlun chi yn gyffredinol o'r rhwystredigaethau yn y sector honno a pha mor bwysig yw cael hynny'n iawn yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth yn gyffredinol?

Jeremy Miles: Thank you. You mentioned in your comments that there were specific challenges facing the non-maintained sector—the early years sector specifically—in terms of retaining people in the workforce who speak Welsh. What do you feel are the frustrations in that sector and how important is it to get that right in the context of the strategy in general?

[280] **Mr Gapper**: Fel mae'r strategaeth ei hun yn cydnabod, rwy'n meddwl bod y cyfnod blynyddoedd cynnar yn allweddol. Mae'n allweddol am ddau brif reswm, rwy'n meddwl. Mae ymchwil yn dangos yn glir os ydym ni eisiau i siaradwyr Cymraeg fod yn rhugl, ac os ydym ni eisiau siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd nid dim ond yn gallu siarad

Mr Gapper: As the strategy itself recognises, I think the early years sector is crucial. It's crucial for two main reasons, I think. Research clearly shows that if we want Welsh speakers to be fluent, and if we want Welsh speakers who can not only speak a little Welsh, but speak it fluently and use it regularly, we have to introduce the Welsh language in

rhywfaint ond yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn rhugl a'i defnyddio'n gyson, mae'n rhaid cychwyn cyflwyno'r Gymraeg iddyn nhw yn y cyfnod cynnar—y cyfnod cynharaf posibl.

the early years—at as early a stage as possible.

[281] Mae'r cyfraddau rhuglder ymysg siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd wedi dechrau dysgu yn yr ysgol feithrin, neu ynghynt hyd yn oed, gymaint yn uwch na'r cyfraddau rhuglder ymysg y rheini sydd wedi dysgu yn yr ysgol gynradd, hyd yn oed, ac yn enwedig yn yr ysgol uwchradd. Felly, o ran sgiliau a datblygu pobl sydd â'r sgiliau priodol er mwyn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg bob dydd, mae'n rhaid cychwyn yn y cyfnod cychwynnol hwnnw.

The rates of fluency among Welsh speakers who start to learn in the nursery or even earlier is so much greater than the fluency rates for those who have learnt even in primary school and particularly in the secondary sector. So, in terms of skills and developing people who have the relevant skills to use the Welsh language every day, then we have to start in those early years.

[282] Yr ail beth ydy ein bod ni'n gwybod mai addysg ydy'r allwedd i'r 1 miliwn. Mae cyfraddau trosglwyddo o ofal blynyddoedd cynnar—o ofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg—i addysg statudol cyfrwng Cymraeg yn uchel iawn. Rwy'n meddwl bod y Mudiad Meithrin yn ffeindio bod 85 y cant o blant sy'n derbyn gofal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn mynd ymlaen i addysg statudol cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae tua 60 y cant o'r rheini yn dod o gartrefi di-Gymraeg, felly mae'r gyfradd drosglwyddo yn rhagorol. Felly, os ydych chi eisiau cael plant mewn i'r sector addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, eu cael nhw mewn o'r cychwyn cyntaf yw'r allwedd. Felly, mae'n bwysig o ran sgiliau ac o ran dwyn plant i mewn i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn

The second thing is that we know that education is the key to the 1 million Welsh speakers. Transference rates from early years—from Welsh-medium childcare—to Welsh-medium statutory education are very high. I think that Mudiad Meithrin found that 85 per cent of children receiving care through the medium of Welsh do go on to statutory Welsh-medium education, and some 60 per cent of those are from non-Welsh-speaking households. Therefore, the transference rate is excellent. If you want to get children into the Welsh-medium education sector, you need to capture them very early—that's the key. It's important in terms of skills and in terms of attracting children into Welsh-medium education more

gyffredinol.

generally.

[283] Mae yna rwystredigaethau. Os edrychwch chi, er enghraifft, ar adroddiadau blynyddol y Mudiad Meithrin, mae recriwtio a chadw staff yn her sylweddol o fewn y sector hwnnw. Mae argaeledd y ddarpariaeth—. Rŷm ni ar hyn o bryd yn cynnal darn o waith ymchwil yn edrych ar faint o ddarpariaeth gofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg sydd ar gael. Rŷm ni'n gwybod mai 50 o feithrinfeydd gydol y diwrnod y mae'r Mudiad Meithrin yn eu cynnal. Rŷm ni'n edrych ar faint o ddarpariaeth arall sydd ar gael. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cyflwyno 30 awr o ofal am ddim i bob plentyn sydd â rheini sydd yn gweithio. A ydy'r ddarpariaeth Gymraeg yn ddigonol fel y gallwn ni gynnig y 30 awr yna am ddim drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg i bawb sydd eu hangen? Mae hynny'n mynd i fod yn her fawr, rwy'n meddwl.

There are some frustrations. If you look, for example, at the annual reports of Mudiad Meithrin, recruitment and retaining staff are significant challenges within that sector. The availability of provision—. We are currently conducting a piece of work looking at the Welsh-medium childcare provision available. We know that there are 50 all-day nurseries that Mudiad Meithrin maintains. We are looking at what other provision is available as part of that research. Of course, the Government intends to provide 30 hours of free childcare to all children of working parents. Is the Welsh-medium provision going to be adequate? Will we be able to offer that 30 hours free of charge through the medium of Welsh to all who need it? That's going to be a major challenge, I think.

[284] **Jeremy Miles**: Ar y pwynt penodol hwnnw, a oes gennych chi ymwybyddiaeth o beth yw cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth yn nhermau'r cynlluniau peilot ar gyfer profi'r cynnig darpariaeth Gymraeg?

Jeremy Miles: On that very specific point, do you have an awareness of what the Government's plans are in terms of the pilot schemes for testing the Welsh-medium offer?

[285] **Mr Gapper**: Oes. Rŷm ni wedi cael sgyrsiau efo'r Llywodraeth. Maen nhw'n dechrau cynlluniau peilot ym mis Medi flwyddyn nesaf. Mi fydd cynlluniau peilot mewn lleoliadau lle mae'r Gymraeg yn gryf. Felly, cawn weld beth ddaw o hynny. Yn sicr, os

Mr Gapper: Yes, we've had some conversations with the Government. They will commence those pilots in September of next year. There will be pilots in locations where the Welsh language is already strong. Therefore, we will see what comes of

ydym ni'n mynd i allu darparu 30 awr am ddim yn Gymraeg ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru, mae yna lot o waith i'w wneud dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf.

that. Certainly, if we are to provide 30 hours of free childcare through the medium of Welsh in all areas of Wales, there's a huge amount of work to be done over the next year or two.

[286] **Jeremy Miles**: A gaf i ofyn cwestiwn i chi ynglŷn â—? Roedd y bobl o'r cyngor gofal a oedd yma cyn ichi ddod mewn yn sôn, pan rydych yn sôn am ofal pobl hŷn, fod rhywfaint o Gymraeg—hynny yw, nid rhuglder, ond jest y gallu i gyfathrebu i ryw lefel drwy'r Gymraeg—yn fantais, oherwydd yr afiechydon a natur y gofal yr ydych yn gallu cynnig. Ond, o ran caffael iaith, nid yw hynny, efallai, yn wir yn y blynyddoedd cyntaf—mae angen pobl sydd yn gallu darparu'r gofal yn rhugl drwy'r Gymraeg. A ydy hynny'n wir?

Jeremy Miles: Can I ask you a question about—? The people who were here from the care council, before you came in, mentioned that when you talk about the care of older people, some Welsh—not fluency, but just the ability to communicate to some level through the medium of Welsh—is of benefit, because of the illnesses and the nature of the care that you can offer. But, in terms of language acquisition, that perhaps isn't true in the early years—there is a need for people who can provide care fluently through the medium of Welsh. Is that true?

[287] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n bwynt teg i'w wneud. Os ydym ni o ddifrif ynglŷn â sicrhau gofal plant a gofal blynyddoedd cynnar sydd yn hollol effeithiol, rwy'n credu bod angen inni sicrhau gweithlu sydd yn gallu gweithio'n effeithiol yn y Gymraeg. Ni ddylai fod yn rhywbeth sy'n digwydd trwy hap a damwain. Mae cyflwyno iaith o'r newydd yn dasg ac yn sgil arbennig, ac rwy'n credu y dylem ni fod yn cynllunio ac yn edrych ar greu gweithlu hollol abl i weithio i gyflwyno iaith o'r newydd yn y blynyddoedd cynnar yna, ac nid gobeithio ei fod yn mynd i ddigwydd drwy hap a damwain.

Ms Huws: I think that's a valid point. If we are serious about ensuring childcare and early years provision that is entirely effective, I do think that we need a workforce that can work effectively through the medium of Welsh. It shouldn't be something that happens by accident. Introducing a new language is a specific skill, and I do think that we should be planning and looking to create a workforce that is entirely able to present language anew in those early years, and not just hoping that it happens by accident.

[288] Mae angen inni bwysleisio'r angen am weithlu proffesiynol yn y blynyddoedd cynnar yna, ac mae hynny'n dod â ni at y ddarpariaeth ôl-16. Rwy'n credu bod angen inni sicrhau bod yna ddarpariaeth lefel 3 gofal plant y blynyddoedd cynnar sydd yn galluogi pobl i ddysgu a chyflwyno iaith a bod hynny, wedyn, yn cael ei dywys trwyddo i gymwysterau athrawon a chymwysterau pobl sydd yn llywio'r mathau hynny o gynlluniau. Mae angen inni feddwl am y continwwm hyfforddiant yna o'r ysgol i mewn i lefel 3. Un o'r meysydd o wendid, nid o ran awydd ond o ran gallu ar hyn o bryd, yw addysg ôl-16 ac addysg bellach. Mae yna gymaint o gyfle iddyn nhw i gamu i mewn, ond mae angen inni edrych ar y capasiti yn y sector yna hefyd i greu addysgwyr ac athrawon y dyfodol.

We do need to emphasise the need for a professional workforce in the early years sector, and that brings us to post-16 provision. I do think we need to ensure that there is level 3 provision in early years childcare that enables people to teach and introduce a language, and I think that that should go on through to teaching qualifications and the qualifications of those people who drive those kinds of programmes. We need to think about that training continuum from school up to level 3. One of the areas of weakness, not in terms of desire, but in terms of ability at the moment, is post-16 education and further education. There is so much opportunity for them to step in here, but we need to look at the capacity in that sector in order to generate the educators and teachers of the future.

[289] **Jeremy Miles**: Un cwestiwn olaf: a ydych chi'n gwthio mwy o bwyslais ar y blynyddoedd cynnar nag yr ŷch chi'n gweld yn y strategaeth, neu a ŷch chi, ar y cyfan, yn hapus bod y pwyslais yn y man iawn?

Jeremy Miles: One last question: are you pushing more emphasis on the early years than you see in the strategy, or are you, on the whole, happy that the emphasis is in the right place?

[290] **Mr Gapper**: Mae yna gydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd y sector o fewn y strategaeth. Lle mae'n hollbwysig, rwy'n meddwl, ydy cael 1 miliwn o siaradwyr sydd yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg; dyna le y bydd cael gofal plant a chael pobl i mewn i'r system addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg

Mr Gapper: There is recognition of the importance of the sector within the strategy. I think what's important is that we need to get 1 million Welsh speakers who use the Welsh language; that is where having childcare and getting people into the Welsh-medium education sector

o'r cychwyn yn talu ydy cael siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd nid dim ond yn gallu rhywfaint, ond yn rhugl. Rydym yn gwybod bod yna berthynas agos iawn rhwng rhuglder a faint o ddefnydd mae rhywun yn ei wneud o'r Gymraeg. Felly, o ran defnydd, rwy'n meddwl bod cael plant i mewn i ofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg, a drwy'r system addysg wedi hynny, yn hollbwysig.

from the start will pay off in having Welsh speakers who can not only speak a little, but who are fluent. We know that there is a close relationship between proficiency levels and the use made of the Welsh language. So, in terms of language use, I think that getting them into early years childcare and through the education system is crucially important.

[291] **Ms Huws**: Rwy'n credu bod y dystiolaeth rŷm ni wedi'i chasglu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn arbennig yn yr adroddiad pum mlynedd, yn dangos pa mor bwysig yw'r cyfnod cynnar yna. Mae'r continwwm yn eithriadol o bwysig wedyn, ond mae'r cyfnod dim i bump yn eithriadol o bwysig ac mae rhoi sgiliau ieithyddol cryf ar y pwynt yna a'u cynnal nhw trwy'r broses addysgiadol wedyn—. Ond, os enillwn ni'r tir yn fanna, rŷm ni wedi ennill tir sylweddol.

Ms Huws: I think it's important that the evidence we've collected over the last few years, in particular in the five-year report, shows how important the early years period is. The continuum is extremely important then, but that period of nought to five is extremely important and providing strong linguistic skills at that point and maintaining them through the education system then—. But, if we gain ground there, we have gained a lot of ground.

[292] **Jeremy Miles**: So, byddech chi'n moyn gweld adnoddau'n cael eu symud i hynny yn gynnar, a dweud y gwir.

Jeremy Miles: So, you would like to see resources being shifted to that at an early stage.

[293] **Ms Huws**: Buaswn.

Ms Huws: Yes.

[294] **Mr Sion**: Un peth arall i nodi hefyd, gwnaethoch chi gyfeirio at y 30 awr—y cynllun sydd gan y Llywodraeth. Pan mae'n dod i weithredu'r strategaeth, mae'n hollbwysig, rwy'n meddwl, fod yna gysylltiadau efo datblygiadau eraill y

Mr Sion: One thing that I should note is that you referred to the 30 hours—the Government's proposal in terms of childcare in Wales. When it comes to implementing the strategy, it is crucial that links are made with other developments within Government

Llywodraeth yn ganolog. Mae hynny'n mynd y tu hwnt i eiriad y strategaeth yn unig; mae hynny'n ymwneud â gweithredu wedyn, felly, beth bynnag sydd yn y strategaeth, ei fod yn cael ei gysylltu wedyn efo gwaith y Llywodraeth yn ehangach. Achos, fel rydych chi wedi awgrymu, mae'r 30 awr yn enghraifft lle mae yna gyfle'n codi i gael effaith o ran y Gymraeg hefyd.

centrally. That goes beyond the wording of the strategy alone; that involves the action taken then, so, whatever is contained within the strategy should be linked to broader Government activity. Because, as you've suggested, those 30 hours are an example of where there is an opportunity to have an impact in terms of the Welsh language as well.

[295] **Jeremy Miles**: Ocê, diolch.

Jeremy Miles: Okay, thank you.

[296] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch. Rŷm ni'n symud ymlaen at recriwtio a chynnal yn y maes yma, ac mae gan Dawn Bowden cwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We move on to recruitment and retention in this area, and Dawn Bowden has questions on this.

[297] **Dawn Bowden**: Just following on, really, from the points you were making about early years, I think the general evidence that we're getting is that that is key to it, but, of course, this has to follow through every step of education, right the way through, and I think you all acknowledge that.

[298] In evidence, we've heard several of the stakeholders tell us about the difficulties of recruitment and retention of teaching staff, per se, across Wales. We've also heard that, within the cohort of teachers in Wales, less than 30 per cent are actually teaching through the medium of Welsh, even though more identify as speaking Welsh. And we've also heard evidence that there is a view that we probably need to get that teaching cohort up to about 70 per cent to effectively be delivering this strategy. So, I just wanted your thoughts and views on the current recruitment and retention problems in the teaching profession in Wales, and what you think may need to be done to tackle that, and what the training requirements around some of those challenges might be.

11:45

[299] **Ms Huws**: Rhaid cyfaddef nad ŷm ni wedi gwneud gwaith penodol iawn, iawn ar brosesau paratoi

Ms Huws: I must admit that we haven't done very specific work on teacher training processes, but I do

athrawon ac addysgu athrawon. Ond rydw i'n credu bod rhan o'r ateb yn dod nôl i'r pwynt a wnaeth Dyfan: os ŷm ni o ddifri ynglŷn â chreu athrawon sydd yn medru darparu blynyddoedd cynnar, addysg gynradd ac addysg uwchradd, mae'n rhaid inni gydio yn y cwestiwn o gynllunio'r gweithlu addysg. Rydw i'n credu bod hynny wedi bod yn ddiffygiol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae cyrraedd y 70 y cant yn heriol, ond mi ddylem ni fod yn gallu cynllunio i wneud hynny, os ydym ni'n gweld, gyda'r niferoedd o bobl ifanc yn mynd trwy'r system addysg, yr hyn sydd eisiau inni ei wneud trwy'r modd yr ŷm ni'n eu dysgu nhw, ond hefyd trwy'r cyngor gyrfaol maen nhw'n ei gael. Rydw i'n credu bod yna rôl gan Gyrfa Cymru i'w chwarae fan hyn. Ond mae hefyd rôl gan y prifysgolion a darparwyr hyfforddiant athrawon i greu continwwm o ran paratoi athrawon.

think that part of the answer comes back to a point that Dyfan made earlier: if we are serious about creating teachers who can provide in the early years, in the primary sector and in the secondary sector, then we must get to grips with this issue of education workforce planning. I think that's been deficient over the past years. Reaching 70 per cent is challenging, but we should be planning to do that if we see, with the numbers of young people going through the education system, what it is we need to do in terms of the way that we train them, but also through the careers advice that they have. I think Careers Wales has a role to play here. But there's also a role for the universities and teacher training providers to create a continuum in terms of preparing prospective teachers.

[300] Os taw 70 y cant yw'r nod a'r angen, wel, dylid cynllunio'r gweithlu i gyrraedd yna. O ran hynny, mae angen i bob darn o'r daith yna fod wedi ei gysylltu â'r darn blaenorol. Dyna sydd ddim wedi digwydd. Mae yna dueddiad wedi bod gydag addysgu athrawon, rydw i'n teimlo, i ddisgwyl bod hyn yn mynd i ddigwydd trwy hap a damwain yn hytrach na rhoi negeseuon clir i bobl ifanc—'Mae yna broffesiwn fan hyn lle gallwch chi ddarparu trwy'r Gymraeg a'r Saesneg, ond mae angen y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg i lefel uchel

If 70 per cent is the target and that's what's needed to meet the aim, then we need to plan the workforce to achieve that. Every section of that journey needs to be linked to the previous section, and that's what hasn't happened in the past. There has been a trend in terms of teacher training, in my view, that we expect this to happen by accident, rather than conveying clear messages to young people—'There is a profession here where you can make provision through the medium of both Welsh and English, but you need high-level

arnoch chi, a byddwn ni'n cydnabod hynny fel sgil gwaith.'

Welsh and English skills to do that, and we will recognise that as a workforce skill.'

[301] **Dawn Bowden**: As a follow-on from that, you talked earlier on about immigration patterns and assimilation, and I kind of get where you're going to with that. But if we talk about immigration from England, and teachers coming into Wales from England, how much of a barrier is this likely to be in terms of plugging some of the employment gaps in teaching around some of the recruitment gaps—or not? Or do you think we should be reaching out, saying to English teachers, 'Come in to Wales, and, actually, we can give you this additional skill as well?'

[302] **Ms Huws**: Fel y soniais i yn gynt, rydw i'n credu mai dyna yw'r her. Mae angen inni fod yn creu ein hathrawon ein hunain, ond hefyd, wrth gwrs, wrth ddenu athrawon o lefydd eraill ar draws y byd, mi ddylem ni fod yn gwneud yn glir mai system addysg ddwyieithog sydd yng Nghymru ac mi wnawn ni eich hwyluso chi i gaffael yr iaith. Dyna yw'r her, ac rydw i'n credu bod angen inni gydio yn yr her yna a chynllunio i hynny, yn hytrach—mae'r un fath o drafodaeth ag yr ŷm ni'n ei chael am recriwtio doctoriaid o lefydd eraill yn y byd. Rydw i'n credu bod angen inni ystyried bod yna alw ac angen i ni ddelio ag ef wedyn—yn hytrach na'i ddiffinio fe fel problem, ei ddiffinio fe fel cyfle a chreu cyrsiau a chreu darpariaeth sydd yn mynd i hwyluso pobl i weithredu trwy'r ddwy iaith.

Ms Huws: As I mentioned earlier, I think that is the challenge. We need to be generating our own teachers, but also, of course, in attracting teachers from across the world, we should be making it clear that we have a bilingual education system in Wales and that we will facilitate language acquisition. That is the challenge, and I think we need to grasp that nettle and to plan for that, and it's the same kind of discussion as the one we're having in terms of doctor recruitment from around the world. I do think we need to consider that there is a demand, but then to deal with it—rather than defining it as a problem, defining it as an opportunity and creating courses and provision that will facilitate people working through the medium of both languages.

[303] **Dawn Bowden**: Okay. I've only got one—. Sorry, I'm getting feedback. I've only got one further question, which is really about identifying the skills gaps and whether you think that there is enough work being done—no. You're obviously saying 'no.' What more do think we need to be doing around that then, or what needs to be done about that?

[304] **Ms Huws**: Rydw i'n credu, ar draws sectorau cyflogaeth o flaenoriaeth, yn y maes addysg, yn y maes iechyd ac yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol, fod angen inni newid ein patrymau o gynllunio'r gweithlu. Mae angen data. Soniasom ni'n gyntaf am fodelu a chasglu gwybodaeth ynglŷn â beth yw'r ymyraethau angenrheidiol. So, mae angen data cynhwysfawr, caled a chyfredol arnom ni, ac wedyn mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r data yna. Rydw i'n teimlo, ar adegau, ein bod ni'n ofnus ynglŷn â gosod patrymau allan o ran anghenion sectorau o ran cyflogaeth. Rwy'n credu yn sicr bod hynny'n wir yn iechyd—ein bod ni wedi bod ofn dweud, 'Fe fydd angen hyn a hyn o nyrsys arnom ni ac fe fydd angen hyn a hyn o athrawon blynyddoedd cynnar arnom ni sydd â sgiliau dwyieithog', a chynllunio i greu hynny.

Ms Huws: I think, across employment sectors of priority, in education, health and social care, that there is a need for us to change our patterns of workforce planning. There is a need for data. We mentioned, earlier, modelling and collecting information about what the necessary interventions are. So, there is a need for data—comprehensive data and hard data that is current, and there is a need for us to use those data. I do feel, at times, that we are scared of setting out patterns in terms of the needs of sectors in terms of employment. Certainly, that's true in health. I think we've been scared of saying, 'There will be a need for such-and-such a number of nurses and there will be a need for such-and-such a number of early years teachers who have bilingual skills', and planning to create that.

[305] So, data, ac wedyn, y tu ôl i hynny, cynllunio gweithlu pwrpasol a thargedau, a chyrraedd y targedau yna. Ac i wneud hynny yn llwyddiannus, nid yn unig data—mae angen strategaeth Llywodraeth, ac wedyn mae eisiau darpariaeth addysg ôl-16 ac addysg bellach ac addysg prifysgol sydd yn darparu hynny—a hefyd, buaswn i'n dweud, addysg gydol oes. Os rŷm ni'n sôn am bobl yn dod yn ôl i'r gweithle neu'n dod i'r gweithle o lefydd eraill—peidio â'i wneud e'n broblem, ond eu hwyluso nhw i weithredu. Fe fydd angen

So, data, and then behind those, purposeful workforce planning and targets, and achieving those targets. And to do that successfully, not only data—there is a need for a Government strategy, and then there is a need for post-16 provision, further education and university education that provides that—and also, I would say, lifelong learning. If we're talking about people coming back into the workplace, or coming to the workplace from other areas—we shouldn't make it a problem, but facilitate this. There will be a need

adnoddau a bydd angen newid diwylliant i fod yn meddwl yn fwy pwrpasol a chynllunio.

for resources and there will be a need for a change of culture to think more purposefully and to plan.

[306] **Dawn Bowden**: Okay, thank you.

[307] **Bethan Jenkins**: Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen nawr at uwch-sgilio. Mae gan Hannah gwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: We move on now to upskilling, and Hannah has some questions.

[308] **Hannah Blythyn**: Diolch. I think you just covered, in response to my colleague's question here, on acknowledging the gap, and the mechanisms to identify the skills gap, but, in terms of that, what we've heard from other stakeholders in their evidence was on the perceived barriers and challenges in terms of upskilling, but, from your view, what do you think most barriers are to upskilling, particularly in early years provision and across the statutory education sector? How would you suggest we can start to overcome them?

[309] **Ms Huws**: Rydw i'n credu bod uwch-sgilio yn her. Mi ddylwn gydnabod hefyd fod addysg gydol oes wedi bod yn un o'r meysydd sydd wedi cael ei dorri yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, felly mae angen inni sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth ddysgu gydol oes, er mwyn sicrhau gweithlu â sgiliau, yn cael ei chryfhau, a'i bod yn cael ei gweld fel rhywbeth angenrheidiol yn hytrach na rywbeth dymunol—bod pobl yn dewis i sgilio i fyny o fewn y gweithle. Yr heriau wedyn yw ein bod ni yn cynllunio yn bwrpasol gyda'r colegau addysg bellach, ac rwy'n credu bod hynny yn un o'r meysydd lle rydw i wirioneddol yn poeni bod yna gap sylweddol o ran y ddarpariaeth uwch-sgilio. Mae yna gamau wedi cael eu cymryd gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol i sicrhau, ar lefel gradd ac uwch, fod y

Ms Huws: I think that upskilling is a challenge. We should recognise also that lifelong learning has been one of the areas that has seen cuts over the past few years. Therefore, we need to ensure that the lifelong learning provision, in order to secure a workforce with skills, is strengthened, and is seen as something that is necessary, rather than a nice-to-have—that people choose to upskill within the workforce. The challenges, then, are that we should plan in a meaningful way with the FE colleges, and I think that's one of the areas where I'm deeply concerned that there is a significant gap in terms of upskilling provision. Steps have been taken by the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol to ensure, at degree and higher level, that the provision is strengthened, but there is a gap in the journey, and

ddarpariaeth yn cael ei chryfhau, ond mae yna dwll yn y daith, ac os nad yw'r sector addysg ôl-16 yn cael ei hwyluso i gryfhau o ran uwch-sgilio, wnawn ni ddim llwyddo. Felly, dyna yw'r her.

if the post-16 sector isn't facilitated in enhancing upskilling, then we won't succeed, and I think that's the challenge.

[310] Rydym yn ymwybodol o'r adolygiad sydd yn digwydd o'r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol nawr, a'r berthynas rhwng y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol a cholegau addysg bellach, ond rydw i yn teimlo mai dyna lle mae angen inni wneud tipyn o waith.

We are aware of the review of Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol being carried out, and the relationship between Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and the FE colleges, but I do feel that that is where we do need to do a fair amount of work.

[311] **Mr Sion**: Jest i ategu'r pwynt yna hefyd, rydym ni'n ymwybodol bod diffyg dilyniant o addysg statudol oed ysgol i addysg bellach ac uwch yn broblem—y dilyniant o ran dysgu Cymraeg. Mae'r data yn dangos bod tua 22 y cant o ddisgyblion ysgol yn cael eu hasesu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Pan ydym yn edrych ar addysg bellach, tua 8 y cant sy'n derbyn rhywfaint o'u haddysg bellach drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac wedyn tua 5 y cant o fyfyrwyr prifysgol sy'n derbyn rhywfaint o'u haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae hynny'n *issue* wedyn, rydw i'n meddwl, o ran eich cwestiwn chi ynglŷn ag uwch-sgilio mewn meysydd penodol.

Mr Sion: Just to endorse that point as well, we are aware that there is a lack of progression of statutory education, school-age to further and higher education, and that's a problem—the progression in terms of learning Welsh. Data show that about 22 per cent of school pupils are assessed through the medium of Welsh. When we look at further education, it's about 8 per cent who receive some element of their education through the medium of Welsh, and then about 5 per cent of university students receive some element of their education through the medium of Welsh. So, that's an issue, then, I think, in terms of your question on upskilling in specific areas.

[312] Jest un peth arall yn fyr hefyd, mae yna *issue* yn fan yma o ran cynyddu capasiti sgiliau yn y Gymraeg. Mae yna *issue* o ran

Just one other additional point: there is an issue here in terms of increasing skills capacity in the Welsh language. There is an issue in terms

cynllunio'r gweithlu. Er enghraifft, mae data'r Llywodraeth yn dangos bod 9.4 y cant o staff academaidd prifysgolion yn gallu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond mai dim ond rhyw 60 y cant sydd yn ei wneud. Felly, mae yna gapasiti yna hefyd sydd ddim yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar hyn o bryd.

of workforce planning. For example, Government data show that 9.4 per cent of academic staff at universities can teach through the medium of Welsh, but only 60 per cent of them do so. So, the capacity is there, but it's not being used at the moment.

[313] **Bethan Jenkins**: Mae Jeremy eisiau dod i mewn yn glou, os yw hynny'n iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy wants to come in briefly, if that's okay.

[314] **Jeremy Miles**: Gwnaethoch chi sôn am 5 y cant sy'n derbyn rhywfaint o addysg uwch. Pan rydych chi'n tynnu allan y nifer sy'n gwneud graddau yn y Gymraeg, beth yw'r canran? A wyt ti'n gwybod?

Jeremy Miles: So, 5 per cent receive some of their HE through the medium of Welsh? When you take out the percentage studying Welsh as a subject, what are the numbers there?

[315] **Mr Sion**: Nid ydw i'n siŵr, i fod yn onest, ond fe allwn i ddarganfod y ffigwr, os ydych chi'n dymuno

Mr Sion: I'm not sure, if truth be told, but I could find that figure for you.

[316] **Jeremy Miles**: Byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod hynny.

Jeremy Miles: It would be interesting to know.

[317] **Ms Huws**: A gaf i ddweud hefyd bod y ddarpariaeth prentisiaethau mor bwysig hefyd o ran rhai o'r meysydd yma? Rydw i'n croesawu'r ffaith bod yna dwf wedi bod o ran darpariaeth prentisiaethau, ond rydw i'n credu hefyd, eto, fod angen hwyluso darparwyr addysg a darparwyr y prentisiaethau yna i gael a chynnal sgiliau cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y prentis, a bod yna werth yn cael ei roi i hynny. Felly, mae yna ddarn o waith sydd angen ei wneud o ran—

Ms Huws: Can I just say as well that the apprenticeship provision is so important as well in terms of some of these areas? I welcome the fact that there's been growth in terms of apprenticeship provision, but I do think as well, again, there is a need to facilitate education providers and the providers of those apprenticeships to maintain skills through the medium of Welsh in the apprentice, and that value is placed on that. So, there is a piece of work

eto, nid disgwyl ei fod e'n mynd i ddigwydd drwy ryw hap a damwain, ond bod angen cynllunio sut mae'r prentisiaethau yma'n llenwi'r gap o ran gweithwyr dwyieithog.

that needs to be done—again, not expecting it to happen by accident, but there is a need for planning how these apprenticeships fill the gap in terms of bilingual workers.

[318] **Bethan Jenkins**: Oes angen ennyn y busnesau wedyn i gael agwedd mwy positif at yr iaith, achos efallai nad oes yna ddigon o gyrsiau ac achos nad yw'r galw yna gan fusnesau yng Nghymru, neu—?

Bethan Jenkins: Do we need to encourage businesses to have a more positive attitude towards the language then, too, because perhaps there aren't enough courses and because perhaps demand isn't there from businesses in Wales—or?

[319] **Ms Huws**: Rydw i'n credu bod yna waith i'w wneud ar sawl ffrynt yn y fan hyn o ran y cyflogwyr, ond mae'r cyflogwyr wedyn yn torri calonnau pan nad yw'r ddarpariaeth yna chwaith. Rydw i'n siarad gyda'r darparwyr gofal, yn arbennig, ac fe fuasent wrth eu boddau yn meithrin prentisiaethau a phrentisiaid i ddefnyddio'r ddwy iaith, ond nid ydynt yn gallu cael y cymorth gan goleg addysg bellach lleol neu ddarparwyr addysg.

Ms Huws: I think there's work to be done on a number of fronts here in terms of the employers, but the employers then are upset when the provision isn't there either. I talk to care providers, in particular, who would love to nurture apprentices using both languages, but they can't have assistance from the local further education college or education providers.

[320] **Bethan Jenkins**: Hannah.

[321] **Hannah Blythyn**: I was going to ask about apprenticeships.

[322] **Bethan Jenkins**: Okay. If Neil doesn't mind, I'm going to cut out your theme. [*Inaudible.*] [*Laughter.*] I think we've done it, really. We'll go on to categorisation and continuum—Lee.

[323] **Lee Waters**: I'd just like to ask: you mentioned earlier that the Welsh in education strategic plans, the WESPS, hadn't been effective to date. So, I wondered why you think that was.

[324] **Ms Huws**: Cwestiwn da: system

Ms Huws: It's a good question: it's a

newydd, i ddechrau—system newydd a gafodd ei chyflwyno drwy ddeddfwriaeth 2013; y ddeddfwriaeth yna, o bosib, ddim yn ddigon cadarn o ran disgwyliadau ar awdurdodau lleol; dim targedau yn cael eu gosod gan y Llywodraeth nac o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth—felly diffyg, o bosib, o ran cyfarwyddyd a chynhaliaeth i'r awdurdodau lleol wrth eu bod nhw'n rhoi'r rhai cyntaf yna at ei gilydd; wedyn tair blynedd lle nad oedd y cynlluniau yna i'w gweld yn llwyddo trwyddi draw, ond dim ymyrraeth wedyn i geisio gwella'r sefyllfa o ran Llywodraeth—dim cyfarwyddyd, o bosib, gan y Llywodraeth i awdurdodau lleol o ran, 'Mae angen i chi wella yn fan hyn, ac fe wnawn ni hwyluso hynny.' Felly, profiad, fuaswn i'n dweud, y tair blynedd gyntaf oedd: ni welsom ni dwf, ac mae'r ffigurau gyda ni—rydym ni wedi mesur hynny—ac nid oes twf wedi bod.

new system, first of all—it's a system that was introduced through the 2013 legislation; that legislation, perhaps, wasn't robust enough in terms of the expectations placed on the local authority; there weren't specific targets put in place by Government or within that legislation and therefore there was a problem, perhaps, in terms of directions and support for local authorities as they put those first WESPS together; then three years when those plans didn't seem to be successful, generally speaking, but there was no intervention from Government to try and improve the situation—there wasn't direction from Government to local authorities in terms of, 'Well, you need to make some improvements here and we will facilitate that improvement.' So, I would say that the experience of the first three years was that we didn't see any progress, and we have the figures for that—there's been no growth.

[325] Yr hyn sydd ddim yn dderbyniol, rydw i'n credu, ydy caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd yr eildro. Mae angen canllawiau cryfach oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ac mae angen hwyluso awdurdodau lleol i gasglu data a rhoi targedau rhesymol yn eu lle. Felly, cyfarwyddyd a chynhaliaeth sydd eu hangen ar awdurdodau lleol. Rydw i'n credu bod awdurdodau lleol eisiau llwyddo yn y maes yma. Rŷm ni'n gweld twf o ran galw ar draws Cymru am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

What isn't acceptable, I think, is to allow that to happen a second time. We need more robust guidance from Government and we need to facilitate local authorities in gathering data and in putting reasonable targets in place. So I think it's direction and support that local authorities need. I do think that local authorities do want to succeed in this area. We've seen growth in demand across Wales for Welsh-medium education. We see local authorities identifying this, but

Rŷm ni'n gweld awdurdodau lleol yn adnabod hyn, ond nid yw'r cam yna yn digwydd, felly mae angen cymorth a chyfarwyddyd oddi wrth y Llywodraeth, fuaswn i'n dweud, i sicrhau llwyddiant.

that next step isn't being taken, so we need support and direction from Government, I would say, to ensure success in this area.

[326] **Lee Waters**: Because, you know, you can have as much guidance and data and encouragement as you like, but there are practical difficulties, are there not? If you look at the furthest end of the spectrum, if you like—those English-medium schools that have very few staff with any skills in Welsh at all—moving them along the continuum in the short term is extremely difficult, isn't it? So, in practical terms, we are where we are. What can be done in the next five years so those people don't feel penalised?

[327] We took evidence from one of the teaching unions, from NASUWT and Rex Phillips used this florid phrase that we should be looking to be on an 'adventure not a crusade'. You've used the phrase 'a revolution', which is what you want to see. So, there are markedly different concepts behind these words, but I think they do show a significant difference in approach. On the one hand, from what he was telling us, his members—some of them were outright hostile, and a lot were very concerned. But in practical terms, if you're a headteacher or a chair of governors in a school with very few resources to draw upon, you can have as much data and guidance as you like, but there's not a great deal you can do in the short term.

12:00

[328] **Ms Huws**: Mae'n dibynnu ar natur y gynhaliaeth a'r canllawiau. Rydw i'n credu mai un o'r negeseuon rydw i wedi'u dysgu o'r sector iechyd a gofal, lle pum mlynedd yn ôl roeddwn i'n clywed union yn gywir yr yr un math o drafodaeth, fod pobl yn teimlo eu bod nhw'n mynd i golli allan a bod pobl yn poeni am hyn. A'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd o ran y sector iechyd a gofal—ac rwy'n credu ein bod ni wedi clywed hynny gan y cyngor gofal eu hunain yn y sesiwn

Ms Huws: It depends on the nature of the support and the guidance. I think one of the messages that I've taken from the health and care sector, where five years ago I was hearing exactly the the same sort of debate, where people feel that they're going to lose and that people are concerned or anxious about this. And what's happened in terms of the health and care sector—and I think we heard that from the care council themselves in the previous session—

cyn hynny—yw codi ymwybyddiaeth, creu dealltwriaeth ac wedyn bod y ddealltwriaeth yna yn cael ei chyfieithu mewn i gamau bychan i greu hyder ymysg pobl sydd ddim â sgiliau ieithyddol, a gwneud hynny trwy ddatblygu proffesiynol, a chreu taith yn hytrach na her. Ac rydw i wedi gweld hynny yn digwydd mewn sectorau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol lle mae'r ieithwedd o ganlyniad wedi newid, pobl yn dechrau meithrin tamaid bach o hyder yn yr ychydig o Gymraeg sydd gyda nhw, ac yn dechrau ar y daith yna. Efallai mai ychydig bach o Gymraeg fydd diwedd y daith iddyn nhw, ond bod yr elfen elyniaethus yna wedi mynd allan o'r drafodaeth, ac rydw i'n credu bod angen gwneud hynny o fewn y sector addysg os ydy hynny yn wir yn fanna.

they raised awareness, created an understanding and then that understanding is translated into small steps that create confidence among those who don't have those language skills, and to do that through CPD, creating a journey rather than a challenge. And I have seen that happen in the health and social care sectors where the language has changed as a consequence, people start to have some confidence in the little Welsh that they have, and then they start that journey. Maybe having a little Welsh language will be the end of the journey for them, but that opposition has been taken out of the debate, and I think we need to do that within the education sector if this is truly going to work.

[329] **Lee Waters**: That does require additional resource, doesn't it, and, in an era of declining budgets and the huge debate around standards generally, that does require money being taken out of another part of the education budget.

[330] **Ms Huws**: Rydw i'n credu bod adnoddau yn un peth, ond rydw i'n credu bod newid diwylliant a newid natur y drafodaeth yn rhywbeth arall sydd ddim yn costio gymaint â hynny o arian. Rydw i'n credu mai'r hyn sydd yn bwysig yw sicrhau darpariaeth i hwyluso grymuso iaith, ond, yn fwy na hynny, cael y drafodaeth ynglŷn â pam mae hyn yn bwysig mewn gwlad ddwyieithog, a deall yn well ac nid ei weld fel problem, i fynd yn ôl at y geiriau yn ei disgrifio, ond fel cyfle. Nid wyf yn

Ms Huws: I think that resourcing is one issue, but I think that a culture change and changing the nature of the debate is something else that wouldn't cost that much money. I think that what's needed is to facilitate the empowerment of language, but also to have the debate as to why this is important in a bilingual nation, and to have a better understanding and not see it as a problem, to return to the words that you described, but seeing it as an opportunity. I don't think that the

credu bod y gwrthwynebiad yn mynd i fod mor chwyrn os ydy pobl yn deall beth yw natur y daith yna.

opposition is going to be as fierce if people understand the nature of the journey that we're on.

[331] Rydw i'n cael fy synnu gan y nifer o rieni di-Gymraeg sydd yn dod i fyny atom ni mewn sioe amaethyddol—y Royal Welsh, er enghraifft—ac yn dweud pa mor falch ydyn nhw bod eu pobl ifanc a'u plant nhw ar y daith i fod yn ddwyieithog. Maen nhw'n deall. Felly, rydw i'n credu mai adeiladu ar y deall yna sydd eisiau, a gwneud hynny nid mewn ffordd elyniaethus, ond ffordd lle mae pawb yn gallu mynd ar y daith yma gyda'i gilydd.

I am shocked by the number of non-Welsh speaking parents who come up to us in an agricultural show, such as the Royal Welsh, and tell us just how pleased they are that their children and young people are on that journey to become bilingual. They understand. So, I think building on that on that understanding is what we need to do, not in a way that creates enmity, but in a way where everyone can take this journey together.

[332] **Lee Waters**: Okay. Diolch.

[333] **Bethan Jenkins**: Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi heddiw. Rydym ni wedi cadw'n weddol at amser. Rwy'n siŵr y byddwn ni yn siarad gyda chi eto yng nghyd-destun adroddiadau eraill, ac yng nghyd-destun canfyddiadau'r ymchwiliad yma. Diolch yn fawr eto i chi am ddod mewn heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for today. We have kept to time in general. I'm sure we will be speaking to you again in the context of other reports, and in the context of this inquiry. Thank you again for coming in today.

12:02

Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note

[334] **Bethan Jenkins**: Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen nawr at eitem 6, papurau i'w nodi. Mae gennym ni bapur gan Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros yr Economi a Seilwaith ar graffu ar y gyllideb, papur gan Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar graffu

Bethan Jenkins: We move on now to item 6, papers to note. We have a paper from the Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure on budget scrutiny, a paper from the Minister for Welsh Language and Lifelong Learning on budget scrutiny,

ar y gyllideb, wedyn papur gan y Cadeirydd at y Llywydd ar gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol a chyfrifon S4C, ac wedyn ymateb y Llywydd ynglŷn â chyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol a chyfrifon S4C. A ydy pawb yn hapus i nodi y llythyrau hynny? Hapus ac yn llawen—rydw i'n clywed eich lleisiau'n fri.

and then a paper from the Chair to the Presiding Officer on the laying of S4C's annual report and accounts, and then the reply from the Presiding Officer on the laying of S4C's annual report and accounts. Is everybody content to note those letters? Happy—I can hear your voices.

12:03

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(vi).

that the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.
Motion moved.

[335] **Bethan Jenkins**: Symud ymlaen at eitem 7, cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i wahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod, os yw hynny'n iawn gan bawb. Iawn? Diolch yn fawr.

Bethan Jenkins: So, we move on to item 7, to move the motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting, if that's all right with everybody? Yes? Thank you very much.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:03.
The public part of the meeting ended at 12:03.